

E/1990/5/Add.39 part 1 28 November 1997

Substantive session of 1998

IMPLEMENTATION OF THE INTERNATIONAL COVENANT ON ECONOMIC, SOCIAL AND CULTURAL RIGHTS

<u>Initial reports submitted by States parties under</u> articles 16 and 17 of the Covenant

Addendum

ISRAEL

[28 November 1997]

CONTENTS

				<u>Paragraphs</u>	<u>Page</u>
Introduct	ion			1 - 2	3
I.	BACKGROU	JND INFORMATION		3 - 41	3
	A.	Land and people		3 - 11	3
	в.	General political structure		12 - 28	4
	C.	The judiciary		29 - 33	6
	D.	The State Comptroller		34 - 37	7
	E.	Basic Laws		38 - 41	8
II.	INFORMAT	TION CONCERNING GENERAL PROVISIONS		42 - 62	8
	Article	1 - Self-determination		42	8
	Article	2 - State responsibility, non-discrimination, inte	ernational cooperation		
	Article	$\ensuremath{\mathtt{3}}$ - Prohibition of discrimination between men and	women	43 - 60	9
				61 - 62	14
III.	INFORMAT	TION CONCERNING SPECIFIC RIGHTS		63 - 791	14
	Article	6 - The right to work		63 - 147	14
	Article	7 - Just and favourable conditions of work			
	Article	8 - Collective labour rights		148 - 203	39
	Article	9 - The right to social security		204 - 250	52
	Article	10- Familial rights		251 - 334	63
	Article	11- The right to an adequate standard of living		335 - 400	79
	Article	12- The right to the highest attainable standard \boldsymbol{c}	of health	401 - 528	92
	Article	13- The right to education			
	Article	15- The right to take part in cultural	life and enjoy scientific progress	529 - 598	139
				599 - 687	159
				688 - 791	202

Introduction

- 1. Israel ratified the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights in August 1991. The Covenant came into force with respect to Israel on 3 January 1992. The following is the combined initial and second reports submitted by Israel in pursuance of articles 16-17 of the Convention and of the guidelines issued by the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights. The aim of this report is to provide a description of the legal and social situation relevant to the implementation of economic, social and cultural rights in Israel.
- 2. The information contained in this report relies primarily on materials, data and legal research supplied by the relevant government ministries and institutes. Non-governmental organizations (NGOs) also provided valuable information. Independent and academic research has been surveyed and a reading list is provided at the end of the report. Annexed to the report are legal texts and specialized publications.*

I. BACKGROUND INFORMATION

A. Land and people

Geography

- 3. Israel's area within its boundaries and ceasefire lines is 10,840 square miles (27,800 sq. km). Long and narrow in shape, it is some 280 miles (450 km) in length and about 85 miles (135 km) across at the widest point.
- 4. The country may be divided into four geographical regions: three parallel strips running north to south and a large, mostly arid zone in the southern half.

Demographics

- 5. As of October 1997, the total population of Israel numbered 5,863,000 with over 4.7 million Jews (80.2 per cent of the total population), 872,000 Muslims (14.9 per cent), about 190,000 Christians (3.2 per cent) and around 100,000 Druze and members of other faiths (1.7 per cent).
- 6. The population of Israel increased in 1996 by 140,000, of whom 88,000 were Jews, representing a lower rate of increase than in 1995. In 1990-91, at the height of immigration from the former USSR and the Commonwealth of Independent States, the average annual growth rate was 250,000. Since the beginning of 1990 the population of Israel has increased by 26.3 per cent!
- * The reading list and the annexed materials are available for consultation at the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights.
- 7. The birth rate in 1995 was 21.1 per 1,000, while the infant mortality rate was 6.8 per 1,000. As of 1993, life expectancy for male Israelis was 75.3 years and for female Israelis 79.5 years. The total fertility rate was 2.9 per 1,000. Twenty-nine point seven per cent of the population was under 14 while 9.5 per cent of the population was 65 or older.
- 8. Israel has a literacy rate of over 95 per cent.

The economy

- 9. Israel's Gross Domestic Product (GDP) in 1996 was 272.8 billion new Israeli shekels (NIS) (approximately US\$ 85 billion) in 1995 constant prices. GDP per capita for this period was approximately NIS 48,000 (approximately \$15,000). The external debt was \$44.28 billion.
- 10. The dollar exchange rate at the close of 1990 was NIS 2.048 per \$1, and at the close of 1995, NIS 3.135 per \$1. The annual average of the dollar exchange rate in 1990 was NIS 2.0162, and in 1995, stood at NIS 3.0113. In 1997 the dollar exchange rate was about NIS 3.5 per \$1.

Language

11. Hebrew and Arabic are the official State languages. They are primary languages of instruction in compulsory education and either may be used by a member of the Knesset (Israel's parliament) to address the House. Israel television and radio broadcast in Hebrew, Arabic and, to a lesser extent, English, Russian and Amharic.

B. General political structure

Recent history

- 12. The State of Israel was founded on 15 May 1948. Israel represents the culmination of almost 2,000 years of longing on the part of the Jewish people for the restablishment of an independent State. A guiding principle for all governments of Israel since its inception has been the "ingathering of the exiles", the historic return of the Jewish people to its ancestral land. This concept was enshrined in the Declaration of Independence and has continued to be a major component of Israel's national life to the present day. In the words of Israel's Declaration of Independence, the State "extend(s its) hand to all neighbouring States in an offer of peace and good neighbourliness".
- 13. In 1977 the late President of Egypt, Anwar Sadat, became the first Arab head of State to visit Israel. In 1979 a treaty of peace was signed between Israel and Egypt. The Madrid Peace Conference was convened in October 1991. It was the first time that Israel, the Syrian Arab Republic, Lebanon, Jordan and the Palestinians had met in an open and public setting for the specific purpose of negotiating peace. In September 1993, Israel and the Palestine Liberation Organization (PLO) signed the Declaration of Principles on Interim Self-Government Arrangements in Washington D.C. and in November 1994, Israel and Jordan concluded a peace treaty, formally ending 46 years of conflict. The September 1995 Israel and the PLO signed the Interim Agreement on the West Bank and the Gaza Strip, and by 1999 the Final Status Agreement regarding these territories is due to be signed.

Structure of government

- 14. Israel is a parliamentary democracy, consisting of legislative, executive and judicial branches. Its institutions are the Presidency, the Knesset (parliament), the Government (Cabinet), the judiciary and the Office of the State Comptroller.
- 15. The system is based on the principle of separation of powers, with checks and balances, in which the executive branch (the government) is subject to the confidence of the legislative branch (the Knesset) and the independence of the judiciary is guaranteed by law.

The Presidency

- 16. The President is the head of State and his office symbolizes the unity of the State, above and beyond party politics.
- 17. Presidential duties, which are primarily ceremonial and formal, are defined by law. Among the President's formal functions are the opening of the first session of a new Knesset, accepting the credentials of foreign envoys, signing treaties and laws adopted by the Knesset, appointing judges, appointing the Governor of the Bank of Israel and heads of Israel's diplomatic missions abroad, pardoning prisoners and commuting sentences on the advice of the Minister of Justice. The President's approval is required prior to the dissolution of the Knesset by the Prime Minister.
- 18. The President, who may serve two consecutive terms, is elected every five years by a simple majority by the Knesset from among candidates nominated on the basis of their personal stature and contribution to the State.

The Knesset

- 19. The Knesset is the House of Representatives of the State of Israel; its main function is to legislate.
- 20. Elections for the Knesset and for the Prime Minister are held simultaneously. They are secret, and the entire country constitutes a single electoral constituency.
- 21. Knesset seats are assigned in proportion to each party's percentage of the total national vote. A party's surplus votes which are insufficient for an additional seat are redistributed among the various parties according to their proportional size resulting from the elections, or as agreed between parties prior to the election.
- 22. The Knesset is elected for a term of four years, but may dissolve itself or be dissolved by the Prime Minister, with the President's approval, before the end of its term. Until a new Knesset is formally constituted following elections, full authority remains with the outgoing Government.
- 23. The Knesset operates in plenary sessions and through 13 standing committees: the House Committee; the Foreign Affairs and Security Committee; the Finance Committee; the Economics Committee; the Interior and Environment Committee; the Education and Culture Committee; the Labour and Social Affairs Committee; the Constitution, Law and Justice Committee; the Immigration and Absorption Committee; the Committee for State Audit Affairs; the Committee on the War against Drug Addiction; the Science Committee and the Committee for Advancing the Status of Women.
- 24. In plenary sessions, general debates are conducted on government policy and activity, as well as on legislation submitted by the government or by individual Knesset members. Debates may be conducted in Hebrew and Arabic; simultaneous translation is available.

The Government

- 25. The Government (Cabinet of Ministers) is the executive authority of the State, charged with administering internal and foreign affairs, including security matters. Its policy-making powers are very wide and it is authorized to take action on any issue which is not delegated by law to another authority. The Government usually serves for four years, but its tenure may be shortened by the resignation of the Prime Minister or by a vote of no confidence.
- 26. The Prime Minister is elected directly by popular vote, simultaneously with the Knesset elections. Until the 1996 elections, the task of forming a government and heading it was assigned by the President to the Knesset member considered to have the best chance of forming a viable coalition government.
- 27. The ministers are responsible to the Prime Minister for the fulfilment of their duties and accountable for their actions to the Knesset. Most ministers are assigned a portfolio and head a ministry; others serve without a portfolio but may be called upon to take responsibility for special projects. The Prime Minister may also serve as a minister with a portfolio.
- 28. The number of ministers, including the Prime Minister, may not exceed 18, nor be less than 8. At least half of the ministers must be Knesset members, but all must be eligible for candidacy as Knesset members. The Prime Minister, or another minister with prime ministerial approval, may appoint deputy ministers, up to a total of six; all must be Knesset members.

C. The judiciary

- 29. The absolute independence of the judiciary is guaranteed by law. Judges are appointed by the President, on the recommendation of a special nominations committee comprised of Supreme Court judges, members of the bar, ministers and Knesset members. Judges' appointments are with tenure, until mandatory retirement at age 70.
- 30. Magistrates' and District Courts exercise jurisdiction in civil and criminal cases, while juvenile, traffic, military, labour and municipal appeal courts each deal with matters coming under their jurisdiction. There is no trial by jury in Israel.
- 31. In matters of personal status such as marriage, divorce and, to some extent, maintenance, guardianship and the adoption of minors, jurisdiction is vested in the judicial institutions of the respective religious communities: the rabbinical court, the Muslim religious courts (Sharia courts), the religious courts of the Druze and the juridical institutions of the nine recognized Christian communities in Israel.
- 32. The Supreme Court, seated in Jerusalem, has nationwide jurisdiction. It is the highest court of appeal on rulings of lower tribunals. In its capacity as High Court of

Justice, the Supreme Court hears petitions in constitutional and administrative law issues against any government body or agent, and is a court of first and last instance.

33. Although legislation is wholly within the competence of the Knesset, the Supreme Court can and does call attention to the desirability of legislative changes. It also has the authority to determine whether a law properly conforms with the Basic Laws of the State and to declare a law void.

D. The State Comptroller

- 34. The State Comptroller carries out external audits and reports on the legality, regularity, economy, efficiency, effectiveness and integrity of the public administration in order to assure public accountability. Israel recognized the importance of State audit in a democratic society and in 1949 enacted a law which established the State Comptroller's Office. Since 1971, the State Comptroller has also fulfilled the function of Public Complaints Commissioner (ombudsman) and serves as an address to which any person may submit complaints against State and public bodies which are subject to the audit of the Comptroller.
- 35. The State Comptroller is elected by the Knesset in a secret ballot for a five-year term. The Comptroller is accountable only to the Knesset, is not dependent upon the Government, and enjoys unrestricted access to the accounts, files and staff of all bodies subject to audit. The Comptroller's activities are carried out in cooperation with the Knesset Committee for State Audit Affairs.
- 36. The scope of State audit in Israel is among the most extensive in the world. It includes the activities of all government ministries, State institutions, branches of the defence establishment, local authorities, government corporations, State enterprises, and other bodies or institutions declared subject to audit.
- 37. In addition, the State Comptroller has been empowered by law to inspect the financial affairs of the political parties represented in the Knesset, including election campaign accounts and current accounts. When irregularities are found, monetary sanctions are imposed.

E. Basic Laws

- 38. Israel has no formal constitution as yet. However, most chapters of the prospective constitution have already been written, and enacted as Basic Laws.
- 39. The Basic Laws are adopted by the Knesset in the same manner as other legislation. Their constitutional import is derived from their nature and, in some cases, from the inclusion of "entrenched clauses" whereby a special majority is required to amend them.
- 40. The following are the Basic Laws of the State of Israel:

The Knesset (1958)

State Lands (1960)

The President (1964)

The State Economy (1975)

The Israel Defence Forces (1976)

Jerusalem (1980)

The Judicature (1984)

The State Comptroller (1988)

Human Dignity and Liberty (1992)

Freedom of Occupation (1992)

The Government (1992)

41. A draft Basic Law: Social Rights Bill has been is pending in the Knesset since 1993, when for the first time in Israel's history the Government agreed to include social rights in fundamental rights legislation. Even though economic, social and cultural rights are recognized in Israel, whether directly by law, regulations or case-law, or indirectly by administrative programmes, they still lack constitutional status. This issue is further dealt with in the part of this Report dealing with article 2 of the

II. INFORMATION CONCERNING GENERAL PROVISIONS OF THE COVENANT

Article 1 - Self-determination

42. Israel's recognition of the universal right to self-determination is embodied in its Declaration of Independence, which contains a clear commitment to the principles of the Charter of the United Nations. The right to self-determination is central to the establishment of the State of Israel, especially after the Holocaust. In the Supreme Court's words:

"Certainly, all the citizens of Israel - Jews and non-Jews - are 'shareholders' in the State, and the proposition that the State is the 'State of all its citizens' does not detract from it being a Jewish State, and if one wishes: the Jewish State. We must remember _ how can we forget - that the Jewish people did not have any other state but the State of Israel, th

Article 2 - State responsibility, non_discrimination, international cooperation

State responsibility

- 43. Economic, social and cultural rights are widely recognized in Israel, whether directly by law, regulations or case-law, or indirectly by administrative programmes. Since its creation, the State's commitment to the full realization of these rights has never been politically challenged. Moreover, social services of all sorts have dramatically expanded over the years, notwithstanding Israel's security challenges on the one hand and huge waves of immigration on the other, both of which have had an obvious drastic impact on the State's available resources. This commitment is clearly revealed in each of the substantial parts of this report (arts. 6-15).
- 44. It is worth stressing here the existence of a definite and steady trend of welfare legalization in Israel. The best example is the Assurance of Income Law 1980, which created a legal right to basic income as a safety net to ensure subsistence. This right, implemented by the National Insurance Institute, replaced the previous administrative programme operated by social workers. Under the previous programme, social workers had the authority to decide whether, in their professional judgement, an individual in need was entitled to a basic allowance, in addition to determining the level of such an allowance. Such examples are found in various parts of this report. It is fair to say in general that the majority of the rights covered by the Covenant are today legalized, even though the process has still to be completed.
- 45. Furthermore, there are definite indications that welfare and labour rights might undergo an even greater change with respect to their status from regular legal rights to constitutional rights. Such indications can be found both in the legislative and the judicial fields.

Basic Law: Social Rights Bill (1993)

- 46. A draft Basic Law: Social Rights Bill has been pending in the Knesset since 1993. Its main provisions are:
 - "1. The fundamental human rights in Israel are based on the recognition of the importance of a human being, of the sanctity of his life, and of his free existence, and they shall be respected in accordance with the principles of the Declaration of Independence of the State of Israel.
 - "2. This Basic Law aims to protect the social rights of man, so as to embody in this Basic Law the values of the State of Israel as a Jewish and democratic State.
 - "3. Every resident is entitled to his basic needs for the protection of a dignified human existence, inter alia in the field of labour, wage and work conditions, in the field of learning and education and in health and social welfare; this right shall be implemented or regulated by governmental authorities in accordance with law, and subject to the financial ability of the State, as determined by the government.
 - "4. Workers are entitled to organize in workers' organizations of their choice, and employers are entitled to organize in employers' organizations of their choice; such organizations may conclude collective agreements, all in accordance with the principles of labour law.
 - "5. Workers are entitled to strike, in accordance with the principles of labour law, in order to protect their rights and advance their economic and social interests.
 - "6. The rights protected in this basic law shall not be impaired, save by way of a law, or through specific authorization in law comporting with the values of the State of Israel as a Jewish and democratic State, for a proper purpose, and not exceeding what is strictly required.
 - "7. Every authority in any branch of government, and all that act in its name, must respect the rights in this Basic Law.
 - "8. None of the rights in this basic law shall be invoked in a manner which compromises the State's existence, its democratic regime, or serve to oppress human rights."

47. The future of this draft is not clear. But the fact that for the first time in Israel's history the government agreed in 1993 to include social rights in fundamental rights legislation, is symbolically important. It demonstrates the depth of Israel's commitment to the rights covered by the present Covenant.

The judiciary

- 48. Constitutional recognition of fundamental rights can come about through case-law, as has happened in Israel in the area of civil rights. This at least means such rights are taken seriously for the purpose of interpretation of statutes or filling legislative lacunae. As far as economic and social rights are concerned, there is yet limited judicial activity, apart from the right to form trade unions and the right to strike, which are regarded as fundamental rights.
- 49. The Supreme Court made the following interesting remarks as to the State's duty to provide for the weak and poor:

"A democratic government in its very essence, and according to its values, will look after the citizen's present and future welfare. It will strive to provide employment, a minimum wage, and social rights, so that he who has laboured all those years and reached retirement age is insured as much as possible and does not fall as a burden upon society. If a democratic administration can afford to invest the necessary resources, it should provide for citizen pension rights on its own initiative, and in good time ... The Basic Law, as mentioned above, is grounded in the values of the State of Israel as a democratic state. Caring for a citizen's welfare, making sure his needs are met and securing his future comports with the values of the State of Israel as a democratic state and corresponds with the values of Judaism which have always set a priority on caring for the citizen and providing for his basic needs. It has been said, for example, that charity is one of the three most important deeds which constitute the moral basis of this world (cite omitted) ... Open and hidelen acts of compassion and charity, being nothing but expressions of care for another, so that he does not suffer hunger or deprivation, are advocated and encouraged in clear and explicit messages rooted in ancient tradition. Ensuring that all the needs of the citizen are met as well as those of the resident and gentile, and preserving their standard of living and quality of life is also amongst the blessed values in Jewish tradition." No. 126/94, 878/94 Klal Insurance Company Ltd.

V. Minister of Treasury, P.D. vol. 48 (5) 441, 476.

- 50. Justice Aharon Barak, the President of the Supreme Court has remarked that the "right to decent living conditions" should be construed from the Basic Law: Human Dignity and Liberty (Barak 1994, pp. 416-7), but no case has been brought to the court yet.
- 51. In sum, since no serious attempt to induce the judiciary to recognize social rights as fundamental rights has yet been made, the exact constitutional status of economic, social and cultural rights under Israeli law still awaits decisive developments, legislative as well as judicial.

Non-discrimination

52. As far as State and public agencies are concerned, the non-discrimination principle is totally binding in Israel. The Israeli Declaration of Independence declares the State's commitment to "civil and social equality". Using this source, among others, the High Court of Justice has long enshrined the right to equality and has repeatedly expressed the following view:

"The rule according to which it is prohibited to discriminate between people on grounds of race, sex, nationality, ethnic sect, state of origin, religion, opinion or social status is a fundamental constitutional principle, inherent to our most basic legal norms." H.C. 721/94 El Al Israeli Airlines v. Danilovitch, P.D. vol. 48 (5) 749, 760

53. The courts have created an effective body of jurisprudence, resulting in granting relief to any person able to prove discrimination on the part of any person or body acting under the law. Welfare and other social services are no exception to this rule, as it is clear from the following and representative citation:

"... guaranteeing equal opportunities for the handicapped costs money. A society raised on the values of human dignity, liberty and equality is willing to pay the necessary price ... As we have mentioned, regulations require that special toilets for the disabled be installed in ... the school. The purpose of this provision is to enable the handicapped child to integrate in the school in a manner similar to that of any other child, and to thereby guarantee his dignity and enable him to enjoy equal educational opportunities." H.C. 7081/93 Botzer v. Municipal Authority

Maccabim-Reut, Takdin-Supreme vol. 96 (1) 818, 821-822

- 54. Statutory entitlements are generally based upon residence, not nationality, let alone race, religion, sex, etc. For example, education rights apply to any "child"; workers rights apply to any "employee"; social security is usually based upon "residence", except for three aspects of social security which apply to all "employees". A detailed account of the application of the non-discrimination principle is given in each chapter of this report. The issue of foreign workers is elaborated on in the chapter dealing with article 6 of the Covenant.
- 55. Non-discrimination statutory provisions are generally rare in Israeli law. Nevertheless, some of the rights under the Covenant are specifically subject to such provisions, which are discussed in the body of this report. These provisions are the following (the statutes referred to are attached in annex 1A to this report):

The right to work (art. 6) and the right to just and favourable conditions of work (art. 7): Equal Employment Opportunities Law 1988, Article 2 and 2A; Employment Service Law 1951, Article 42 and 42A; (Male and Female) Workers Equal Pay Law 1996, Article 1 and 2; Equal Retirement Age for Male and Female Employees Law 1987, Article 2; Public Service (Appointments) Law 1959, Article 15A; Work and Rest Hours Law 1951, Article 9C;

Health rights (art. 12): National Health Insurance Law 1994, Article 21(a) and 31;

Education rights (arts. 13-15): National Education Law 1959, Article 2.

International cooperation

- 56. The State of Israel is deeply involved in international cooperation. The Department of International Cooperation of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs (DIC) is devoted to promoting assistance programmes in the fields of training, research and consultations. Remaining committed to the universal goal of poverty reduction, the focus has been on the enrichment of human resources and institution-building, to enable individuals to participate in the development of their own society in such fields as market-oriented agriculture, women in the development process, environmental conservation, health care, micro-enterprise and community development. In 1996, there were 4,045 participants in 144 training courses conducted in Israel, and 5,327 participants shared in 120 local courses held in 47 countries worldwide.
- 57. As aid to Africa comprises approximately 25 per cent of the DIC training activities and long-term projects, a special team of experts has been appointed to study the present Africa-Israel relationship in order to formulate a more positive programme for future cooperation. Aside from designing bilateral development cooperation strategies with client countries, according to specific national priorities, high priority has been given to multilateral activities and increasing cooperation with international organizations. A multilateral agreement between Israel, the Palestinian Council, Luxembourg and Morocco was signed relating to an agricultural project in the Gaza Strip, and agreements were signed in 1996 between DIC, UNDP, UNESCO and FAO on development cooperation and institution-building programmes.
- 58. Peace in the Middle East will be secured only when it takes root in the everyday lives of people in the region. Therefore, cooperation with countries, authorities, NGOs and the private sector in the Middle East/North African region, as well as with the Gulf States, will continue to be a basic objective of Israel's development programme. Comprehensive regional cooperation will begin to be translated into practice when peace agreements are reached, but there is no need to wait until then to begin working together. DIC hopes to serve as a bridge between the people of the region.
- 59. Many DIC programmes have been achieved through resources generously provided by the United States Agency for International Development (USAID) and the Kingdom of the Netherlands' Ministry of Foreign Affairs. Additional resources are provided by the Danish International Development Agency (DANIDA); Norway's International Development Agency (SIDA); the Federal Republic of Germany's Ministry of Economic Cooperation; the Inter-American Development Bank; the Organization of American States and various United Nations bodies and agencies (the Department of Development Support and Management Services of the Secretariat, UNDP, WHO, FAO, UNESCO, WMO). (The DIC Activity Report, 1996, Israel Ministry of Foreign Affairs).
- 60. All the above accounts for international assistance granted by Israel. Of the international assistance that Israel receives, only a small portion is granted in order to meet social needs and even then, only for the absorption of immigrants. The United States of America grants Israel \$8 million each year; Germany provides Israel with loans the sum of which varies over the years according to immigration rates (DM40 million for the years 1997-1998, which is less than in the midst of the last immigration wave). It should be borne in mind that between the beginning of 1989 and August 1997 Israel has absorbed 742,000 immigrants, with a total population of 4,678,000 by the end of 1988 an increase of 16.6 per cent in the total population in less than a decade!

Article 3 _ Prohibition of discrimination between men and women

- 61. The guidelines issued by the Committee under the present Covenant do not require a general overview of the equal right of men and women to the enjoyment of all the economic, social and cultural rights set forth in the Covenant. This topic will be elaborated separately in each part of this report.
- 62. Further reading with special focus on this subject can also be found in Israel's combined initial and second report concerning the implementation of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women, submitted in May 1997 to the United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW) and published as United Nations document CEDAW/C/ISR 1-2 of 8 April 1997. Reference to the said report will be made easier by using the following chart:

Article of the Covenant	Article and chapter of the Convention
Arts. 2-3: Non-discrimination	Art. 1: Definition of discrimination
	Art. 2: Obligations to eliminate
	discrimination
Art. 6: Right to work	Art. 4: Acceleration of equality
Arts. 6-7: Work and conditions of	Art. 11: Employment
work	
Arts. 9 and 11: Social security and	Art. 13(2): Social benefits and welfare
subsistence	
Art. 10: Family	Art. 16(5),(7),(8),(11): Family
Art. 12: Health rights	Art. 12: Access to health care
Arts. 13-14: Education rights	Art. 10: Education

Related international conventions binding Israel

- 63. Israel has been a party to the International Labour Organization (ILO) Employment Policy Convention, 1964 (No. 122) since 1970; Israel's last report relates to 1995.
- 64. Israel has been a party to the Forced Labour Convention, 1930 (No. 29) since 1955; Israel's last report relates to 1990.
- 65. Israel has been a party to the Discrimination (Employment and Occupation) Convention, 1958 (No. 111) since 1959; Israel's last report relates to the years 1992-1993.
- 66. Israel has been a party to the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination since 1979; Israel's last report was filed in July 1997 and relates to the years 1991-1996.
- 67. Israel has been a party to the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women since 1991; Israel's last report was filed in May 1997.
- 68. International covenants ratified by Israel are normally not part of Israeli internal law unless given statutory recognition by the Knesset. Nevertheless, international labour conventions, especially IIO standards, have had a tremendous influence on the development of the Israeli Labour Law, both statutory and judicial. These standards are embodied in the content of the labour statutes. The Labour Courts also frequently use such conventions, even those which have not been ratified, for the interpretation of statutes and as a criterion for testing the validity of contract terms.

Employment and unemployment

Level and trends

- 69. Over the past 10 years, from 1986 to 1996, Israel's economy has expanded at a rapid rate. Gross domestic product increased by 65 per cent in constant prices between 1986 and 1996, with the majority of the growth (42 per cent) concentrated between 1989 and 1995. This is a significant achievement that has brought per capita GDP in Israel to a level not far below the average among western nations.
- 70. GDP grew in 1996 by 4.5 per cent to reach NIS 272.8 billion (in 1995 constant prices; approximately \$85 billion). GDP per capita grew in 1996 by 1.8 per cent, reaching about NIS 48,000 (in 1995 constant prices; approximately \$13,000). This growth was at a lower rate than in the previous two years and preliminary forecasts for 1997 indicate a further slowing in the pace of economic activity in the current year.
- 71. The expansion in economic activity has been accompanied by considerable growth in domestic employment, including the successful absorption of a large wave of immigration which began toward the end of 1989 (generating a rise of 16.6 per cent in the Israeli population by the end of 1997 less than a decade!).
- 72. In 1996 there were 2.1 million workers employed in Israel. The unemployment rate was then 6.7 per cent, the lowest since 1992, when unemployment reached 11.2 per cent of the labour force; this was at the height of the influx into the labour market of new immigrants, with some 85 per cent of these coming from the former Soviet Union.
- 73. Employment trends among particular categories of workers. The following table presents the principal labour force characteristics of various categories of Israeli workers: men, women, Jews, Arabs, younger and older workers, development area residents and new immigrants, showing changes in the number employed and the unemployment rate for these groups in 1986, 1991 and 1996. More extensive data is given table 1 annexed to this section.

Unemployment rate per

			•		
	1991-1996	1986-1991	1986	1991	1996
Total population	27.1	15.7	7.1	10.6	6.7
Jews	26.0	14.4	6.6	10.6	6.7
Arabs and others	35.4	26.4	10.5	10.5	6.2
Men	20.4	12.8	6.5	8.6	5.8
Women	37.3	20.4	7.9	13.4	7.8
Aged 15-17	36.7	-1.7	20.5	23.7	19.7
Aged 18-24	52.6	13.8	18.6	22.2	12.8
Aged 45-54	65.8	19.8	3.3	6.9	4.5
Aged 55-64	25.6	9.3	2.0	7.2	4.8
Residents in development areas	60.7	-	-	15.4	10.5
New immigrants	353.0	-	-	38.5	9.3

Per cent change in

- 74. Generally speaking, from 1991 to 1996, the employment of most categories of workers shown above increased more than the average rate and employment among new immigrants rose particularly rapidly. Interestingly, this growth was smaller amongst Jews and men, which constitute the two broader (but not exclusive) categories of workers in Israel. This pattern could already be discerned before 1991, between 1986 and 1991, but was less pronounced.
- 75. Regarding unemployment rates, the data indicate that over the past 10 years, the highest rates are to be found among the youngest workers, aged between 15 and 24. Unemployment has been high as well amongst workers living in the country's development areas. Unemployment rates of new immigrants were typically high shortly after their arrival in Israel and declined rapidly as they learned the language and adapted their skills to the local labour market. Over the longer term, the most vulnerable groups of Israeli workers are probably young workers (although the large majority of this age group attends school and does compulsory army service) and the residents of outlying development areas where job opportunities may be limited.
- 76. Initial figures for 1997 indicate that unemployment may be worsening this year. Rising unemployment will, of course, necessitate a re-evaluation of employment and unemployment policies and measures.

Employment policies

- 77. As can be seen from the data on unemployment in Israel, the unemployment rate has fallen steadily since 1992, when it stood at 11.2 per cent, to 6.7 per cent in 1996. With unemployment at this level, the Government considers the economy to be at near full employment.
- 78. In general, difficulties in employment management are associated with cyclical variations in economic growth. Therefore, the objectives of economic policy are the encouragement of long-term economic growth and expansion of job opportunities and the implementation of short-term measures to reduce unemployment.
- 79. Israel has encountered a particular problem as a result of the large influx of new immigrants, mostly from the former Soviet Union, which began towards the end of 1989. Immigration reached a peak in 1990 when about 200,000 entered Israel (and 276,000 more in 1991). Between 1992 and 1996, approximately 75,000 to 80,000 new immigrants arrived annually. Despite the high level of economic activity during most of the period from 1990 to 1996, unemployment rose significantly, from 8.9 per cent in 1989 to 11.2 per cent in 1992. Thereafter, unemployment declined, reaching 6.7 per cent in 1996. This was achieved through short-term programmes of financial assistance to industrial firms willing to increase the numbers of workers employed, the creation of temporary jobs in the public sector and through the expansion of vocational training, in particular, skill-updating and retraining courses for university graduates and on-the-job training. The number of new immigrants in vocational training rose from an average of about 1,300 per month, in 1993. By 1996, the number of new immigrants in vocational courses declined to about 2,000 per month, as the flow of new arrivals slowed and their absorption into jobs in Israel increased. Unemployment among new immigrants fell from 38.5 per cent in 1991 to 9.3 per cent in 1996, an achievement which was due to a combination of the Government's measures and the economy's expansion during the period.
- 80. Mention should also be made of a temporary employment programme initiated in 1992, when unemployment reached an unusual peak. Projects were initiated to provide employment in the development of archeological and tourist sites and in environmental improvements. By 1993, 3,500 unemployed persons were working in these jobs each month for an average of 17 days each. This rose to 3,800 workers in 1994 (for 18 days per month each) and has since declined as unemployment fell due primarily to the expansion of economic activity in Israel. In the first six months of 1997, only 700 persons were employed for approximately 15 days per month in these temporary jobs.
- 81. The Government's long-term economic programmes focus on measures to maximize the economy's productivity. Such measures include privatization of Government-owned enterprises, encouragement of competition among domestic producers of goods and services and between domestic and foreign producers through the reduction of trade barriers, and the minimization of the use of employment projects for the temporary relief of unemployment.

Employment and individual freedom

- 82. At the most basic level, the employee-employer relationship is a contractual one. The fundamental principle of "freedom of contract" (entrenched since 1992 in the Basic Law: Human Dignity and Freedom) applies to labour contracts as well. This includes both the freedom to enter a labour relation or to chose not to do so, and the freedom to define the content of such a relation. Hence, as a general rule, the individual right to work exists only where there is an individual labour contract or a relevant collective agreement and its scope is to be determined by them.
- 83. This contractual approach has led Israeli courts to somewhat restrict the availability of enforcement as a remedy for dismissal in breach of a personal labour contract. Such remedy may be granted by statute or by a collective agreement (as described below). It should be noted that this issue is one of the most controversial in Israeli labour law, and differences exist in its regard within the Supreme Court itself.
- 84. Nonetheless, "freedom of contract" is not the only principle governing the present topic. In light of the basic inequality between the two sides of a labour contract -

the employee and the employer - freedom of contract alone is not enough to protect worker's rights. Protective labour law principles and statutes in Israel have important implications for the protection of the right to work.

- 85. Protection of job security through collective agreements (and extension orders) is in fact very efficient for organized workers, who constitute the vast majority of workers in Israel. It is so deeply entrenched in the system that it is sometimes criticized, mostly by employers.
- 86. Many collective agreements include a provision that employees dismissed as a result of cutbacks are entitled, during a given period, to be given priority in any return to work. Furthermore, collective agreements also often set procedures for determining the justification for dismissal by the employer. The most common procedure of this sort is the "bipartite committee", composed of the employer and trade union representatives. Should such committee reach a dead end, the dispute is commonly brought to arbitration.
- 87. Direct statutory protection of security of employment is exceptional and applies to particular kinds of workers as follows (see full text of the laws referred to in annex
- (a) Female workers during maternity leave (including up to six months after giving birth in case of medical grounds for absence) and pregnancy (under certain conditions) see the Employment of Women Law 1964, article 9;
- (b) Workers serving in the army reserve the Discharged Soldiers Reinstatement Law 1949, articles 37 and 41;
- (c) War invalids regulations issued under the Discharged Soldiers Reinstatement Law 1949, article 31;
- (d) Employees who are members of a "safety committee" and "safety delegates" in connection with the fulfilment of their statutory functions the Labor Inspection (Organization) Law 1954, articles 17 and 24;
- (e) Workers who are relatives of fallen veterans, during a five-year period of statutory extension of their retirement age, or in relation with it the Rehabilitation Law 1950, Fallen Soldiers Families (Pensions and article 33A);
- (f) Civil servants and workers in other public services in relation to complaints they have filed with the State Comptroller the State Comptroller Law (New Version) 1958, article 45C.
- 88. In addition, there are three forms of State regulation of recruitment and employment, which indirectly enhance individual opportunities for employment.
- 89. The first is in the Employment Service Act 1959, which created the Israeli Employment Service. This is a national public corporation under the responsibility of the Minister of Labor and Social Affairs, whose main purpose is to match employment seekers with vacancies as notified by employers. An employment service office is provided for in every urban area throughout the country. According to the National Insurance Law (Revised Version) 1995, reporting to the Employment Service office is a precondition for receiving unemployment allowance where no suitable work was offered (see details under article 9 of the Covenant).
- 90. "Private Employment Services", commonly called "Placement Agencies", are also regulated by the State under the Employment Service Law 1959 (Part 4). They are required to obtain a permit from the Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs, who supervises them.
- 91. Replying to public discontent with the proliferation of private agencies operating in various ways in the area of employment management, the Employment of Workers by Manpower Contractors Law 1996 was enacted. The difference between a "manpower contractor" and a private "placement agency" is that the former remains the employer after placing the employee at work at a third party's workplace. The "manpower contractor" differs, in turn, from a regular contractor in that the contract with the third party is limited to the provision of personnel management services. The Law requires any "manpower contractor" to obtain a permit after depositing a satisfactory financial guaranty, to be used by the State for the benefit of workers in the case of breach of contract by the agency. The Law also compels the "manpower contractor" to provide employees with a written contract. It also nullifies the validity of clauses seeking to limit the employee's freedom to be at some point in the future hired by the third party. A petition to the High Court of Justice is still pending waiting for judgement, seeking to declare unconstitutional the legal provisions requiring financial guarantee as a precondition for issuing a permit.
- 92. The Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs is charged with the enforcement of the Employment of Workers by Labor Contractors Law. Since its entry into force in September 1996, almost 200 agencies have requested permits, about 170 of which have obtained such.
- 93. The "restraint of trade" doctrine is another important instance of protective principle, sometimes reducing the effect of "freedom of contract" and enhancing working opportunities. Under this doctrine, a clause in a contract of employment which seeks to restrict the freedom of an employee to work at any time at a particular kind of occupation is valid only when the said restrictions are deemed reasonable, for example when their purpose is the protection of the employer's trade secrets or other confidential information. Otherwise, the employee's consent is considered void.
- 94. The enactment in 1992 of the Basic Law: Freedom of Occupation added a constitutional aspect to the issue of choice of occupation in general and to the courts' reasoning in "restraint of engagement in trade" cases in particular. The reasonability of a restraint of engagement in trade clause is now a complex issue of reaching the right balance between "Freedom of cortract" and "Freedom of occupation", taking into account the competing rights of all parties involved (the employer, the employee and the third party who wishes to hire the latter), as well as the public interests normally taken into consideration in such cases under regular constitutional law.
- 95. Last but not least, freedom of choice of occupation is also indirectly promoted by the legal provisions and principles prohibiting discrimination in recruitment, dealt with in section 3(a) below.

Technical and vocational training programmes

- (i) Vocational guidance
- 96. Psychological and vocational counselling services are provided by the Vocational Guidance Division of the Employment Service (this State institution is described in greater detail in section 3(a) below). Services include vocational guidance for individuals (about 5,000 persons per year), vocational diagnosis and testing, job analysis and classification, collection and dissemination of employment information and instruction for personnel involved in vocational guidance activities in schools, local labour
- 97. No data is available on the operations of vocational guidance by the demographic characteristics of those using the services.
 - (ii) Vocational and technical education within the formal education system sponsored
 - by the Ministry of Education
- 98. In general, vocational education is available within the formal education system at the secondary and post-secondary levels, with introductory and exploratory vocational courses provided in grade 9 (intermediate level).
- 99. The vocational schools offer students a variety of both academic and vocational subjects, including commercial and secretarial studies, fashion and textile design, basic technical skills (metalworking, mechanics and electricity, for example), computer science and electronics. In addition, there are agricultural schools and nautical schools combining specific vocational training with academic studies. In recent years, technological development has given rise to increased efforts to adapt vocational school curricula to the economy's need for an expanding supply of skilled workers training in modern technology. To this end, computer studies have been introduced and twelfth_year students work one or two days a week in industrial plants in order to familiarize themselves with innovations in production methods.
- 100. There are three paths within vocational schools: a combination of a full academic programme (leading to matriculation) with vocational training; vocational studies (leading to a diploma); and practical vocational education stressing practical application (leading only to a certificate).
- 101. Within the last 10-15 years, the number of students receiving vocational training in secondary schools has grown by 50 per cent, an increase attributed by the Ministry of Education primarily to the growing number of youngsters remaining in school after the age of compulsory attendance. The majority of such youngsters are being absorbed into the vocational education network as opposed to the academic education network.
- 102. At the post-secondary level, advanced vocational training is available to students who have completed a full secondary school course of study. In 1993/94 (the latest year for which data is available), there were 224 of these institutions throughout the country (in Hebrew and Arab networks), of which 32 provided teacher training (for primary and intermediate schools) and 101 for training of practical engineers and technicians. The remainder offered qualified nurses' training, training in paramedical occupations, business and clerical courses and arts courses (fashion, design, graphics, etc.). In 1993/94, 59,000 students were studying in post-secondary (non-academic) institutions, an increase of 67 per cent over 1985/86, with substantial growth in all fields of study.
 - (iii) Vocational training for adults and youth sponsored by the Ministry of Labor
- 103. In addition to the vocational education frameworks described above, the Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs sponsors an extensive network of vocational training courses for adults (aged 18 and over) and youths (aged 15-18) for the purposes of assisting workers in expanding their employment horizons, enlarging the pool of skilled workers available to the economy and implementing the training aspects of national economic policy in the field of manpower. Training activities are undertaken in close cooperation with industries, employers' organizations and the trade union movement.

skills;

- 104. Adult training activities include:
- (a) Courses for the acquisition of basic skills;
- (b) Short extension and evening courses for supplementing training and refreshing
- (c) Vocational rehabilitation for the handicapped;
- (d) Training of manpower for emergencies;
- (e) Training of practical engineers, technicians and instructors in these subjects;

(g) On-the-job training programmes to train manpower in new and advanced

techniques.

- 105. Training activities are mainly conducted in vocational training centres located throughout the country. Most courses are run by established schools selected by the Ministry, which supervises their operation and subsidizes the trainees (usually unemployed, referred to the schools by the Employment Service). Occupational standards are determined and maintained by the Ministry through supervisors and Ministry licensing examinations. The Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs also offers financial incentives (such as transportation and subsistence allowances, tuition exemptions and scholarships) to students studying preferred trades.
- 106. In addition to its regular, ongoing training activities, the Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs also initiates and carries out programmes to meet the needs of specific groups in the population requiring special assistance in preparing themselves to join the labour market. Currently, there are special programmes in operation and in the planning stages to offer vocational training to immigrants from Ethiopia, from the former Soviet Union (both adults and young people) and women.
- 107. In 1996, about 130,000 adults were studying in Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs-sponsored programmes, receiving basic and supplementary vocational training in such fields as practical engineering, metalwork, electricity and electronics, mechanics, domestic economy, hotel management, paramedical occupations and computer science.
- 108. The Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs is obligated by law to provide training for young people, aged 15 to 18, who have dropped out of the formal education system (see the Youth Labor Law 1953, Part Six and the Apprenticeship Law 1953 in annex 1 to this report "Labour Laws"). The Ministry has developed several training frameworks to meet the laws' requirements and to suit the needs of those youngsters coming under Ministry care. Youth Training activities include:
 - 1. Apprenticeship programmes combining practical occupational instruction in craft shops and industrial plants with general school studies one or more days a week.
 - 2. Industrial schools, providing post-elementary general and vocational training. The students acquire their vocation through practical work combined with general studies and theoretical training in their vocation. These schools function in cooperation with automotive repair shops, industrial plants and hotels.
 - 3. Other frameworks for skill acquisition:
 - (a) Work groups, which are intended for young people who, for various reasons, cannot be absorbed into regular employment. This framework also combines work with general studies.
 - (b) Pre-military service courses, coordinated with the army, intended for 16-17% year-olds to acquire a vocation useful both during the period of army service and after discharge from military service.
 - (c) Programmes for problem youngsters combining vocational training with general studies and social adjustment training.
- 109. In 1996, approximately 12,500 youngsters aged 15 to 18 studied in programmes sponsored by the Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs, more than 75 per cent of them in industrial schools.

Employment opportunities among particular categories of workers

Prohibition of discrimination

- 110. Certain labour laws prohibit discrimination among candidates for employment or employees.
- 111. The Employment Service Law 1959 states (see the full text in annex 1 to this report "Labour Laws"):
 - "42.(a) When offering employment the Employment Service shall not discriminate against a person on account of his age, sex, race, religion, nationality, State of origin, views or membership in a political party, and a potential employer will not refuse to admit a worker on these grounds, whether or not he was sent to work through the Employment Service.
 - (b) It will not be considered discrimination when the nature or essence of the position or matters of State security prevent the referral or admission of a person to the said position.
 - 42A. An employer in need of employees shall not advertise a job offer which constitutes discrimination under Article 42."
- 112. This law became less central with the enactment in 1988 of the Equal Employment Opportunities Law 1988, and even more so when substantially amended in 1995. The latter law includes various norms, the principal one being the following (see the full text in annex 2 to this report):
 - "2.(a) An employer shall not discriminate between his employees or job-applicants on account of their sex, sexual orientation, personal status, parenthood, age, religion, nationality, State of origin, views or membership in a political party, in relation to all of the following:
 - Hiring;
 - Job conditions;
- Job promotion;
- Vocational training or advanced studies;
- Firing or Termination Compensations;
- Retirement benefits and payment granted to an employee;
 - $^{\mathrm{w}}$ (b) For the purposes of subsection (a) the introduction of irrelevant conditions will be considered discriminatory.
 - "(c) It will not be considered discrimination under this article when the act is necessarily linked to the nature or essence of the job or position.
 - "2A. (a) an employer shall not require from a job applicant or an employee the details of his military health classification and will refrain from using that information, if he learns about it, in any matter enumerated in article 2(a)(1)-(6).
 - "(b) ...
- "(c) ...
 - "(d) In this article, 'military health classification' is the numeric symbol the Israel Defense Force attributes to a person to indicate his medical compatibility to military service in the various units and positions in the Israel Defense Force."
- 113. The Equal Employment Opportunities Law 1988 is a modern statute, including various enforcement mechanisms, some of which were unprecedented in Israeli labour law. Breach of the Law constitutes both a civil wrong and a criminal offence. Civil proceedings can be initiated by a worker, a trade union or a civil rights movement. The courts are given special competence to grant compensation even when no material damage was caused. Special protection is granted to a worker filing a complaint under the Law. Supervision and enforcement authority is given to the Minister of Labor and Social Affairs.
- 114. The Enforcement Division of the Ministry examines complaints from individuals and initiates its own investigations. In 1996, workplaces employing more than five persons were investigated for possible violations relating to sexual harassment at work, discrimination in hiring, promotion and wages, exercise of parents' rights and discriminatory advertisements offering employment.
- 115. Since the enactment of the Law in 1988 relatively few cases of discrimination at work have been brought to the courts, most of these being for unlawful publication of job advertisements. The 1995 amendment brought about a few more cases, but the main deterrent factor has continued to be the apparent lenience of the courts, apparent mainly in the small sums awarded in compensation.
- 116. The National Labor Court recently issued a decision promising to become a landmark case. Not only was the compensation award significantly upgraded, the Court made important statements that will undoubtedly enhance the importance of this Law:

"Human beings were born in the image of God. However, they did not descend upon this world as identical to each other. Every person possesses an individual character, his own physiological features and different colour of skin. Hence, in some aspects it may be the case that these differences should lead to differentiated treatment. For example, when different physiological features are involved, different medical treatment may be warranted on that account. However, the basic proposition should be that despite the difference between persons, every human should be treated equally as such."

"Equality was considered by our jurisprudence, both that of the Supreme Court and that of the National Labor Court, as a fundamental right, even before the enactment of the Basic Law, 'The right has graduated' and is now a constitutional right. I do not believe that human dignity and freedom can be discussed without equality, and equality on the job even the more so. A substantial part of our lives is spent in work, and discrimination and degradation cannot be tolerated at the workplace.

"... [T]he right to equal treatment is a fundamental value of democratic system of law. When we discuss equality, we address both formal and substantive equality. Formal equality requires prima facie that people of equal virtues shall receive equal treatment. On the other hand, substantive equality requires that people, even if they differ in irrelevant features, shall receive equal treatment - not necessarily an identical job, but an equal opportunity to receive a suitable job.

"In light of the above mentioned, it can be concluded, that the underlying ideas behind the standard of behaviour required from a potential employer, is that the questions [in the job interview] shall not include any trace of a stereotyped approach. It should be asked whether the mere asking of a question characterized by stereotyped thinking during a personal interview or on tender invitation forms, is sufficient to hold the potential employer liable. I believe it is enough. Furthermore, when the

required qualifications are typically better suiting men than women, it must be shown that the required advantage is necessary linked to the position offered, and that it is impossible to settle for any less. The correct avenue is to examine the person on his own merits, and not the features of the group to which he belongs." National Labor Court case 1997/3-129 Plotkin v. Eisenberg Brothers Ltd., pp. 6, 8-11, 21.

- 117. The prohibition of discrimination on the basis of sexual orientation was strongly promoted in 1995 by a comprehensive Supreme Court decision, in which an employer was ordered to grant an employee's homosexual partner a certain work-benefit intended for a worker's spouse. This ruling has clear implications for cases of discrimination in hiring.
- 118. Discrimination on the basis of religion is also specifically covered by article 9C of the Work and Rest Hours Law 1951. This provision prohibits refusal to hire an employee who refuses to work on his religious holidays and prohibits forcing such a worker to pledge to work on such days as a condition for being hired.
- 119. The significance of all the above goes beyond discrimination in recruitment and covers the whole of labour relations, but discrimination in recruitment is one of the contexts where the statute should prove most influential. This is particularly so in view of the known tendency of workers to refrain from suing their employer as long as the relation is ongoing, and in view of the fact that discrimination in recruitment results in no labour relations at all.
- 120. Most discrimination cases concern gender discrimination. There is in Israel no data relating to other kinds of discrimination, besides the complex issue of foreign workers dealt with below.

Factual situation

121. Presented below are statistics available on the actual situation in Israel regarding vocational guidance, vocational training, employment and occupation, according to conditions relevant to the non-discrimination principle. It should be noted at the outset that statistics by race or colour are not considered relevant to Israel and are not collected.

(i) Vocational training

122. Shown below are statistics for 1996 on adults in vocational training programmes of the Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs, by sex and population group:

	Thousands	Per cent
All students	130.0	100.0
Men	76.7	59.0
Women	53.3	41.0
Jews	113.5	87.3
Arabs and others	16.5	12.7

<u>Source</u>: Israel, Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs Vocational Training Division.

(ii) Employment

123. Data for 1996 of employed persons by sex and population group are shown below:

	Thousands	Per cent
All employed persons	2 012.8	100.0
Men	1 147.0	57.0
Women	865.8	43.0
Jews	1 753.3	87.1
Arabs and others	259.5	12.9

<u>Source</u>: Israel, Central Bureau of Statistics, <u>Labour Force</u> <u>Survey</u>, 1996.

(iii) Occupation and continent of birth

124. Data for 1995 of Jewish employed persons by continent of birth and occupation are shown in the following table, presenting, for 1995, employed persons by occupation, sex and population group. According to the data in this table, more than a quarter of employed Israelis work in academic professions or technical occupations; a third are clerical and sales personnel and 25 per cent are skilled workers, primarily in industry and construction:

			1995	
			JEWS	
		(th	ousands)	
Occupation and sex	Total	Israel-born	Asia/Africa	Europe N. America
Grand total 1/	1 715.3	945.5	267.3	496.4
Academic professionals	212.3	111.7	15.5	84.5
Other professionals and	245.9	146.9	26.3	71.9
technicians				
Managers	92.7	58.2	12.8	21.6
Clerical workers	309.0	204.9	40.6	62.
Agents, sales and service workers	300.4	170.4	56.5	72.0
Skilled agricultural workers	36.9	24.3	6.0	6.5
Industry, construction and other skilled workers	364.6	171.8	70.2	121.0
Unskilled workers	136.0	47.3	35.9	51.9
Males - Total	931.9	494.8	163.9	270.1
Academic professionals	112.2	54.4	10.5	47.0
Other professionals and technicians	95.8	54.5	11.1	29.9
Managers	74.2	46.1	11.5	16.6
Clerical workers	83.0	45.4	16.9	20.4
Agents, sales and service workers	137.4	82.0	26.5	28.6
Skilled agricultural workers	31.4	21.5	5.0	4.8
Industry, construction and other				
skilled workers	316.3	157.5	62.0	95.3
Unskilled workers	68.2	25.9	17.1	24.
Females - Total	783.4	450.7	103.4	226.3
Academic professionals	100.1	57.3	5.0	37.5
Other professionals and technicians	150.1	92.4	15.2	42.0
Managers	18.5	12.1	1.3	5.0
Clerical workers	226.0	159.5	23.7	42.3
Agents, sales and service workers	163.0	88.4	30.0	44.0
Skilled agricultural workers	5.5	2.8	-1.0	1.1
Industry, construction and other skilled workers	48.3	14.3	8.2	25.
Unskilled workers	67.8	21.4	18.8	27.1
1/ Includes persons whose			10.0	21.

Source: Israel, Central Bureau of Statistics, Labour Force Survey, 1996.

125. With respect to the continent of birth, as of 1995, more than half (55 per cent) of the Jewish employed population was born in Israel. Of the remainder, 16 per cent are immigrants from Asian and African countries and 29 per cent from European and North and South American countries. By occupation, almost a third of those Jews born in Europe and the United States worked in academic and professional occupations, compared with 27 per cent of the Israeli-born and 16 per cent of those born in Asia and Africa. Among all three groups, about 20-25 per cent were employed as skilled workers in industry and construction.

126. As apparent from the data in table 2 of this section's annex, among the Israeli Arab working population, of whom the overwhelming majority are men, half worked as skilled labour in industry and construction. Labour force participation is very low among Israeli Arab women. Of those who are employed, a quarter work in academic and professional fields, 35 per cent are clerical and sales workers and an additional 35 per cent are employed in industry as skilled and unskilled labour.

Foreign workers

127. The phenomenon of foreign workers is not unique to Israel. Statistics from the ILO show that around a third of the developed countries have absorbed significant amounts of this workforce. 1/ (1/ W.R. Buhaning, The Employment of Foreign Workers - A Guide for Policy and Practice, International Labour Office, Geneva, p. 1.

128. Until recently the bulk of foreign workers in Israel were Palestinians from the West Bank and Gaza Strip. With the increase in the number of terrorist attacks and the concomitant need to close off the territories, a large number of workers came to Israel from all over the world, in particular from Romania and other Eastern European countries, the Philippines, Thailand and other countries in South-East Asia, Africa and South America. They are nearly all employed in the building sector, agriculture, nursing and hotels; a small number are employed in industry and public services.

129. Out of around 2,131,400 workers in Israel in 1996, about 118,000 were foreign workers with permits: 94,000 from all around the world and around 24,000 Palestinian workers from the West Bank and Gaza Strip.

130. The exact number of foreign workers without permits is unknown. The estimate of the Israeli Employment Service is that as of summer 1997 there were 100,000 such workers.

131. As the various types of foreign workers now constitute some 10 per cent of the Israeli workforce, the State has been forced to take a number of steps, as set out below, making a definite distinction between the legal and the practical aspects of the problem.

Foreign workers and total employment in Israel: 1996, 1991 and 1988 (thousands)

	<u>1988</u>	1991	<u>1996</u>
All employed	1 497.9	1 652.1	2 131.4
Israelis	1 453.1	1 583.3	2 012.8
Palestinian workers (with permits)	41.5	60.7	24.2
Other foreign workers (with permits)	3.3	8.1	94.4

Source: Israel: Central Bureau of Statistics and Employment Service.

(i) The legal status of foreign workers in Israel

132. It should be noted at the outset that in addition to being a party to the current Covenant, Israel is a party to the ILO. Migration for Employment Convention (Revised) 1949 (No. 97) (Israel's last report covers the years 1988-1994) and to the Maintenance of Migrants' Pension Rights Convention, 1935 (No. 48) (Israel's last report covers the years 1979-1982).

133. As prescribed by international law and the basic principles of the legal system in Israel, one can safely say that the law in Israel does not discriminate between foreign workers and resident Israeli workers:

The Equal Employment Opportunity Law 1988 prohibits discrimination on the basis of "nationality" or "State of origin" as regards granting work opportunities and determining conditions of work;

The labour laws in Israel that determine the basic rights of the worker (minimum wage, hours of work and rest, prohibition on delaying salary payment, severance pay, safety in the workplace, etc.) apply to every "worker", irrespective of his/her citizenship. This is also the case with regard to other rights stemming from collective agreements and extension orders;

Educational services are provided without distinction to the children of Israeli residents and to the children of foreign workers;

With regard to health services, a distinction should be made between emergency services, granted without distinction to anyone arriving at the outpatients emergency ward of hospitals, and health insurance and other services to which the foreign worker is not entitled on the basis of the National Health Insurance Law 1994. The foreign worker is thus required to insure himself. The exception to this are the three branches of National Insurance – work accidents, maternity and

childbirth - which apply by law (the National Insurance Law (revised version) 1995) to all "workers", as opposed to the other branches which are dependent on the person being a "resident":

Welfare services are provided to foreign workers and their families without distinction. There is a statutory requirement on the relevant authority to intervene (such as in the event of violence in the family, sexual assault of minors, neglect of minors, adoption, etc.). As regards other services which are provided to Israelia as part of the benefit programme of the Ministry of Labor and Welfare, the policy is distinguish between legal and illegal workers: legal workers are entitled to the services provided to Israeli residents, while illegal workers are entitled to emergency services only, with the view to assisting them and their families in leaving the country.

(ii) The reality with regard to foreign workers in Israel

134. In reality, as opposed to the legal situation, foreign workers are more vulnerable than other workers to the possibility of being exploited by employers and the various employment agencies.

135. The employing a foreign worker requires a special residence permit which the relevant employer has taken out for the explicit purpose of the worker working with him alone. In applying the Entry into Israel Law 1952, the Ministry of the Interior makes the granting of a residence permit for the purposes of work conditional on receiving a permit from the Employment Service. The Employment Service in this area operates according to a policy which determines those sectors which require foreign workers, setting quotas for each sector. To get a permit from the Employment Service, the employer has to leave a monetary guarantee of several thousand new shekels to guarantee that the worker will remain with him and leave the country on completion of the work. The employer undertakes in writing to provide the worker with adequate housing, to pay his medical insurance, and to give the worker a copy of his employment contract in a language which the worker understands.

136. The authorities are thus faced with a dilemma. On the one hand is the need to reduce the foreign workforce and in particular combat the phenomenon of remaining in Israel illegally. On the other, it is impossible to ignore the vulnerability of foreign workers, including those with proper work permits. Hence government policy is to act on two levels: to improve enforcement and prevent illegal entry into the country, including returning illegal workers to their country of origin; and improving the help provided to legal foreign workers in enforcing their rights.

137. Below are the main steps currently being taken in the legal and administrative spheres so as to achieve the Government's target of reducing the number of foreign workers while combating discrimination against them.

(iii) The Foreign Workers Administration

138. In 1996, the Government decided to set up the Foreign Workers Administration. The move stemmed from the fear of losing control over the number of foreign workers and from the experience of European countries in this area where the increasing number of foreign workers was accompanied by serious social problems (xenophobia, unemployment, crime, etc.). The job of the Administration is to coordinate the activities of the various authorities involved so as to improve both enforcement of the law and the care for the foreign workers themselves, particularly those in Israel with a permit. The Minister of Labour and Social Affairs is the head of the Ministerial Committee dealing with foreign workers. On 1 June 1997 a full_time chairperson was appointed to the Administration and the body began to work.

139. The first goal set by the Government for the Administration is to curb the phenomenon of workers without permits and gradually reduce the number of permits by 500 workers a month. In the four months since its setting up the Administration recorded a drop of 15,000 in foreign workers with permits.

140. The second goal for the Administration is to coordinate the various non-profit organizations on behalf of the foreign workers, in particular those in Israel with permits, and also directly help the workers themselves by providing information on their rights. However, the Administration is currently still preoccupied with trying to curb the increase of foreign workers, so it will be a while before it can concentrate on providing actual help to foreign workers.

(iv) <u>Legal initiatives</u>

141. The Foreign Employees (Unlawful Employment) Law 1991 sets out criminal prohibitions on employers and employment agencies with respect to employment or detention of a

142. The power of enforcement under the above law resides with the Minister of Labour and Social Affairs. In the enforcement unit of the Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs 63 inspectors are currently employed, half of whom are assigned to the subject of foreign workers. Eighteen of these are employed in tracking down foreign workers in Israel without permits, 6 investigate the living conditions of foreign workers and 10 investigate their conditions of work and pay. The inspectors are empowered to impose fines on employers who have not paid workers; however, they are unable to compel the employer to pay the unpaid salary. In special cases the inspectors can bring an indictment, such as where the offences are recurrent or particularly serious. For the purposes of tracking down and expelling illegal workers a joint operation is conducted with the Police and the Ministry of Interior, since inspectors of the Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs are not empowered to deport individuals.

143. A government bill is designed to compel employers to provide proper living conditions for their foreign workers, to issue each foreign worker with a copy of his or her contract in a language the worker understands, and to provide health insurance. The bill increases the severity of the punishments that can be meted out to employers, improves the supervision capacity of the Minister of Labour and Social Affairs, and confers supervisory powers on the new bodies described above. The bill is currently at an advanced stage of becoming law.

144. It should be noted that the proposed law is exceptional in terms of the duties it imposes on employers in Israel. It is not normally acceptable in Israeli labour law (as elsewhere) to impose such direct duties on the employer by means of legislation. These are normally obligations which employers accept on themselves, as part of collective agreements, if at all. The measure being introduced here stems from regarding legal foreign workers as requiring greater protection than that granted local workers.

145. Thus, government policy is on the one hand to increase supervisory control and enforcement so as to reduce the phenomenon of foreign workers, and on the other to take steps for the protection of the rights and welfare of legal foreign workers.

Distinctions explicitly permitted

146. Article 2 (c) of the Equal Employment Opportunities Law 1988 cited above explicitly states that the non-discrimination prohibition does not apply when a distinction is "necessarily linked to the nature or essence of the job or position". It is not clear yet how this rule will be interpreted, but inference can be made by analogy from the famous High Court of Justice decision in the <u>Alice Miller</u> case. The court overturned the Israeli Air Force's refusal to recruit a woman to its air-pilot training course. The argument that the position was inherently suitable for men only was rejected by the court, which forced the Air Force to recruit Mrs. Miller, stating:

"The right to dignity, which encompasses the prohibition of discrimination against women, is one of the most important and fundamental human rights. As a rule, humiliating a woman through discrimination on a gender basis constitutes a grave insult to her person."

H.C. 4541/93 Miller v. Minister of Defense, P.D. vol. 49 (4) 94, 141.

147. There also exist statutory provisions giving priority to military veterans, single mothers and new immigrants in the domains of recruitment and vocational training. Such preferences are considered legitimate in the light of the special difficulties these categories of workers usually face because of their social condition. They have never been challenged in the courts.

Table 1. Employment and unemployment of Israelis: situations, levels and trends: 1996, 1991 and 1986

	Per	cent char	nge		
	1996	1991	1986	1986-1996	1991-1996 1986- 1991
Total population					
Aged 15 and over					
(thousands)	4 019.9	3 427.7	2 906.3	38.3	17.3 17.9
In civilian labour force:					
Number (thousands)	2 156.9	1 770.4	1 471.9	46.5	21.8 20.3
Participation rate (%)	53.7	51.7	50.6		
Employed (thousands)	2 012.8	1 583.3	1 367.9	47.1	27.1 15.
Unemployed					
Number (thousands)	144.1	187.2	104.0	38.6	-23.0 80.0
Unemployment rate (%)	6.7	10.6	7.1		
Jews					•
Aged 15 and over (thousands)	3 362.6	2 902.2	2 479.7	35.6	15.9 17.
In civilian labour force:					
Number (thousands)	1 880.2	1 556.4	1 302.9	44.3	20.8 19.9
Participation rate (%)	55.9	53.6	52.5		
Employed (thousands)	1 753.3	1 391.6	1 216.4	44.1	26.0 14.
Unemployed					
Number (thousands)	127.0	164.7	86.5	46.8	-22.9 90.
Unemployment rate (%)	6.7	10.6	6.6		
Men					-
Aged 15 and over (thousands)	1 959.7	1 678.9	1 429.8	37.1	16.7 17.
In civilian labour force:					
Number (thousands)	1 217.8	1 042.7	903.6	34.8	16.8 15.
Participation rate (%)	62.1	62.1	63.2		
Employed (thousands)	1 142.0	952.8	844.9	35.8	20.4 12.
Unemployed					
Number (thousands)	70.8	89.9	58.7	20.6	-21.2 53.3
Unemployment rate (%)	5.8	8.6	6.5		

Aged 15 and over						
(thousands)	2 060.1	1 748.9	1 476.8	39.5	17.8	18.
In civilian labour force:						
Number (thousands)	939.1	727.9	568.6	65.2	29.0	28.
Participation rate	45.6	41.6	38.5			
(%)						
Employed (thousands)	865.8	630.4	523.7	65.3	37.3	20.
Unemployed						
Number (thousands)	73.3	97.5	44.9	63.2	-24.8	117.
Unemployment rate (%)	7.8	13.4	7.9			
Arabs and others						
Aged 15 and over	657.3	525.5	427.1	53.9	25.1	23.
(thousands)						
In civilian labour force:						
Number (thousands)	276.6	214.1	169.4	63.3	29.2	26.
	270.0	214.1	103.4	03.3	23.2	20.
Participation rate	42.1	40.7	39.7			
Employed (thousands)	259.5	191.6	151.6	71.2	35.4	26.
Unemployed						
Number (thousands)	17.2	22.4	17.8	3.3	23.2	25.
Unemployment rate (%)	6.2	10.5	10.5			
Population aged 15 to 17						
Aged 15 and over (thousands)	303.2	287.7	240.1	26.3	5.4	19.
In civilian labour force:						
Number (thousands)	38.5	31.6	30.2	27.5	21.8	4.
Participation rate (%)	12.7	11.0	12.6			
Employed (thousands)	30.9	22.6	23.0	34.3	36.7	-1.
Unemployed	•					
Number (thousands)	7.6	7.5	6.2	22.6	1.3	21.
Unemployment rate (%)	19.7	23.7	20.5			

Population aged 18 to 24						
Aged 15 and over						
(thousands)	698.9	580.2	490.5	42.5	20.5	18.3
In civilian labour force:						_
Number (thousands)	304.2	238.5	198.7	53.1	27.5	20.0
Participation rate (%)	43.5	41.1	40.5			
Employed (thousands)	265.3	173.9	152.8	73.6	52.6	13.8
Unemployed						_
Number (thousands)	38.9	52.9	37.0	5.1	-26.5	43.0
Unemployment rate (%)	12.8	22.2	18.6			
Population aged 45 to 54						
Aged 15 and over						
(thousands)	553.1	397.3	341.0	62.2	39.2	16.5
In civilian labour force:						
Number (thousands)	422.1	284.3	231.4	82.4	48.5	22.9
Participation rate	76.3	71.6	67.9			
(%)						
Employed (thousands)	402.9	243.0	202.8	98.7	65.8	19.8
Unemployed						
Number (thousands)	19.2	19.5	7.7	149.4	-1.5	153.2
Unemployment rate (%)	4.5	6.9	3.3			
Population aged 55 to 65						
Aged 15 and over						
(thousands)	383.3	336.0	309.0	24.0	14.1	8.7
In civilian labour force:						
Number (thousands)	188.7	167.2	147.0	28.4	12.9	13.7
Participation rate	49.2	49.8	47.6			
(%)						

Unemployed (thousands)	179.6	143.0	130.8	37.3	25.6	9.3
Number (thousands)	9.1	12.1	3.0	203.3	-24.8	303.3
Unemployment rate (%)	4.8	7.2	2.0			

417.9	304.9	N/A	_	37.1
•	•	•		
218.9	159.9	N/A	-	36.9
52.4	52.4	N/A	-	
195.9	121.9	N/A	-	60.7
•	•	•		
23.0	24.6	N/A	-	-6.5
10.5	15.4	N/A	_	
•	•	•		
523.8	211.0	N/A	-	162.5
		-	•	
296.0	96.4	N/A	-	207.1
53.4	45.7	N/A	-	
268.6	59.3	N/A	-	353.0
			•	
27.4	37.1	N/A	-	-26.1
9.3	38.5	N/A	-	
	218.9 52.4 195.9 23.0 10.5 523.8 296.0 53.4 268.6	218.9 159.9 52.4 195.9 121.9 23.0 24.6 10.5 15.4 523.8 211.0 296.0 96.4 53.4 45.7 268.6 59.3 27.4 37.1	218.9 159.9 N/A 52.4 52.4 N/A 195.9 121.9 N/A 23.0 24.6 N/A 10.5 15.4 N/A 523.8 211.0 N/A 296.0 96.4 N/A 25.4 45.7 N/A 268.6 59.3 N/A	218.9 159.9 N/A - 52.4 52.4 N/A - 195.9 121.9 N/A - 105.9 121.9 N/A - 10.5 15.4 N/A - 523.8 211.0 N/A - 523.8 211.0 N/A - 524.6 N/A - 526.6 59.3 N/A - 268.6 59.3 N/A - 27.4 37.1 N/A - 27.4 37.1 N/A - 527.4 37.1 N/A - 527.4 37.1 N/A - 527.4 37.1 N/A - 527.4 37.1 N/A - 528.6 59.3 N/A - 527.4 37.1 N/A - 527.4 37.1 N/A - 527.4 37.1 N/A - 527.4 552.4 59.3 N/A - 527.4 37.1 N/A - 527.4 57.1 N/A - 527.

^{1/} Arrivals from 1990 onwards.

Source: Israel Central Bureau of Statistics, Labour Force Surveys.

Table 2. Employed persons by occupation, sex and population group, 1995

	Tot-1	N. dest	T
Occupation Total	Total 2 012.8	Males 1 146.9	46 Q
	2012.8	1 146.9	ю.9
Academic professionals	243.3	130.9	30.9
Other professionals	274.5	111.2	11.2
and technicians			
Managers	104.3	83.3	33.3
Clerical workers	332.2	89.5	39.5
Agents, sales workers and	343.3	164.0	34.0
service workers			
Skilled agricultural	41.5	36.2	36.2
workers			-
Industry, construction and other	487.6	427.3	27.3
Unskilled workers	170.4	92.4	32.4
Unknown	15.6	12.2	12.2
Total	100.0	100.0	00.0
Academic professionals	12.2	11.5	11.5
Other	13.7	9.8	9.8
professionals and technicians			
Managers	5.2	7.3	7.3
Clerical workers	16.6	7.9	7.9
Agents, sales	17.2	14.5	14.5
workers and service workers			
Skilled	2.1	3.2	3.2
agricultural workers			1
Industry, construction	24.4	37.7	37.7
and other Unskilled	8.5	8.1	0.1
workers			

Source: Israel, Central Bureau of Statistics, Labour Force Survey, 1996.

Article 7 - Just and favourable conditions of work

Related international conventions binding Israel

148. Israel is a party to numerous related ILO conventions. The following are those of the most general application:

Equal Remuneration Convention, 1951 (No. 100) since 1965; last report relates to the years 1991-1993;

Weekly Rest (Industry) Convention, 1921 (No. 14) since 1951; last report relates to the years 1990-1993;

Weekly Rest (Commerce and Offices) Convention, 1957 (No. 106) since 1961; last report relates to the years 1990-1993;

Labor Inspection Convention, 1947 (No. 81) since 1955; last report relates to the years 1989-1990;

Holidays with Pay Convention, 1936 (No. 52) since 1951; last report relates to the years 1990-1993;

Equality of Treatment (Accident Compensation) Convention, 1925 (No. 19) since 1958; last report relates to the years 1991-1995.

Methods for fixing wages

- 149. The Wage Protection Law 1958 is the legal source in Israel of an employee's right to remuneration for his or her work. This law defines "wages" in the broadest fashion, determines the time for the payment of wages, creates a right to "wage delay compensation" (including "compensation for delay in severance pay"), prohibits certain deductions from wages and creates a supervisory system under the authority of the Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs (see the full text in annex A to this report).
- 150. It is fair to say, however, that wages are fixed in Israel primarily by collective agreements and extension orders and only secondarily by individual labour contracts (notwithstanding the Minimum Wage Law dealt with under the next section). The Wage Protection Law does not stipulate the level of remuneration. Even with respect to modes or payments, it leaves much room for collective bargaining to set different arrangements than those prescribed by the law. Moreover, according to section 21 of the Collective Agreements Law 1957, collective agreements can only add to the employee's rights laid down by statute or by an applicable collective agreement.
- 151. As a matter of fact, the vast majority of employees in Israel are covered by collective agreements. The exact number is hard to determine, but it is normally estimated at around 80 per cent. Collective agreements determine scales of wages unique to each trade union. This has created a complex system of occupational and national wage scales. Even when these scales are formally autonomous, they interact with one another in the course of collective bargaining because of workers' demands for adjustments and linkages.
- 152. The effectiveness of collective bargaining in wage-fixing is enhanced by the use of "extension orders" under sections 25-33G of the Collective Agreements Law 1957 (see the full text in annex A to this report). The most significant example in this respect relates to "cost-of-living increment". This wage adjustment system, essential in a market used to high levels of inflation, is activated by collective bargaining at the national level, between the most representative organizations of employees and employers. The outcome is then extended by administrative order to all employees in Israel.
- 153. Were it not for the Labor Courts, the complexity of the wage system would lead to abuses of workers. The Courts have already produced a tremendous corpus of case law, and they are still playing a crucial role in securing workers' rights. A good illustration is the complex task of distinguishing the "basic wage" from special "wage supplements". Such supplements come into being for various reasons, some genuinely related to aspects of the work done, others merely bogus. Bogus wage supplements endanger the basis of wages in general, and undermine the wage protection rules laid down by the law. The Courts' contribution here is in looking beyond the denomination of a wage supplement and at its real substance, always bearing in mind the legitimate interests of the employee.

Minimum wades

- 154. The Minimum Wage Law 1987 imposes a duty to pay no less than the determined minimum wage. Violation of this is both a civil wrong and a criminal offence.
- 155. The main feature of this statute is that its provisions determine the minimum wage and the mechanism for its adjustment, leaving no room for collective or individual bargaining.
- 156. "Minimum wage" means, after the 1997 amendment, 47.5 per cent of the "average wage". The "average wage" is in turn determined by the National Insurance Law 1995 according to the actual distribution of income in the market (see further information on "average wage" under article 9 of the Covenant). In setting the minimum wage at 47.5 per cent of the average wage, the Minimum Wage Law takes into account the needs of workers and their families. As recognized by the National Labor Court:
 - "The machinery for adjusting the minimum wage was also amended in 1997. The basic calculation is made on the 1st of April each year. This basis must be increased in accordance with changes made in wages by general collective agreement, each time such changes occur (section 4)."
- 157. The table below shows minimum and average wages in 1986, 1991 and 1996 in relation to the cost-of-living index:

111111111111	wage Average	wage Cost-or	-living Minimum w	age to
Period per mo	nth per m	onth ind	dex average	wage
	(Curren	t NIS) (1987 = 1	100.0) (%)	

1986	347	1 071	83.4	32.4
1991	1 161	2 656	194.9	43.7
1996	1 996	4 876	333.1	40.6

Per cent changes								
1986-1991	234.6	148.0	133.7	_				
1991-1996	71.9	83.6	70.9	_				
1986-1996	475.2	355.3	299.4					

Source: Israel, Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs and Central Bureau of Statistics.

- 158. Since the coming into effect of the Minimum Wage Law in 1987, there has been a serious erosion in the minimum wage. The minimum wage in 1991 was in fact 44 per cent of the average wage and even dropped to 41 per cent in 1996. This failure of the minimum wage to keep pace with the rise in the general level of wages between 1991 and 1996 was a principal factor behind the 1997 amendments, which both raised the minimum wage from 45 per cent to 47.5 per cent of the average wage and improved the machinery of adjustment, mostly by increasing the frequency of adjustments.
- 159. Another important feature of this law is that it applies to all "employees". A distinction is nevertheless made in the law itself on the basis of age. The legal arrangements described above constitute the general rule and apply to employees aged 18 or over (sect. 2). Employees under the age of 18 also have the right to a minimum wage, but the content of the rules differs. Section 16 of the Law empowers the Minister of Labor and Social Affairs, with the approval of the Knesset Committee for Labor and Social Affairs, to set different standards for young employees. Ministerial Orders issued under this authority in 1987 set a lower minimum wage, ranging from 60 per cent to 83 per cent of the regular minimum wage, according to the youngster's age, the kind of wages paid and whether he or she is an "apprentice".
- 160. The Minimum Wage Law also gives the Minister of Labor and Social Affairs supervisory and enforcement powers. The Enforcement Division of the Ministry investigates reports from the public of suspected violations of the Law. The Enforcement Division also initiates its own inspections of the various sectors of the economy and in the regions, industries, and enterprises known to be especially problematic with regard compliance with the Law (i.e. employers of foreign workers).
- 161. When a violation is discovered, a letter of warning is sent to the employer. If the violation is rectified, including compensation for any prior periods of failure to pay the legal minimum wage, then no further action is taken. Almost all cases (99 per cent) are settled in this way rather than through taking legal action against the employer. The Enforcement Division reinvestigates former violators periodically to check on continued compliance with the Law.
- 162. During 1996, the Enforcement Division investigated close to 3,000 enterprises, employing approximately 50,000 workers, with respect to compliance with the Minimum Wage Law. As a result of this supervision, more than 3,000 workers received compensation totalling NTS 1.5 million.
- 163. Finally, various provisions were added to the law in 1997 in an attempt to encourage employees to file complaints, in order to further promote the implementation of this basic right. Section 7A prohibits an employer from harming an employee with regard to his or her wage, promotion or other conditions of work or from dismissing him or her after claiming violation of the terms of this law. Section 8A empowers the courts to enforce the labour contract when compensation only is judged insufficient sanction. Last but not least, section 14A is intended to help workers of "manpower contractors" (see definition and details under article 6 of the Covenant), by rendering liable under the law the actual person for whom the employee works, in addition to the manpower contractor's liability as the legal employer. Considering that this category of workers seems to be one of those most affected by non-compliance with the Minimum Wage Law, this latter amendment should prove significant.

Equal pay for work of equal value

- 164. The legal history in the domain of equality of remuneration in Israel reveals an evolving public awareness. The Male and Female Workers Equal Pay Law 1964 totally reshaped the Male and Female Workers Equal Pay Law 1964. The main progress to be noted is a change of conception, from "equal pay for equal work" to "equal pay for work of equal value". The concept of "job analysis", crucial for comparing "work of equal value", is now for the first time given legal significance. The new law enables workers to go beyond the commonly used job descriptions, so as to conduct substantial comparisons between apparently different jobs.
- 165. The Law empowers the Labor Court to appoint a job analysis expert, whether by request of a party or on its own initiative (sect. 5). Discretion is left to the court to decide if the party or the State Treasury will bear the costs. Due to this Law, this field of expertise will undoubtedly develop. Mention should be made in this context of job analysis and classification undertaken by the Vocational Guidance Division of the Employment Service, for the use of individuals as well as the Vocational Training Department of the Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs.
- 166. These concepts are relatively new in the Israeli labour market, so it is too soon to evaluate the Law's impact. But the legal development is in itself remarkable. This relative activism on the part of the legislator is due to recognition of the fact that the legal system has traditionally failed to secure equality of remuneration between men and women. The fact that this is the case in most, if not all, industrial countries has not deterred the Knesset from action.
- 167. Nevertheless, the overall trend in Israel is one of slow improvement. Women's hourly average wages are still lower than those of men. Over the past 20 years, women's hourly wages have risen somewhat on the average relative to those of men: from 77 per cent in 1975 to about 81 per cent in 1995. By occupation, as shown below, women earned most compared to men (89.5 per cent) in the category "other professionals and technicians" which includes principally kindergarten and primary school teachers, practical

engineers and technicians, nurses and paramedical workers. Women earned least relative to men (57 per cent) as skilled workers in industry and construction.

Urban wage and salary workers:

Women's hourly wages as a per cent of men's hourly wages, 1995

Occupation	Per cent
Total	80.7
Academic professionals	79.4
Other professional and technicians	89.5
Managers	75.3
Clerical workers	75.8
Sales and services workers	64.2
Skilled workers in industry and construction	56.9
Unskilled workers	78.3

Source: Israel, Central Bureau of Statistics, Income Surveys, 1995.

168. In the civil service there was a salary gap of 29 per cent between men and women's average monthly salary for full-time work in 1988, slightly diminishing to 28 per cent in 1990 (Efroni 1990). Recent data supplied by the Treasury Department indicates a further decrease down to a gap of 24 per cent in 1996 (CEDAW, pp. 139-142).

Income distribution of employees

169. Shown below are the few data available on income distribution in Israel. No differentiation is made here between workers in the public and private sectors, nor between actual pay and non-monetary benefits.

<u>Urban employees by sex and by income from wages and per hour salaries, 1995</u>

Hourly wage group (NIS)	Total	Men	Women
All employees (thousands)	1 535.0	837.9	697.1
Percentage distribution	100	100	100
Up to 7.9	6.1	4.3	8.3
8.00 - 11.99	17	14.2	20.3
12.00 - 15.49	16.7	17.3	16.1
15.50 - 19.99	16.5	17.4	15.4
20.00 - 29.99	19.8	20.3	19.1
30.00 - 49.99	17.1	17.8	16.4
50.00 and over	6.9	8.8	4.6
Average hourly wage (NIS)	24	25.9	20.9

Source: Israel, Central Bureau of Statistics, Income Surveys, 1995.

170. Additional data on distribution of income is gathered in Israel not by wage and salary of workers, but by households headed by such workers. The table below provides further data on income distribution among such households:

Urban households headed by wage-earning and salaried workers by deciles of gross monthly money income per household and by characteristics of household head, 1995

	1										
Deciles of income	Total	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10
Upper limit of decile (NIS)		2 834	3 810	4 679	5 606	6 655	7 850	9 397	11 820	15 809	
Gross money income per household (NIS)	8 320	2 050	3 340	4 234	5 161	6 127	7 237	8 578	10 547	13 667	22 228
Average age of household head	40.4	36.5	37.6	37.6	38.7	39.5	40.8	40.8	42.5	44.0	45.9
Average persons per household	3.9	2.6	3.4	3.9	3.9	4.1	4.0	4.1	4.4	4.1	4.2
All household heads	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0
Year of schooling up to 8	12.5	23.6	19.2	17.0	16.2	13.4	10.7	9.1	8.9	5.4	1.4
9_12	43.5	43.2	50.9	47.7	49.9	49.5	47.9	44.6	45.7	34.5	21.5
13+	44.0	33.1	29.9	35.3	34.0	37.2	41.4	46.3	45.3	60.1	77.1
Age up to 34	35.4	56.2	49.3	46.0	40.3	38.0	34.8	33.2	24.2	20.0	12.3
35_54	50.7	30.4	37.8	43.3	46.6	50.6	50.7	53.7	63.0	61.2	69.4
55_64	11.4	8.4	9.7	8.8	10.9	9.6	11.7	11.5	11.3	16.3	16.3
65+	2.5	5.0	3.2	1.9	2.2	1.8	2.9	1.5	1.5	2.6	2.0
Jews - Total	88.1	81.2	80.6	80.8	81.1	88.8	90.5	91.7	93.7	95.1	97.5
Continent of birth Asia-Africa	16.2	17.4	17.6	12.9	12.6	16.4	18.0	19.8	19.3	16.6	11.7
Europe-America	28.8	31.0	27.0	27.8	31.5	31.2	29.4	28.4	24.4	28.9	28.2
Israel	42.7	32.3	35.1	39.6	36.6	44.0	42.6	43.1	50.0	49.7	57.4
Non-Jews - Total	11.9	18.8	19.4	19.2	18.9	11.2	9.5	8.3	6.3	4.9	

Source: Israel, Central Bureau of Statistics, Income Surveys, 1995.

171. The data shown above is of relative value for the present purposes, but is the best available. It relates to "income" from all jobs held by all earners in a household, together with allowances, overtime, premiums, income from self-employment, property, interests and dividends, pensions, etc. Non-recurrent income is not included. The demographic and educational characteristics detailed in the table refer to the head of household - i.e. the oldest working person. These data are not available by gender.

172. The data in the above table indicate a correlation between income in Israel and both the level of education and age. Income also tends to be higher among Jews than among non-Jews.

Occupational health and safety

- 173. Occupational health and safety at the workplace are protected in Israel by different legal arrangements. At the most basic level, social security and regular torts law entitle employees to compensation in the event of work-related injuries (see further detail under article 9 of the Covenant). In addition, protection of workers from work risks is promoted by different laws which create a rather complex regulatory scheme of standards and of institutions to monitor these standards.
- 174. The Work Safety Ordinance (New Version) 1970 is the main law defining standards for an appropriate environment for people to work in (see the full text in annex A to this report). It deals with safety in areas such as machinery, prevention of falls, entry into confined space, means of escape in the event of fire, etc. It also regulates health hazards, including the control of exposure to hazardous materials, medical supervision, the welfare of employed persons and the control of environmental factors such as temperature, ventilation, lighting, etc.
- 175. Many regulations have been enacted, in addition to this ordinance, which concern work safety and hygiene, including regulations which control exposure by setting occupational standards. These involve the periodic monitoring of the workplace environment and biological monitoring in order to detect early and minor changes of workers' health at a sub-clinical stage and remove workers from further exposure. These regulations refer to: asbestos, arsenic, benzene, noise, ionizing radiation, metals (lead,

mercury, cadmium, chromium, etc.), organic solvents, pesticides and other substances. Some regulations prohibit the use of dangerous agents such as certain carcinogens. Others deal with issues such as safety on building sites or in electricity works, protecting workers by the obligatory use of personal protective gear and other measures.

176. The Labor Inspection (Organization) Law 1954 creates the legal basis for most of the organizations which deal with issues relating to safe and healthy working conditions in the State of Israel (see the full text in annex 1 to this report). The law creates regulatory organizations of various sorts: State organs, public corporation and private bodies. The following is a brief survey of this rather complex system.

The Inspection Service of the Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs

177. The Inspection Service is legally mandated to supervise labour safety, occupational hygiene and welfare in places where people work or are intended to work. The main targets of the inspection service are:

To prevent work accidents;

To prevent occupational diseases which can be caused by exposure to chemicals or physical hazards;

To raise the level of safety in workplaces where there are machines, processes, handling of materials, storage, etc.;

To maintain appropriate working conditions.

- 178. For these purposes the law empowers the Inspection Service's inspectors to issue safety orders, prohibiting the use of any machine, installation, equipment or material which endangers the welfare or health of a person. Another instrument is the improvement order by which the occupier of a workplace is required to comply with legal provisions relating to the safety, health, hygiene or welfare of persons working in the workplace. The inspectors carry out regular inspections, investigate work accidents and in general seek to use their authority to achieve the above-mentioned goals. They also supply technical information and advice to employers and workers on the most effective means of complying with legal requirements.
- 179. The Inspection Service employs 75 labour inspectors and runs the Industrial Hygiene Laboratory. In addition, there are 15 assistant labour inspectors whose main role is to visit workplaces to check working conditions; safety and occupational hygiene, and to instruct managers, supervisors and employees on the safety and health aspects of their work.
- 180. In 1996 the Inspection Service performed 60,761 inspections of workplaces: more than half of the visits were in industry and workshops, about 15,700 of the inspections were made on building sites, while the rest were at agricultural workplaces, harbours, gas and oil storage facilities, etc. The inspectors carried out 957 investigations of work accidents and cases of occupational disease. The Industrial Hygiene Laboratory performed 3,204 environmental tests in places of work measuring the levels of hazardous materials such as dust, gases and fumes in the air inhaled by workers. Other tests were performed to measure the levels of noise, temperature and other environmental factors.
- 181. There is a serious problem with traditional health and safety inspection techniques, because of the inability to supervise all places of work with the limited staff available. An inspector today has to check and inspect some 1,000 workplaces, a task which is virtually impossible to carry out in full. As a result, the Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs is now developing a new approach as follows:

Providing the opportunity for workplaces to adopt health and safety management standards which they may maintain themselves, allowing the labour inspectors to take a supervisory "back seat" role;

Emphasizing the prevention of hazards at source by obliging manufacturers and importers to introduce only equipment and materials which meet safety and health standards;

Creating a newly revised and up-to-date information system which will enable inspectors to focus their resources in areas needing priority attention. This information system will also be shared with other institutions like the Institute for Safety and Industrial Hygiene (see below) in deciding upon policy.

The Institute for Safety and Hygiene

182. The Labor Inspection (Organization) Law 1954 also created a specialized public corporation - the Institute for Safety and Hygiene. This institute is legally autonomous from the State but is under the ministerial responsibility of the Minister of Labor and Social Affairs. Its roles are to conduct courses and activities aimed at heightening safety awareness and to carrying out research and publishing its findings.

Private regulatory bodies

- 183. The law also mandates the occupiers of workplaces of more than 50 workers to appoint safety officers, who must be authorized by the Inspection Service. These officers have an important role. Their duty is to use their professional skills and knowledge to promote safety issues in workplaces. They have the legal power to stop any work, machine or process in the workplace if it creates an immediate danger to a worker.
- 184. The law also mandates the establishing of safety committees in workplaces with 25 employees or more. The duties of these committees are: to clarify causes and circumstances of work accidents; to propose measures for their prevention; to recommend improvements and to advise regarding safety regulations.
- 185. In addition, the employer has to provide all workers with updated information about hazards that exist in the workplace, and to instruct them on how to perform their work safely and to avoid occupational hazards. Furthermore, in every workplace with 50 employees or more a safety programme has to be prepared which includes a timetable to perform all changes and improvements needed to raise the level of safety in the workplace and maintain the workplace with minimum risk to workers.
- 186. All workers in the State of Israel are included in the existing protective schemes provided by law and benefit equally from them.

Data on work injuries, fatalities and injury compensation

187. The following table relates to work injuries in the State of Israel from 1992 to 1996:

Year	Number of injuries	Number of workers	Incidence (%)
1992	74 213	1 650 200	4.50
1993	74 701	1 846 900	4.04
1994	81 179	1 969 200	4.12
1995	84 884	2 093 000	4.05
1996	92 140	2 133 700	4.31

188. The following table relates to fatalities from work accidents 1995/1996:

Sector	1996	8	1995	ole Ole
Industry	22	25	24	30
Building	49	55	40	49
Agriculture	5	6	5	6
Quarries	1	1	1	1
Ports	1	1	0	0
Trains	1	1	0	0
Other	10	11	11	14
Total	89	100	81	100

189. The following statistics relate to the number of people receiving injury compensation in 1996 according to branches of work:

Agriculture, forest, fishing 5 050 6.2%
Industry, small industry 26 200 32.0%
Building 10 634 13.0%
Electricity, water 1 013 1.2%
Commerce, finance 7 827 9.6%
Transportation, communication 5 791 7.1%
Services 24 455 29.9%
Other 886 1.1%

(including Palestinian workers and foreign workers)

190. The following information relates to injury compensation in 1996 according to sex and age:

	Total	-17	18-24	25-34	35-44	45-54	55-60	61-64	65+
Total	92 274	793	13 550	24 428	22 892	18 605	7 187	2 833	1 986
%	100	0.86	14.68	26.47	24.81	20.16	7.79	3.07	2.15
Males	73 599	718	11 284	20 655	18 332	13 646	5 105	2 268	1 591
%	100	0.98	15.33	28.06	24.91	18.54	6.94	3.08	2.16
Females	18 675	75	2 266	3 773	4 560	4 959	2 082	565	395
%	100	0.4	12.13	20.2	24.42	26.55	11.15	3.03	2.12

More detailed data are not available and will hopefully be provided in the next report under the Covenant.

Equal opportunity for promotion

- 191. The Equal Employment Opportunities Law, 1988 prohibits discrimination in the area of promotion. This law was discussed above in the context of the right to work. There are only a few additions that need to be made here.
- 192. The first landmark decision in Israel on the issue of discrimination at work, given by the National Labor Court in 1974, dealt directly with the issue of promotion. In the absence of an immediate statutory source, the Court based its reasoning on the illegality of a collective contract contradicting public policy, discrimination being seen as such a contradiction.
- 193. Promotion rights are primarily found in collective agreements. Consequently, equality of opportunity in promotion remains a question of non-discrimination in collective agreements. Factual data are hard to gather on such matters.
- 194. Finally, equal opportunity in promotion should be indirectly enhanced by the development of "job analysis", which is developing for the sake of claims under the Female and Male Workers Equal Pay Law, 1996. This should be so because opportunities for promotion are obviously dependent on the jobs available, which are in turn dependent on the job descriptions considered relevant by the employer. Using job analysis should widen the range of factors to be considered in granting promotion and make it more difficult for employers to discriminate in promoting workers.

Rest and leisure

- 195. Rest and leisure-related rights are secured in Israel on two levels: several protective laws define binding minimum standards; additional rights stem from collective agreements and sometimes from extension orders.
- 196. The Hours of Work and Rest Law 1951 defines the length of the working day, the working week, weekly rest and work breaks (see full text in annex A to this report). It sets the procedure for employing workers beyond the quota of hours provided for in the law or during the weekly rest, including the compensation to be paid for such overtime work. Breach of this law is grounds for a civil suit by the employee, and in some instances constitutes a criminal offence of the employer. In addition, the law provides the Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs with various powers, mainly for supervision, inspection and the issuance of exceptional work permits.
- 197. The Annual Leave Law 1951 defines the right to annual leave and its duration, as well as remuneration during such leave (see full text in annex A to this report). It also covers such issues as the amount of leave that may be accumulated and the limitation period for bringing actions to court under the law. The law also includes criminal and regulatory provisions similar to those of the Work and Rest Hours Law 1951.
- 198. Collective agreements commonly grant more generous rights than those laid down by the above two laws and extension orders are commonly issued. As a result, for about 80 per cent of workers these statutes are of little importance.
- 199. A shift took place in Israel between 1995 and 1997 from a six to a five day working week. This shift is one of the best examples of the importance of collective bargaining. A general collective agreement was first reached in 1995 at the national level by the most representative organizations of employees and of employers. This agreement was a year later extended to the vast majority of workers in Israel. Accordingly, the maximum "working week" for most workers went down, firstly to 45 hours a week and, as from 1 July 1997, to 43 hours. The legislator then amended the law in 1997 so that the maximum "working week" was set to 45 hours a week (instead of 47 hours).
- 200. Neither of the above laws applies to all employees. Each law specifies certain types of workers excluded from coverage (section 30 (a) of the Hours of Work and Rest Law 1951 and section 35 (a) of the Annual Leave Law 1951). But none of the categories is based on discrimination. The exclusions stem from the characteristics of specific sorts of employment, not from personal characteristics of the employee.
- 201. A distinction between Jews and non-Jews is made in the Hours of Work and Rest Law 1951, which requires explanation. For Jews, weekly rest must include Saturday the Jewish religious rest day (Sabbath), whereas for non-Jews it must include either Friday, Saturday or Sunday, according to the worker's custom (sect. 7). The Israeli courts have explained this difference by noting the two objects of the law: one, social to protect workers' health by providing for rest the other being to conserve the Jewish people's heritage and to respect the religious feelings of broad parts of the population. One should bear in mind that a large number of non-religious Jews still define themselves as "traditionalist" and cherish the fact that Sabbath is a common special day.
- 202. In addition to the above laws, below are the laws enumerating the public holidays employees are entitled to without pay deduction:
- (a) Religious holidays of members of the Jewish, Muslim, Christian and Druze communities in Israel;
- (b) Independence Day;
- (c) Election Day.
- 203. The employers' obligation to pay workers for public holidays is stipulated in the collective bargaining agreements for each economic sector.

Article 8 - Collective labour rights

Related international conventions binding Israel

- 204. Israel has been a party to the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights since 1991. Israel's initial report is to be submitted this year.
- 205. Israel has been a party to the ILO Freedom of Association and Protection of the Right to Organize Convention, 1948 (No. 87), since 1957; the last report relates to the years 1992-1993.
- 206. Israel has been a party to the ILO Right to Organize and Collective Bargaining Convention, 1949 (No. 98), since 1957; the last report relates to the years 1993-1994.
- 207. As already mentioned, the ILO standards have had and still retain tremendous influence on the shape of Israeli labour law. This is even more so as far as collective labour law is concerned. In the first place, a central statute in this field, the Collective Agreements Law 1957, was deliberately drafted so as to comply with the ILO Convention No. 98. Secondly, important issues in this field are not covered by legislation but by judicial precedents, which have always been primarily influenced by ILO conventions and standards.

Formation of trade unions and membership

208. While trade unions in Israel have statutory status and powers (described below), there is no law regulating their formation and the conditions for joining them. Nevertheless, the right to organize in trade unions is recognized by Israeli courts as a fundamental principle, whether as part of the civil right to organize or as a specific worker's right. As the High Court of Justice stated in a recent landmark case:

"The right of association is 'one of the human liberties' [cite omitted], and it is deeply entrenched and well protected in the jurisprudence [cite omitted]. This is so in general, and also in respect of the right to organize in a trade union [cite omitted] ... Indeed, in Israel too, workers of all kinds are entitled to establish an organization of their choice, without any prior authorization requirement.

"The right to freedom of association, and its various components, is not written in a code of legislative acts. This right was recognized in two international labour conventions ... Those treaties were not incorporated into Israeli law. Nevertheless, the trend to reconcile domestic law and the State's international obligations as undertaken in treaties, has led to the recognition that 'according to the international labour law which is binding in Israel, the right of workers to organize is ensured' [cite omitted]. In light of the essence of this right, it can be said that 'the freedom of Israeli workers to form trade associations is one of the fundamental bases of our democratic society ... and the Court has been and will continue to be diliquent in securing its existence and giving optimal meaning and validity to its protection' [cite omitted]. It should be noted, that not long ago it was proposed that the right to organize in trade unions be incorporated in the draft Basic Law: Societion's Bill, and thereby accord it a constitutional status ... Although this proposed legislation was not adopted, the status of freedom of association as a fundamental

principle of the system was not impaired."

H.C. 7029/95 The New General Workers' Histadrut v. The National Labour Court, Amit et al., Takdin-Supreme vol. 97 (1), 38, pp. 51 and 89-90.

209. The right thus includes the right to form a union, the freedom of operation of a union, and the right to freely join a union, including the right not to join one.

- 210. As a general rule, any group of workers can form a labour union, but for this union to have legal power it must meet the recognized characteristics of a workers' organization and it must be representative.
- 211. The Labour Courts have developed a significant set of tests for the identification of an organization as a trade union:

Stability: the organization needs to be created with no time limit or for a long period, not for a particular bargaining session;

By-laws: the organization has to have by-laws regulating its aims, its institutions and their power, conditions for membership, and the like;

Personal and voluntary membership: a trade union must be based on the personal and free consent of workers to accept membership. This applies to becoming a member as well as to forfeiting membership;

Workers' representation: the vast majority of members have to be employees;

<u>Aims</u>: the organization's aims have to be first and foremost collective bargaining with the employer for the purpose of fixing working conditions and workers' rights within collective agreements;

ce: a trade union has to be independent from the employer and free to operate without external intervention;

Internal democracy: a trade union has to respect minimal democratic principles such as periodic, free and equal elections of representatives, with the participation of all member workers, public accountability of representatives, freedom of speech of workers and principles of non_discrimination.

Incorporation: there is no requirement to be formally incorporated.

212. Representation requirements are defined in the Collective Agreements Law 1957 according to the type of agreement (see full text in annex A to this report). Section 2 of this law distinguishes between a "special collective agreement", which relates to a particular undertaking or employer, and a "general collective agreement", which relates to branches of employment in the whole country or in a particular area. For both types, the basis of representation is the "greatest number of organized employees to whom the agreement is to apply"; for a "general" agreement, representation (i.e. by a special decision by workers), but the organization must represent not less than one third of the total number of employees to whom the agreement is tapply (see sections 3 and 4 of the Law).

Number and structure of trade unions in Israel

(i) The Histadrut

- 213. There exist in Israel a relatively large number of trade unions. The most prominent is the General Federation of Labor Histadrut. It was created in 1920, long before the creation of the State. Its name was then the General Federation of Jewish Workers in Israel and it was changed in 1966, reflecting the fact that the Histadrut had become representative of all workers, including non-Jews. In 1996 it was renamed again The New Histadrut, reflecting a change in leadership. According to the by-laws, any worker aged 18 or over who is not a member of another labour organization may become a member. In fact, Histadrut membership extends across a broad spectrum: production workers and clerks, blue and white collar workers, urban and rural workers, academicians and unskilled labourers, retired persons and students, Jews and non-Jews, men and women, and so on.
- 214. The Histadrut's highest legislative institution is its National Conference, whose candidates are elected in proportional and secret elections on the basis of political party lists. The main Israeli parties are represented. The Labour Party retained its majority until 1994, when it had to enter a coalition with a new list that had taken over. The Secretary-General has always been a Labour Knesset member, except for a period of about two years between 1994 and 1996.
- 215. Histadrut's activities traditionally aim to be of a holistic nature, including trade union, social security and mutual aid, labour economy, culture and education. However, trade union activities are today undoubtedly the most important. These are conducted according to the Histadrut by-laws on three levels: the workers' committee in every plant which represents all workers in the plant; a local or regional worker's council representing the Histadrut at the local level; and the national union, which is organized by profession, occupation or industry. There are 37 national unions operating under the Histadrut umbrella. Each national union is empowered to sign collective agreements on behalf of the Histadrut.
- 216. The vast majority of Israeli employees belong to the Histadrut. Up until 1995 membership in the Histadrut was linked with membership in the General Health Fund, the main provider of health services in the country, which is affiliated to the Histadrut. As a result there were many members who were not workers and a portion of the General Health Fund was transferred to the Histadrut. This link was severed in 1995 when a new National Health Insurance Law remodelled the system of funding of health providers in Israel, resulting in a certain cut in the Histadrut membership. There is no doubt, however, that the Histadrut still remains the largest and most representative workers' organization Exact membership numbers are no longer disclosed by the Histadrut.
- 217. The prominence of the Histadrut gives it a special status. General collective agreements between the Histadrut and the Coordinating Council of the Economic Organizations (relating to the private sector) or between the Histadrut and the Government (relating to the public sector) are the most influential instruments shaping labour relations and working conditions in Israel today, especially when extended by extension order. Examples of the sort can even be found in various parts of this report, as with regard to "wage fixing" and the "cost-of-living increment", or the shortening of the "working week". A dramatic illustration of the importance of this instrument was in 1985, when the inflation rate had got out of control, reaching around 400 per cent annually, and an emergency economic plan was badly needed. An economic package was eventually finalized at the highest level on a tripartite basis between the Finance Minister, the Secretary General of the Histadrut and the Chairman of the Coordinating Council of the Economic Organizations. This deal is considered to have greatly contributed to saving the Israeli economy.
- (ii) Labour organizations other than the Histadrut
- 218. Some of the free professions are organized within the Histadrut, but a few others are organized in independent trade unions: the Medical Federation, the Journalists' Union, the High School Teachers' Union and the University Teachers' Union. Some unions, although organized within the Histadrut, enjoy a high degree of autonomy, such as the Union of Engineers and Architects.
- 219. Other unions in Israel are of a general character, like the Histadrut, but with far fewer members and less political and social influence. The differences between them and the Histadrut are ideological. The largest such organization is the National Workers' Federation, which offers a more nationalist platform than the somewhat socialist one of the Histadrut. It does not publish numerical information on its membership and usually has not been successful in becoming the representative organization in places of employment. There also exist a few small labour organizations of religious orientation. These organizations have never really competed with the Histadrut, but have come to agreements with it, granting them representation in delimited places of employment.
- 220. Although one can doubt the significance of the role played by non Histadrut labour organizations in shaping Israeli labour relations, their continued existence does attest to the reality of freedom of formation and operation of trade unions. Furthermore, national unions within the Histadrut have sometimes threatened to step out and gain independence, affirming their legal right to do so. This aspect of trade unions' rights has had its influence on the Histadrut itself.

Individual freedom to join a trade union

221. No employee in Israel can be forced to join a labour organization. This clearly derives from the norm mentioned above, according to which "voluntary membership" is an inherent characteristic of a labour union. This was stated by the Labour Court on various occasions such as the following:

"Whereas 'freedom of association' is directed, essentially, towards the relevant public, the 'right to associate' is directed at the individual. The 'right to associate' ensures that the individual is always able to join an organization of his choice."
1975/5-1 Markovitz Leon et al. v. Histadrut, PDA 6, 197.

222. As to the meaning of "voluntary membership" the court has made it clear -

"Voluntarism in our context means that membership in the association is the result of the will of the person in question; if he so chooses - he may join the association; if he so chooses - he may leave it. The answer to the question whether membership in an association is voluntary may be found in its code." if he so chooses - he may leave it. The answer to the question whether member 1982/5-2 <u>Histadrut v. The Paz Senior Workers' Association</u>, PDA 14, 367, 385.

- 223. Collective agreements in Israel also reflect this principle. These commonly set arrangements of the "agency shop" type: the employer recognizes the labour organization with which the agreement is made as his or her counterpart for collective bargaining, and agrees that collective agreements with this organization should apply to all workers employed by him or her. But in contrast to "closed shop" arrangements, according to which the employer undertakes not to hire employees who do not join the labour organization with which the agreement was made, "agency shop" arrangements leave the individual workers the choice whether to join the union or not. However, this arrangement requires employees who choose not to be members of a union to pay a "trade union service fee".
- 224. The said service fee, which is lower than the membership fee and does not confer membership rights or duties, is considered a fair contribution in return for services. One should remember that collective agreements can only add to the workers' rights and may apply also to workers who are not members of the union but who are employed at the workplace covered by the agreement. The trade union service fee gained statutory recognition in 1964, when the Wages Protection Law 1958 was amended to include "trade union service fees" among the permissible deductions from a worker's wages.
- 225. The legitimacy of "closed shop" arrangements was dealt with in brief by the Labour Court in a relatively recent case.

Freedom of operation of trade unions

226. Labour unions in Israel are free to formulate their constitutions without any interference on the part of the State. This basic principle is clearly recognized by the

Labour Court:

"One of the elements of 'freedom of association' is the right of the organization to make its own constitution, in accordance with the laws of the State, as long as such laws are not contradictory to the principle of freedom of association." 1975/5-1 Markovitz Leon et al. v. Histadrut, PDA 6, 197.

- 227. Freedom to organize goes with its accompanying rights; these together make up the civil liberties necessary to the continuous and routine operation of trade union activities, such as personal freedom, protection from arbitrary arrest or imprisonment, freedom of expression and so on. Labour organizations have always enjoyed such liberties in Israel, and their application to labour relations is taken for granted.
- 228. A union's freedom also means autonomy in collective bargaining. This would have no meaning without collective agreements being granted recognition. The Collective Agreements Law 1957 not only recognizes collective agreements and grants them the power to determine workers' rights, it also keeps to a minimum the possibility for State interference. Thus, to be recognized a collective agreement need only be filed for registration, the registrar having no discretion on the matter. Furthermore, a claim with regard to representation can only be initiated by another employees' organization (art. 6 of the Collective Agreement Law 1957).
- 229. Nevertheless, since collective agreements have the effect of law for the workers to whom they apply, commonly recognized restrictive principles apply. Although the content of a collective agreement is left to the parties to define, it is not allowed to contravene the law or fundamental public interests. In this spirit, the Labour Court decided that principles of regular contracts law in Israel such as the duty of "good faith" in negotiations or the various grounds for nullity of contracts apply to collective bargaining and agreements. The doctrine of "fair representation" is applied as well.

The right to strike

The status of the right to strike

230. The right to strike as such is not regulated by an explicit legal provision, however, it is uncontested that such a right exists under Israeli law. On countless occasions the Labour Courts and ordinary courts of Israel have recognized explicitly or implicitly the right of workers to strike as a basic liberty. In a landmark case, the Supreme Court of Israel analysed the status of the right to strike:

"The statutory law in Israel does not include a specific provision granting workers the right to strike, but the issue of striking is mentioned in many legislative acts ... [list of provisions omitted]. Despite the lack of a positive legislative provision concerning the 'right' to strike, its existence has been recognized by the Labour Courts and the ordinary courts. In Case 31/4-4 [Labour Court cite omitted], it was stated that 'the view that participation in a strike suspends the labour contract, and does not constitute a breach of contract is derived from the right to strike, and although in Israel this right is not explicitly provided for in a legislative act, it arises from the ILO Right to Organize and Collective Bargaining Convention, ratified by Israel, and is supported by the various provisions in labour laws' [additional citations omitted]. In C.A. 573/68, P.D. vol. 23 (1), 516, the Supreme Court (opinion of Judge Berenson) recognized the legality of a strike which 'conformed with and was legal under tort laws'. In C.A. 25/71, P.D. vol. 25 (1) 129, 131, Judge H. Cohen wrote the following: 'It can be said that nothing could be further from the Israeli legislator's mind than the intent to abolish the institution of strikes: if one of the English judges referred in a recent judgement to the right to strike as a "sacred cow", we should consider it at least a sacred tradition which can no longer be doubted.' In C.S.A. 1, 2/86, P.D. vol. 40 (2) 406, 415, [Supreme Court] President Shamgar held that Article 19 of the Collective Agreements Law, 1957 is designed to protect the right to strike. Consequently, it can be said that the 'right' to strike has gained a strong position in Israeli legislation and case law."

(A. 593/81 Ashdod Car Factories Ltd. v. Chizik, P.D. vol. 41 (3) 169, 191.

- 231. In parallel, the courts have recognized as a corollary of the right to strike the employer's right to order a lock-out. However, such action on the part of the employer can only be taken as a defensive measure (i.e., as a reaction to a strike) and must be proportional in its effect to the measures taken by the employees.
- 232. The already mentioned Basic Law: Social Rights Bill addresses the right to strike (in art. 5). Its adoption would build upon the existing recognition of the right to strike and afford it additional constitutional protection, thus securing not only the status of this right but also its scope. Such protection is needed to counter the possible restrictive effects of the existing Basic Laws which gave constitutional status to the rights to property and to freedom of contract.

The content of the right to strike

233. The term "strike" has been defined by judicial precedents. A strike is basically a collective measure applied in the context of a labour dispute between recognized parties. Even though protection is given to the individual employee, the exercise of this right is not left in his hands but to the recognized party to a labour dispute - his or her labour organization. Or, in the wording of the Settlement of Labour Disputes Law 1957 (art. 3):

"In a labour dispute between the employer and his employees or some of his employees, the parties to the dispute are the employer and the labour organization representing most of the employees affected by the dispute, and in the absence of such a labour organization, the representatives elected by most of these employees, whether for general matters or for the specific labour dispute."

- 234. The right to strike is implemented in Israel by granting special protection to workers and their organizations when going on strike:
- (a) First and foremost, participation in a strike shall not be considered a breach of individual labour contract, including individual obligations under a collective agreement (art. 19 of the Collective Agreements Law 1957). The strike only suspends the labour contract, but does not provide legal justification for its termination;
- (b) Second, a strike does not constitute a breach of contract for the purposes of presenting a tort claim for "causing a breach of contract" (art. 62 (b) of the Torts Ordinance (Revised Version));
- (c) A strike does not interrupt continuity in employment for the purposes of calculating benefits under the various protective labour laws, such as pension (art. 3 (2) of the Public Service (Pensions) Law (Consolidated Version) 1970), severance compensation (art. 2 (6) of the Severance Pay Law 1963), annual leave (art. 4 (4) Annual Leave Law 1951), rights of veterans (art. 4 (b) of the Discharged Soldiers Reinstatement Law 1949) and soldiers in reserve service (art. 7 (c)(3) of the Reserve Service (Benefits) Law 1952);
- (d) A strike regarded as legitimate by the courts will not give grounds for an injunction against the strikers' union, and no relief will be granted in favour of a party to a strike who acts unlawfully or in bad faith. The courts are guided in this regard by general principles as well as by the Settlement of Labour Disputes Law 1957. This law places limitations on strikes (described below), hence supporting the view that strikes that meet those conditions are legitimate.
- (e) Lastly, the Employment Service may not interfere with strikes, and is prohibited from referring potential employees to replace workers on strike (art. 44 of the Employment Service Law 1959).

Restrictions placed on the right to strike

235. The right to strike in Israel is not unlimited, and certain restrictions have been recognized by the courts based on various sources - legislation, labour organizations' by-laws, collective agreements - and with the guidance of ILO standards. It should be noted that similar restrictions, created by all three alternative sources of law, apply with regard to lock-outs.

(i) Restrictions in legislation

236. Article 5 A of the Settlement of Labour Disputes Law 1957 imposes a technical prerequisite on the right to strike:

"Notwithstanding Article 5, a party to a dispute must give notice [of dispute] to the other party and to the chief official, on every strike or lock out, whichever is relevant, at least fifteen days before their initiation."

This provision has been explained by the Supreme Court as introducing a compulsory "cooling off" period designed to enable the parties to the dispute to resolve their

- 237. The Labour Courts have placed a broad construction on this provision and required prior notice in a range of partial work sanctions such as slow-downs, refusal to work overtime and partial strikes. In the public sector, failure to serve notice would automatically lead to the classification of the strike as unprotected.
- 238. Article 37 A and B of the Labour Dispute Settlement Law 1957 provides that a strike in the public sector which takes place within the duration of a collective agreement (with the exception of a strike unrelated to wages or social conditions, approved by a qualified labour union), or in the absence of such agreement and not authorized by the qualified labour union organs, will be classified as an unprotected strike.
- 239. The classification of a strike as unprotected does not necessarily imply that it is also unlawful, but such determination will result in the loss of some of the privileges accorded to participants in a lawful and protected strike.
- 240. Article 37 A of the Labour Dispute Settlement Law 1957 permits political strikes (i.e. strikes unrelated to wages or social conditions) in the public sector, even during the life of the collective agreement, on condition that they are approved by the qualified union organ. No similar provision can be found with regard to the private sector. Thus, no strike will be recognized as lawful in that sector during the life of a collective agreement.

(ii) Restrictions in union by-laws

241. The labour unions have voluntarily provided, in their constitutive instruments and other by-laws, for certain procedures to be complied with in every case a strike is to be called. For instance, the constitution of the Histadrut lays down a system of consultations and voting procedures involving the national union representatives, the local workers' committees and the Histadrut Workers' Council. Failure to comply with these procedures would lead to the classification of the strike as an unlawful (or a "wildcat") carrier.

(iii) Restrictions in collective agreements

242. In many collective agreements a provision prohibiting strikes for their duration can be found. Furthermore, the Labour Courts have held that an implicit presumption of non-strike obligation can be found in any collective agreement. In addition, any difference pertaining to the implementation of the agreement should be resolved through the mechanisms provided for in the agreement, or, in their absence, through the Labour Courts. Thus, unless there is some indication to the contrary in the agreement itself, strikes conducted during the life of a collective agreement are unlawful. This line of decisions of the Labour Courts has been significantly narrowed by the Supreme Court, which has held that the obligation not to strike is valid only if the other party keeps his or her obligations under the agreement.

243. The main restriction imposed by the Courts on the right to strike stems from a Supreme Court decision that the immunity granted under article 62 of the Torts Ordinance (Revised Version), dealing with the tort of "causing a breach of contract", does not extend to encompass other torts. Consequently, strikers can be held liable under several wrongs, such as negligence, trespassing, misappropriation of personal property and nuisance. This decision implies that the right to strike can only be applied subject to the non-commission of a tort vis-à-vis third parties.

244. Another limitation involves the purpose of the strike. A strike cannot be considered lawful if it has nothing to do with labour relations. Hence, a political protest can only lead to a short protest strike. The exact definition of "political strike" in this sense is rather dynamic and hard to grasp.

- 245. Additional restrictions apply to unprotected strikes in the Public Sector:
- (a) The Employment Service may send replacement workers to substitute the strikers;
- (b) A strike can be deemed a breach of the collective employment agreement;
- (c) Immunity under article 62 of the Tort Ordinance (Revised Version) is lost (but only vis-à-vis the direct parties to the labour dispute).

Statistics on strikes in Israel

246. The following figures amply demonstrate the frequent use made of the right to strike by employees in Israel and of employers' lock-outs.

Γ				
Year	No. of slow-downs	No. of strikes and lock-outs (excluding slow-downs)	No. of persons involved in strikes and lock-outs	Work days lost
1960		135	14 420	49 368
1965		288	90 210	207 561
1970		163	114 941	390 260
1971		169	88 265	178 621
1972		168	87 309	236 058
1973	54	96	122 348	375 023
1974	49	71	27 141	51 333
1975	62	117	114 091	164 509
1976	76	123	114 970	308 214
1977	57	126	194 297	416 256
1978	55	85	224 354	1 071 961
1979	97	117	250 420	539 162
1980	54	84	91 451	216 516
1981	59	90	315 346	782 305
1982	79	112	838 700	1 814 945
1983	47	93	188 305	977 698
1984	74	149	528 638	995 494
1985	64	131	473 956	540 232
1986	92	142	215 227	406 292
1987	89	174	814 501	995 546
1988	93	156	327 193	516 071
1989	58	120	209 841	234 073
1990	75	117	571 172	1 071 279
1991	52	77	38 776	97 923
1992	64	114	211 833	386 658
1993	40	73	462 208	1 636 866
1994	38	75	106 047	792 533

The armed forces, the police and the administration of the State

- 247. Any group of workers can form a trade union, with a few exceptions. Members of the police force are prohibited by law from creating an organization of their own, but they are allowed to join regular trade unions. Judges traditionally do not consider themselves ethically free to organize, even though there is no statutory provision on the matter. In any case, the courts have ruled that the status of judges is a special one, and that they are not "employees". Civil servants, on the other hand, are under no limitation whatsoever to organize and they have done so.
- 248. Furthermore, the courts have held that in circumstances where the exercise of the right to strike would cause detriment to another vital interest in an irreconcilable way, the right to strike may be restricted. Thus, soldiers and policemen cannot strike.
- 249. Regarding civil servants, the right to strike may be restricted for "indispensable" workers in specific key positions, who perform crucial tasks for the safeguard of vital public interests (i.e. certain medical functions, vital social services, supply of vital public commodities, and so on). Use of governmental emergency powers is then made to order individual workers to stay at work. Breach of such orders can be sanctioned by penal law.
- 250. It should be stressed, however, that the use of emergency orders is dependent upon specific approval by the Cabinet. Furthermore, according to the Attorney-General's Directives, consultation with the Attorney-General's office is also required, and each individual order to be issued is then checked.

Article 9 - The right to social security

Related international conventions binding Israel

- 251. Israel is a party to the ILO Social Security (Minimum Standards) Convention, 1952 (No. 102) and regularly submits reports to the advisory committee on the measures taken to give effect to the provisions of the Convention. Its last report relates to the years 1992-1995.
- 252. Israel is also a party to the ILO Maintenance of Migrants' Pension Rights Convention (No. 48) since 1963; the last report covers the years 1979-1982.
- 253. In addition, since 1965 Israel is a party to the ILO Equality of Treatment (Social Security) Convention (No. 118); Israel's last report covers the years 1991-1993.

Social security branches in Israel

254. Most social security schemes in Israel are public and regulated by the National Security Law (Revised) 1995. The full text of this comprehensive law is attached in annex

2 to this report. The Law combines two kinds of arrangements: insurance-based rights, proportionate to the premiums paid; and arrangements aimed at assisting people in need. The Supreme Court declared the social purpose of this central piece of legislation as follows:

"The purpose is to guarantee sufficient living resources to the insured, their dependants and their survivors, every time their income decreases or disappears due to one of the reasons enumerated in the law, such as injury on the job, unemployment, birth, death, etc."

C.A. 255/77 The National Insurance Institute v. Almohar, P.D. vol. 29 (1) 11, 13-14.

255. The following branches of social security exist in Israel and are administered by the National Insurance Institute (hereinafter "NII"): maternity benefits; old-age benefits; disability (invalidity) benefits; survivors' benefits; work (employment) injury benefits; unemployment benefits; child allowances (family benefits). In addition, the NII is responsible for administering the following benefits and compensations: long-term care, mobility, income maintenance support, accident injury, rights of volunteers, hostile action casualties, violence in family, "Prisoners of Zion", "Righteous Gentiles", reserve duty service, insurance of employees of bankrupt and liquidated firms, guarantee of alimony payments and others.

256. The NII is also responsible both for collection and distribution of insurance premiums in relation to health services, according to the National Health Insurance Law which came into effect in January 1995. (Full account on this topic is provided under article 12 of this report.)

Maternity benefits

- (i) Coverage
- 257. The following benefits are granted:
- (a) Hospitalization grant, maternity grant and birth allowance to:
 - (i) Insured woman or wife of insured individual, even if she gave birth outside Israel;
 - (ii) Employee or self-employed woman working in Israel or the wife of an employee or self-employed individual working in Israel for at least six months immediately preceding the birth, even if not residents of Israel, provided she gave birth in Israel;

Paragraph (ii) above does not apply to an individual who lives in the territories or within the Palestinian Autonomy and is not an Israeli resident as defined by law;

- (b) Maternity allowance and vacation pay to:
 - (i) An employee or self-employed woman, aged 18 or over, working in Israel;
 - (ii) A woman aged 18 or over in vocational training; a woman employee working abroad under certain conditions;
- (c) Risk Pregnancy Benefit to a resident of Israel who is an employee or self-employed woman.
- (ii) Nature and level of benefits

258. The maternity grant, given to the mother in the hospital to purchase a layette for the newborn child, is paid at the following rates: 20 per cent of the average wage* for one child, 100 per cent of the average wage for twins, and an additional 50 per cent of the average wage for every additional child born in the same birth. The grant for a multiple birth is determined according to the number of children who remain alive at least seven days; if they leave the hospital before the end of the seven-day period immediately following the birth, the grant is determined according to the number of children who leave the hospital.

- 259. An adopting parent receives a grant equivalent to the maternity grant, according to the number of children under 10 years old who were adopted on the same day.
- 260. Maternity allowance is paid at a rate of 100 per cent of the average daily income of the entitled woman in the three months preceding the determining date, from which income tax and (national and health) insurance contributions are deducted.
- 261. Other benefits under maternity insurance include the birth allowance, paid for six months to a mother who gives birth to three or more children at one birth; the risk pregnancy benefit, paid to a woman who ceases work due to need for precautionary rest as a result of a risk pregnancy; and the special allowance and benefit, paid to the widower of a woman who died while giving birth or within a year of giving birth.
- * The reference is to the average wage according to the National Insurance Law, for purposes of benefits and insurance contributions. It is calculated according to a method determined in the Law, on 1 January of every year, and it is updated each time a cost-of-living compensation is paid to employees.

(iii) Method of financing

262. Financing of this branch is based on insurance premiums, or contributions (compulsory payments as percentage of wages or income), as follows:

<u>Full rate</u>	Reduced rate*	
Employee	0.60%	0.33%
Employer	0.15%	0.15%
Self-employed	0.75%	0.48%
Other insured	0.25%	0.11%
Government		
- for employee	0.10%	0.03%
- for self-employed	0.10%	-

* Employees, self_employed and insured workers who are non_workers and non_self_employed pay reduced rates of insurance contributions on the part of income which is up to half the average wage according to the National Insurance Law, beginning in January.

Old-age benefits

(i) <u>Coverage</u>

263. An Israeli resident, aged 18 or over, unless immigrated for the first time at age 60 or over, is insured for old-age benefits. A new immigrant who is not insured due to his age at the time of his immigration and who has reached pension age is eligible for a special old-age benefit. This benefit is not covered under the National Insurance Law but rather under a special agreement, and is paid at the same rate as the regular old-age pension.

264. A recent enactment which is to be gradually implemented enables a housewife whose husband is insured or a widow receiving a pension to be covered if she does not work outside the home, was born after 31 December 1930, is between the ages of 60 and 65, and is a resident of Israel. A married woman who does not work outside her home and who receives a general disability pension, as well as other individuals not covered in compulsory insurance, may insure themselves through voluntary insurance.

(ii) Coverage and nature of benefits

265. The basic old-age pension is intended to guarantee a minimum level of basic subsistence. Men aged 70 and over and women aged 65 and over are paid at a uniform rate of the average national wage, in accordance with percentages prescribed by law and according to the number of the insurees' dependants. For men aged 65-70 and women aged 60-65, payment of pension is conditional on a means test.

266. The pension rates, as percentage of the average wage, are as follows: single person - 16 per cent; couple - 24 per cent; couple with one child - 29 per cent; couple with two or more children - 34 per cent; single person with two or more children - 26 per cent. Pension payments are adjusted whenever the average wage is adjusted.

267. The dependants' increment is paid for husband or wife, and for each of the first two children of the person receiving pension on condition that they do not receive a pension themselves. Increment rates are included in the pension rates given above. A housewife is not entitled to a dependant's increment, but to the basic pension only.

268. Other increments include seniority increment (2 per cent of the pension for each year in excess of 10 years' insurance, up to a ceiling of 50 per cent of the pension), deferred retirement income (5 per cent of the pension for each year that the person - aged 65-70 for men, 60-65 for women - was not eligible for a pension because he/she has an earned income, up to a ceiling of 50 per cent of the pension) and income supplement.

(iii) Method of financing

269. The old-age and survivors' pensions are financed by insurance contributions and by government participation, as follows:

(a) <u>Insurance contributions</u>

Full rate	<u>Reduced rate</u>	
Employee	2.70%	1.46%
Employer	1.85%	1.85%
Self-employed	4.55%	2.63%

Other insured Housewife	5.42% exempt	2.63%
Government		
- for employee	0.87%	0.19%
- for self-employed	0.87%	0.079

(b) Government participation

The Government provides allocations at the rate of 15 per cent of total insurance contribution receipts, full financing of pensions to new immigrants, and financing of income

Disability benefits

(i) Eligibility

270. An Israeli resident aged 18 or over and not yet 65 (man) or 60 (woman) is eligible.

(ii) Coverage

- 271. The monthly disability pension is paid at the rate of 25 per cent of the average wage for a single person whose degree of disability is at least 75 per cent. This pension is increased by 7 per cent. For those with a lower disability degree, the pension is calculated at a rate proportionate to the disability degree. The pension is adjusted whenever the average wage is adjusted.
- 272. The dependant's increment, as a percentage of the average wage, is as follows: for dependent spouse 12.5 per cent, based on a means test; for each of the first two children 10 per cent, with an increase of 7 per cent for each additional child. The dependant's increment is also subject to a means test of the disabled person. A housewife is entitled to dependant's increment for her children only.
- 273. Other benefits under General Disability Insurance include:
- (a) Attendant's allowance: a pension equivalent to 50 per cent, 100 per cent or 150 per cent of the full individual pension is paid to the severely disabled who are dependent on the help of others for the performance of everyday tasks or who are in need of supervision;
- Survivor's grant: a one-time grant equivalent to the amount of the average wage paid to the spouse, or in the absence thereof, to the child or children of a deceased person who received a disability pension;
- Disabled child benefit: a pension equivalent to 30-120 per cent of the full individual pension, paid to assist parents with the heavy burden of caring for a disabled child at home;
- (d) Special benefit for new immigrant: similar to the attendance allowance, paid to severely disabled new immigrants.

(iii) Method of financing

274. Disability benefits are financed from insurance contributions, as follows:

<u>Full rate</u>	Reduced rate	
Employee	1.30%	0.71%
Employer	0.38%	0.38%
Self-employed	1.68%	0.95%
Other insured	1.95%	0.87%
Housewife	exempt	
Government		
- for employee	0.27%	0.09%
- for self-employed	0.27%	0.02%

Further, the State finances the special benefit for new immigrants.

Survivors' benefits

(i) Eligibility

(ii) Coverage

275. Same as for old-age benefits above, with the following exception: a married woman whose husband is insured or a widow who receives a pension, if she does not work outside her home is not covered by compulsory insurance; there is, however, an arrangement for voluntary insurance

276. The survivors' pension is paid to the survivors of a deceased insured individual at levels similar to those of the old-age pension. Pension rates (as a percentage of the average wage) are as follows:

For widow/widower with a child,

or aged 50 or above

For each child of the above 7.5% increment

For widow/widower aged 40-49 without

For children for whom the widow/widower is not eligible for an increment

10% for a single child 7.5% for each child if there is more than one child

12%

For children who have no parents or whose surviving parent permanently lives abroad

10% for each child

277. If both parents die, a child is entitled to receive two survivors' pensions by force of these two separate entitlements.

- 278. Pensions are adjusted whenever the average wage is adjusted. Increments to the pension include seniority increment and income supplement.
- (iii) Method of financing
- 279. See old-age benefits above.

Employment injury benefits

(i) Eligibility

280. Covered for employment injury benefits are the following groups: employees (except for policemen, jailers and defence employees), self-employed persons, vocational trainees, persons undergoing vocational rehabilitation, working prisoners, foreign residents (including residents of the Territories and the Autonomy, working in Israel), Israelis working abroad for an Israeli employer - under certain conditions; persons whose wages are determined by law (such as Knesset members).

- 281. The main benefits are the injury allowance and the work disability benefit (pension and grant).
- 282. The injury allowance is paid for the period of incapacity to work as a result of the work injury (work accident or occupational disease), for a maximum period of 182 days beginning from the day after the injury, calculated by day, on the basis of 75 per cent of the injured person's wages liable for insurance contributions in the quarter-year prior to the injury. The daily injury allowance has a maximum limit. Injury allowance is not paid for the first two days after the injury, unless the injured person was not capable of working for at least 12 days.
- 283. If the person becomes disabled as a result of the work injury and has a permanent disability degree of 20 per cent or over, he receives a monthly work disability pension according to the degree of medical disability, paid at a rate proportionate to the wages and degree of disability. The pension is updated according to the coat-of-living increment and according to the changes that took place in the average wage as it was on the previous 1 January. A person receiving a disability pension who belongs to a low-income group is entitled to an income supplement. Work disabled with a disability degree of 5_19 per cent receive a one-time work disability grant equivalent to "the daily injury allowance x 21 x the disability degree".
- 284. Other benefits under work injury insurance include a special grant to the disabled with difficulty in walking and benefits to dependants (widows/widowers).
- (iii) Method of financing

285. Work injury benefits are financed by insurance contributions, as follows:

ruii rate	Reduced rate	
Employee	no payment	
Employer	0.53%	0.539
Self-employed	0.53%	0.33%
Other insured	no payment	
Government		
- for employee	0.17%	0.019
- for self-employed	0.17%	0.02%

286. The Government participates in providing an income supplement to the disabled and their dependants under the Income Support Law.

Unemployment benefits

(i) Eligibility

287. An Israeli or temporary resident who is an employee between the ages of 18 and 65, and a soldier within one year of demobilization from regular service are eligible.

(ii) Nature and level of benefits

288. The daily unemployment benefit is calculated at rates determined by law, on the basis of the daily average wage of the unemployed person during the last 75 work days of the qualifying period, up to the wage ceiling that has been determined.

289. For a demobilized soldier, the rate is determined on the basis of the daily average wage, calculated as 80 per cent of half the average wage, but not more than 80 per cent of the minimum wage.

(iii) Method of financing

290. Unemployment benefits are financed from insurance contributions, as follows:

Full rate	Reduced rate	
Employee	0.15%	0.08%
Employer	0.04%	0.04%
Ministry of Defence	unemployment benefit	
to soldiers released		
from the standing army		
Government		
- for employee	0.11%	0.07%

Child allowances

- (i) <u>Eligibility</u>
- 291. All residents are covered.

(ii) <u>Coverage</u>

292. The child allowance is a monthly allowance paid to families according to the number of children in the family. The allowance rates, linked to the credit point as in the Income Tax Order, are as follows: for each of the first two children - one credit point (NIS 144 in January 1997); for the third child - 2.0 credit points; for the fifth child - 3.4 credit points; for the sixth child - 3.75 credit points; for the seventh and each additional child - 3.5 credit points.

293. The allowance rates are updated at the beginning of every fiscal year at the full rate of the previous year's rise in the Consumer Price Index, and whenever a cost-of-

294. It should be noted that until 1994 there was a Special Increment for Veterans to the children's allowance, paid to families in which one of whose members served in the Israeli Defence Forces or other security branches. In January 1994 began a process of equalization of the level of the children's allowance, irrespective of military service. In the course of this process, which continued until the beginning of 1997, the number of child-allowance points of a family that did not receive Special Increment for Veterans was gradually equalized to the number of points of a family that did receive this increment. This amendment led to a rise in the level of the children's allowance paid to about 220,000 families with three or more children.

(iii) Method of financing

295. Child allowance is financed from insurance contributions, as follows:

Full rate	Reduced rate	
Employee	no payment	
Employer	1.88%	1.88%
Self-employed	1.88%	1.18%
Other insured	2.48%	1.10%
Government	0.60%	0.04%
- for employee		
- for self-employed	0.60%	0.06%

296. The Government participates at a rate of 160 per cent of total insurance contribution receipts.

Expenditures

297. Social security benefit payments amounted in 1995 to 7.0 per cent of GNP and 12.1 per cent of the government budget, as compared with 5.3 per cent of GNP and 3.5 per cent of the government budget in 1984. The main reason for the increased share of benefit payments in both GNP and the government budget is the massive immigration to Israel from the former Soviet Union and Ethiopia, which increased the number of benefit recipients, especially recipients of old-age pensions, children's allowances and unemployment benefits, by more than 60 per cent.

Combined public and private social security schemes

298. In the 50 years since its establishment, the State of Israel has succeeded in building a comprehensive system of social protection encompassing both social insurance and social assistance programmes. The National Insurance Institute is responsible for the administration of the social insurance programmes, as well as for payment of benefits under the social assistance programme, anchored in the Income Maintenance Law, 1990.

299. The majority of the formal social security schemes provide long-term benefits, which guarantee minimum subsistence by means of a flat-rate benefit (e.g. to every elderly person, to the disabled) as well as income supplements for those with no other sources of income. Other schemes (e.g. unemployment, maternity) provide short-term benefits aimed at providing income to persons temporarily out of work, and these are paid at rates relative to previous wages. Thus, in most cases, the formal system is sufficient for providing social protection to all sectors of the population. However, a number of informal arrangements do exist regarding a number of schemes, and these will be briefly outlined below.

The pension system

300. The pension system in Israel today consists of two main tiers: the first is the formal State one, whose main function is to provide the country's citizens with basic economic protection and a minimum level of subsistence. This tier is operated by the National Insurance Institute. The second tier is intended to supplement the income of the worker and his/her family so that he/she may maintain a standard of living similar to the one he/she enjoyed when he/she worked, in terms of a defined percentage of his/her work income. This tier is operated not by the State, but by means of the voluntary public insurance arrangements of the trade unions.

301. The second tier consists mainly of insurance arrangements within seven Histadrut (General Federation of Labor) pension funds and another eight smaller pension funds, together covering over 80 per cent of employees in Israel. Such insurance arrangements are often anchored in collective work agreements between employers and employees, and guarantee pensions related to the workers' wage level. Some pension funds provide their members with additional social rights under these agreements. Some of such collective agreements are extended by extension order (this tool is described under article 8 of this report) to cover all workers in specific branches of labour. This tier also includes all civil servants and municipal employees who enjoy a budgetary pension under a special law.

302. A third, far less comprehensive tier consists of private savings which may amount to a significant share of retirement income for many individuals.

Long-term care

303. The Long-Term Care Insurance (LTCI) scheme in Israel, implemented by the NII, provides a service benefit to the elderly who are largely dependent on the help of others to perform everyday functions (dressing, eating, washing, mobility in the home, etc.). Those entitled to the benefit receive long-term care services from a basket of services defined by law, which includes: assistance of care givers in the performance of everyday functions in the home and household management, care in day_care centres for the elderly, laundry services, etc. The benefit is paid to the organization providing the services, and not directly to the elderly person.

304. This benefit was enacted in 1986 as a new chapter within the National Insurance Law (chap. 6 E). From its early stages, the purpose of this legislation was not to finance

existing formal services, but to complement the then-existing system of service provision in terms of scope and quality, as well as to enhance the family's role as primary caregiver. LTCI was viewed at the first stage of implementation as an additional element in the broader spectrum of long-term care, both institutional and non-institutional.

- 305. Research has shown that in Israel the family is the primary provider of long-term care to the elderly and is in fact the most important resource in this care. Studies show that prior to the implementation of the law in 1988, approximately 80 per cent of the elderly dependent in functional activities of daily living were receiving care from family members, while formal services provided by Government and public agencies covered a much lower proportion of the aged. The legislators of LTCI were interested in encouraging the continued provision of informal care provided by the family, and thus did not exclude from eligibility for benefit individuals who were receiving adequate care from informal sources, thus recognizing the implied costs of this informal care.
- 06. Under the law, two rates of benefit are provided: the first, equivalent to a full disability pension, or 10 hours of care per week, for an elderly person who has become ependent to a large extent on the help of others for the performance of everyday functions or who is in need of supervision, and the second rate, equivalent to 150 per cent of full disability pension, or 15 hours of care per week, for an elderly person who has become completely dependent on the help of others for the performance of everyday unctions or who is in need of constant supervision. In any event, the payment of benefit is not higher than the recompense for the actual hours of care provided.
- 307. Since the law was first implemented, hundreds of service-providers have been set up and consolidated, about half of them public non-profit organizations and half commercial profit businesses. In many cases, the hours of care covered by LTCI are not sufficient, and the elderly persons' families supplement these with additional hours of care paid for privately from their own pockets, often by the same companies. In any case, the care provided by outside help, whether it is financed totally or only partially by social security, does not take the place of the family in the care of the elderly person, but only eases its burden of care.

- 308. In 1972 the NII developed a Counselling Service for the Elderly and Pensioners within its own framework. In addition, a group of friendly home visitors was organized to visit elderly people who were unable to come themselves to the local branches of the NII in order to receive aid and advice. The service is based on the work of volunteers, themselves elderly, who belong to and are supervised by the system which supplies the welfare services, but are not tied to its formal procedures. Thus, they may act as informal mediators between the system and the needy elderly.
- 309. The aim of the service is to improve the services provided to the elderly by the NII and not to limit itself to the granting of monetary pensions only. The NII recognized the need to place an informal system of advice and mediation not connected with bureaucratic procedures at the disposal of the elderly and pensioners in order to ensure that pensioners maximize the use of their social security rights and welfare services in the community. The project proved itself, and today operates in all NII local branches throughout the country.

Equality in social security

- 310. The social security system in Israel is universal with most programmes covering all residents of the country. Social security benefits are aimed particularly at the most vulnerable and disadvantaged groups: the elderly (old-age, survivors and long-term care benefits), the disabled (general disability benefits, work disability benefits, mobility allowances), the poor (income maintenance benefits), divorced and separated women (alimony guarantee payments), children (children's allowances) and the unemployed (unemployment allowances). It may therefore be stated that there are no groups which do not enjoy the right to social security at all, or who do so to a significantly lesser degree than the majority of the population.
- 311. The Government endeavours to ensure that the right to social security, which is both inherent and explicitly guaranteed by law, is indeed enjoyed by all, and the measures it takes in this respect are detailed below. Furthermore, it reviews legislative measures to improve the situation of various sectors of the population.
- Regarding women, it should be noted that regardless of their personal status, women who work outside of their homes and who are paid for their work are entitled to all the benefits from the NII to which men of similar status are entitled.
- 313. Women, except for "housewives" (to be discussed separately), are eligible for all the benefits that are set forth in the National Insurance Law (NIL) under the same conditions as men. They are covered by work injuries insurance, vocational training, survivors' benefits, accident insurance, children's allowance, unemployment insurance, disability insurance, insurance of employee in bankrupt and liquidated firms, reserve duty benefits and long-term care insurance.
- 314. There are no distinctions in the law regarding the contributions (premiums) of men and women to the NII. The amount of contributions of each insured person is set as a percentage of the insured person's income, regardless of gender. It should be pointed out that only housewives (married women whose spouses are insured and who do not work outside their home) are exempt from contributions toward the benefits to which they are entitled to under the law.
- Housewives are not covered by all types of insurance. Housewives are not considered workers according to the NIL, and therefore are not eliqible for income-replacement and therefore are not covered by all types of insurance. Housewives are not considered workers according to the NLL, and therefore are not eligible for insurance, insurance of employees in bankruptcy, and to seniority increments to the old-age pension. Women are eligible for old-age pension from the age of 60 and men from the age of 65, subject to a means test, and from the age of 65 for women and 70 for men, regardless of income. This distinction is due to the differences in retirement age that still exist in Israel, and women have the option to retire at the age of 60. All women, including housewives, are insured by long-term care insurance, and the conditions of entitlement are identical to that of men with one distinction: the age of entitlement for women is 60 and for men 65.
- 316. Distinctions exist between housewives and all other insured persons regarding disability insurance. A housewife requires at least 50 per cent medical disability to qualify for benefits compared with 40 per cent medical disability for other insured persons.
- 317. Differences also exist between the definitions of widower and widow pertaining to survivor's benefits under work injuries insurance. A widower is defined as (i) someone who has a child living with him or (ii) is unable to support himself or (iii) whose income is not more than a determined sum. A widow is defined as someone who is (i) 40 years or over, or (ii) has a child living with her, or (iii) is unable to support herself.

- 318. NII is first and foremost concerned that the individual take full advantage of his/her social insurance rights. Every insured person who dutifully paid insurance contributions during his/her working years is entitled to receive complete and reliable information on his/her rights and to ensure they are drawn on. The NII believes that the insuring body, namely itself, is at least partly responsible for guaranteeing these rights and that it should not be left to the extent to which the individual is capable of doing so. The NII has initiated a number of activities aimed at increasing the awareness of the insured person's rights, providing the means for the person to take full advantage of his/her rights, and minimizing the bureaucratic procedures involved.
- (a) Once a year, every beneficiary receives an annual confirmation detailing the types of benefits he/she receives and the monthly sums transferred to his/her account over the past year. This confirmation is recognized by all public authorities, such as government ministries, local authorities and health funds, for purposes of granting a wide range of discounts and benefits to specific population groups; for example, discounts in urban taxes, discounts in rents in public housing, discounts in telephone fees, etc.;
- (b) Just before a man reaches the age of 65 or a woman the age of 60, he/she receives a letter in the mail informing him/her of possible rights to an old-age pension, the rules of entitlement and a claims form. This guarantees that the pension is initiated immediately upon retirement, without any unnecessary bureaucratic delay;
- (c) The family of every child born in a hospital is automatically entitled to child allowances, without the mother having to submit a claims form to the NII. This automatic registration is made possible due to an agreement signed between the NII, the Ministry of the Interior and the hospitals, according to which the hospitals inform the NII and the Ministry simultaneously of every live birth and the identifying data on the mother. This serves as a basis for including the newborn child in the children's file at the NII and for paying the allowance directly to the mother's bank account;
- (d) Many new immigrants are entitled to receive benefits, such as special old-age benefits and child allowances, from the NII immediately upon their arrival in Israel. In order to guarantee immediate commencement of rights, all the demographic information needed by the NII is received on magnetic tape directly from the data file produced at the airport. In this way, new immigrant families receive all benefits due them without having to report personally to a local branch of the NII and submit a claim;
- Information booklets on national insurance rights, including amendments in relevant laws, are published regularly in various languages, and distributed to all health and social service agencies in the community;
- Intensive use is made of the local and national press, and prime time spots are purchased on the national radio and television stations to pass on information to the public:
- Sophisticated computerized technology has been installed in each of the NII's local branches, so that every claimant can receive immediate information on the state of his/her account and on the benefits being paid him/her.
- 320. The many and varied methods used in Israel to transfer information to the public on its rights have been proven extremely effective in guaranteeing that persons take full advantage of their rights to the various benefits paid by the NII. An ongoing follow-up study carried out on this topic shows that close to 98 per cent of the entire potential population of beneficiaries receives benefits at the scope and level that they are entitled to under law. In the NII's opinion, it is impossible to ensure that 100 per cent of the population maximizes its entitlement benefits and recognizes the fact that despite all its sincere efforts, there will always remain a marginal percentage of the population that does not receive the benefits to which it is entitled. Its experience has shown that projects aimed at the full implementation of rights has led to rather disappointing results, ones certainly not justifying the high costs entailed.

Legislative measures

- 321. The following measures taken to implement rights to social security in legislation, should be noted.
- 322. <u>Momen.</u> Housewives traditionally were not entitled to old-age pensions in their own right. They were thus exempt from paying contributions to the NII, and received half of the old-age pension of their spouses. In 1996, in order to achieve greater gender equality in the social security system, the law was amended and housewives now receive the minimum old-age pension although they are still exempt from contributions. As a result, within a few years all women in Israel, regardless of their working status, will be covered by old-age insurance.
- 323. The elderly. Another vulnerable group which has received careful attention and allocation of resources in Israel are the aged, especially those who are severely dependent due to functional disability, chronic disease and cognitive impairment. The State continues to provide personal care services at home and in day centres to ever 8 per cent of its elderly population under its community Long-Term Care Insurance Law of 1988. This law provides personal care on the basis of personal entitlement, thus enabling even severely disabled elderly people to remain at home, with dignity and in familiar surroundings, as long as they are able, and reduces the burden of care borne by the family.

- 324. The poor. As part of its programme to combat poverty and income gaps, the Government raised the level of old-age pensions by 7 per cent. Various legal provisions exist for the elderly to further improve their economic situation and enhance their quality of life and participation in society by significantly subsidizing municipal taxes, public transportation and medication for low-income groups.
- 325. The underlying principle of new anti-poverty legislation in Israel has been to equalize the rights to social protection between genders and among various groups of beneficiaries having similar needs, as well as raising the minimum income quaranteed to the most vulnerable groups: the elderly and single-parent families.
- 326. In order to reduce the number of families living below the poverty line, Israel has continued to expand its Law for Reducing the Scope of Poverty and Income Gaps, aimed at increasing protection of the most vulnerable social groups. Recent legislation significantly increased benefits paid to the elderly, the disabled, as well as single-parent families. In order to reduce poverty among large families, which constitute the most at-risk poverty group in Israel, the Government has completed final steps to raise the level of its universal child allowances to large families which will include groups which previously did not have full coverage.
- 327. One of Israel's most important recent accomplishments was the implementation of a National Health Insurance Program. Since 1995 there effectively has been universal coverage based on a comprehensive basket of health services. A more equitable system of health tax has been established with especially low health insurance rates set for low wage earners and all recipients of income maintenance benefits. Low contribution rates have also been set for all elderly recipients of old-age pensions. The effectiveness of this law will be measured to a large degree by the degree of equity in the access to quality health care for poor and other marginalized groups, which will be carefully monitored during the next few years.
- 328. Further review of trends and changes in national legislation, court decisions, etc. is available in the NII's report, Summary of Developments and Trends in Social Security 1996, submitted to the International Social Security Association (ISSA).

Conclusion

- 329. Regarding measures taken to improve the lot of the vulnerable groups, it may be concluded that although we have been successful in reducing unemployment levels, pockets of high unemployment remain, especially in outlying development areas. The Government's policy is to continue allocating resources for the reduction of unemployment and poverty in these areas, thus reducing dependency on social support systems.
- 330. In order to continue Israel's war on poverty it is incumbent on policy makers not only to increase benefits but also to expand funding sources. Therefore, one important direction for policy will be the close examination of our social security system with the objective of increasing the degree of progressivity in our system, both in terms of taxes and the system of benefits targeted at the most vulnerable groups.

International cooperation and assistance

- 331. The International Labour Organization (IIO) and the ISSA provide the National Insurance Institute with a great deal of technical assistance, mainly by means of study grants abroad to senior employees of the NII. The NII, on its part, endeavours to reciprocate by assisting in guidance and instruction of workers studying abroad, particularly workers from Asia and Africa. Israel belongs to the Asian-African branch of ISSA, and within this framework participates in most regional conferences.
- 332. Furthermore, Israeli representatives regularly participate in the ISSA General Assembly meetings that take place every three years and in the technical activities of the organization by means of the various permanent committees, such as by replying to questionnaires distributed periodically.
- 333. However, the main mutual activity of Israel and ISSA is in the field of research. Israel actively participates in ISSA research conferences by preparing research papers and presenting them at almost every conference. In 1979 a research conference on the topic of "The Mutual Relationships between the Direct Taxation System and Social Insurance took place in Jerusalem in 1979, and in 1989 our capital once again hosted a research conference on the subject of long-term care services for the very old. In January 1998 we are again scheduled to host an ISSA research conference on the subject of social insurance and other social support benefits on human behaviour.
- 334. In conclusion, the cooperation between ISSA and Israel contributes considerably to both sides. The experience of other countries has helped us in the development and expansion of various social security schemes, while Israel's contribution is expressed mainly in research and distribution of research findings to other countries through ISSA. Thus, the main goal of ISSA as an international organization the promotion and development of social security in the world by means of international cooperation is realized.

Article 10 Familial rights

Related international conventions binding Israel

- 335. Israel is a party to the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women, and in May 1997 submitted its first report to the United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women.
- 336. Israel is a party to the ILO Minimum Age Convention, 1973 (No. 138). Its last report was submitted in 1996 and relates to the years 1991-1995.
- 337. Israel is a party to the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights and to the Convention on the Rights of the Child since 1991, and will soon be submitting its initial reports on both Covenants.

Meaning of "family"

The definition of the term "family" in Israeli law

- 338. The term "family" is not uniformly defined in Israeli law, and different definitions can be found in distinct acts of legislation. Depending on their legislative purpose, some acts have taken a wide encompassing approach and defined the term "family" broadly. Hence, in the Domestic Violence Prevention Law, 1991, a "family member" is defined as: "spouse, parent, or parent's spouse, spouse's parent or his or her spouse, grandfather or grandmother, child or spouse's child, brother or sister, brother-in-law or sisterin-law, uncle or aunt, cousin or niece; whoever is responsible for the living, health, education or welfare needs of a minor or incapacitated person who is living with him/her, and a minor or incapacitated person living with such a guardian". For this law's purposes there is no difference between a present and a former family member.
- 339. A similarly broad definition can be found in the Court for Family Matters Law, 1995. A person's family member is defined there as "(a) his/her spouse, including a partner for life, his/her ex-spouse, his/her spouse the marriage with whom has been annulled, provided that the subject matter of the proceedings is a consequence of the relation between them in the time period they were man and wife; (b) his/her child, including his/her spouse's child; (c) his/her parents, his/her spouse's parent or a legal guardian".
- 340. At the same time, other acts have adopted a stricter reading of the term. For example, in the National Security Law (Revised Version), 1995, a family member is considered to be only "one of the parents, a child, a grandchild, a brother or a sister". Similarly, in the Equal Employment Opportunities Law, 1988, family members are narrowly defined as "spouse, parent, child, grandchild, brother, sister or a spouse of any of those".
- 341. The approach taken by the Israeli courts in ascertaining the meaning of the term "family" or "spouse" is also a functional approach which takes into account the policy goals of the pertinent legislation or agreement. Consequently, the courts have tended in some cases to stretch the concept of family beyond traditional understanding. Thus, the Supreme Court held that a tort victim has the right to claim compensation for services received from the kibbutz (collective farm) he/she lived on, on similar terms to the right to claim for services rendered by family members:
 - "... [T]he ideological principle and social structure of the kibbutz are unique and universally incomparable ... [L]egally speaking, the structure is based upon collective equality between the individual members ... In theory and in practice, the sum of all individual members constitute one big family"

 C.A. 619/78 <u>Hunovitz v. Cohen</u>, P.D. vol. 35 (4) 281, 295-96
- 342. In another case, which dealt with the term "spouse", the Supreme Court accepted a petition of a homosexual flight attendant to enjoy a work benefit normally accorded to an employee's heterosexual "spouse":

"The desirable test should therefore examine the relevancy of the sexual orientation to the work benefit granted to the spouse. The purpose test meets this requirement. According to that test, there will not be any differentiation between a homosexual and heterosexual spouse if the companionship relations between the couple meet the standards which fulfil the purpose for which the right or benefit is being conferred ... In our matter, the flight ticket was not intended exclusively for spouses married to employees, and in any case the purpose of the benefit could not have been the encouragement of traditional family life. The benefit was granted to an employee for the spouse with whom he is sharing his life in reality. Although the (airline) did not intend to implement the arrangement on homosexual couples, the companion's sex is irrelevant to the purpose for which the benefit was given."

H.C. 721/94 Fl Al Israeli Airlines v. Danilovich, P.D. vol. 48 (5) 749, 785-86

Meaning of family in administrative practice

- 343. Many individual entitlements to social services and benefits are shaped taking into account familial recourses. By "family" one usually means in the present context the nuclear family: parents and children. But the structure of family is in a constant state of flux. On one hand, single parenthood has risen sharply in the last 10 years (1985: 54,600; 1995: 91,900) and the state of non-marital cohabitation is partly recognized by the State for purposes of social security, pension, damages awards under torts law, resident's protection against eviction, income tax regulations, and administrative or legal benefits of various sorts. On the other hand, the concept of "extended family" is used more and more, clearly including grandparents, brothers and sisters, even though it still lacks clarity in public cognition. (The status of the "tribe", for example, is scarcely considered in this context.) In short, the legitimacy of "non-traditional" family types and the dynamic nature of families now seems to be widely recognized, but concepts still have to be shaped and sharpened.
- 344. In allocating resources the Government aims to support various forms of "family", while not taking a stand on which concept of family is preferable. Some benefits exist for small single-parent families and others provide added financial assistance to those families which have four or more children. At the same time, the weakened ties with extended family are being strengthened through benefits which encourage families to provide care for their ageing relatives within their own homes.
- 345. The practical nature of allocating resources across the social spectrum, while healing the damage caused by Israel's push into modernity, is a daunting task. Nonetheless, each form of family is legitimate in the eyes of the State and is accorded a considerable degree of both social and financial support under the law.

Majority

346. Majority, for the purposes of civil law, takes place at different ages, depending upon the specific issue. For the purposes of responsibility in civil legal proceedings,

it is 18 years old. Upon reaching majority, a person may make a legal contract, sue or be sued, or carry out any other legal action or process. Prior to the age of 18, any legal action or contract entered into by a minor may be voided by his/her parent or guardian.

- Criminal liability. Generally, majority for the purpose of criminal liability is the age 12. Adolescents by the age of 18 are to be tried at a special juvenile. There are specific legal provisions for exceptional cases where a youngster may nevertheless be tried as an adult.
- 348. The right to vote. The right to vote in national and municipal elections is granted to all citizens or residents, respectively, who have reached the age of 18.
- 349. Military conscription. An individual is eligible for conscription into the Israeli Defense Forces from the day of his/her eighteenth birthday. A person aged 17½ may volunteer for the armed forces providing that his/her parents have given permission.
- Consent to marry. Women may marry without their parent's/guardian's permission from the age of 17 except for special circumstances. There is no minimum age for males. A ion of the status quo as to the age of consent for males is presently under consideration.
- 351. Legal capacity and compulsory psychiatric hospitalization. A youth aged 15 or older may appeal an order for his/her compulsory hospitalization in a psychiatric institution. In such cases, the court appoints a legal representative to present the interests of the youth during the appeal process.

Assistance to the family and its protection

The fundamental right to family life

352. The right to family life was addressed by the Supreme Court on several occasions. It has stated:

has the right to form a family and have children "Every person has the right to form a family and have children." A.C.R. 2401/95 <u>Nahmani v. Nahmani</u>, Takdin-Supreme vol. 96 (3) 526

353. The court emphasized in some of its decisions the autonomy of the family unit and its immunity from State intervention:

"In principle, the autonomy to raise a family, plan a family and give birth to children is a matter of personal privacy. Human liberty encompasses the freedom of independent choice on matters of marriage, divorce, birth and any other private matter within the personal autonomy. Judge Ben-Ito has pointed in the said C.A. 413/80 that: 'conception, pregnancy and birth are intimate events which are all included in the realm of personal privacy. The State does not interfere in that area, except for reasons of special weight related to the need to protect individual rights or a significant public interest' [cite omitted]."

"The aspiration to minimize State involvement in relations within the family unit, whether direct intervention or judicial intervention, emphasizes the unit's right to autonomy, and the protection from interference in the relations between the family and the State and between the different members of the family unit. Situations where intervention is required are normally sensitive and complex, and it is needed where a crisis in the family unit has occurred and State intervention through the courts is designed to solve problems that the parties failed to settle on their own." C.A. 5587/93 Nahmani v. Nahmani, Takdin-Supreme, vol. 95 (1) 1239, 1241.

354. Furthermore, the court recognized as a constitutional human right the right to parenthood:

"The right to become a parent is a fundamental human right to which everyone is entitled." C.A. 451/88 Anonymous v. The State of Israel, P.D. vol. 44 (1), 330, 337.

And so is the case of the right of parents to raise and educate their children, as they think best:

"The right of parents to raise and educate their children as they think best is a basic constitutional right, and a natural right which is inherent to, and stems from, the links parents have to their children. The family unit does not exist outside the constitutional system, but it is an integral part thereof. Parents are entitled, within the family unit, to exercise rights recognized and protected by constitutional law. The right of parents to have custody of their children and to raise them, with all this implies, is a natural and primary constitutional right, which gives expression to the natural connection between parents and their children [cite omitted]. This right is reflected in the privacy and autonomy that the family enjoys. Parents are autonomous in making decisions relevant to their children in the areas of education, lifestyle, residence etc. Interference on behalf of society and the State in these decisions is an exception which must be justified [cite omitted]. This approach is based upon the belief that 'the family is the basic and most ancient social unit in human history that has been, and still is, the element that facilitates and secures the continued existence of human society' [cite omitted]."

C.A. 2266/93 Doe v. Roe, P.D. vol. 49 (1) 229, 238-89.

- 355. The Marriage Age Law, 1950, states that the minimum marital age for all women in Israel is 17. No minimum age for men is set. Since the substantive law that applies in matters of marriage is derived from the individual's religious law, the minimum age for men would be drawn from religious law.
- 356. The minimum age requirement is accompanied by provisions that make the arrangement of under-age marriages a criminal offence punishable by up to two years' imprisonment. The possible offenders include the person who arranges the marriage, the person who conducts the marriage, and the marrying man himself. The under-age woman is excluded. The law also provides that the mere fact that a marriage was conducted in violation of this law is a ground for divorce.
- 357. Article 5 of the Marriage Age Law, 1950 provides for two alternative grounds for judicial permission of under-age marriage. The first one relates to circumstances in which the under-age woman is pregnant from or has given birth to the child of the man whom she asks permission to marry. No age limit at all is attached to this ground for exception. The second relates to unspecified "special circumstances" that would justify immediate marriage, provided the woman is over 16 years old. Since the legislature has left those "special circumstances" unspecified, the Supreme Court has taken it upon itself to provide instructions as to the substance of those circumstances. In one of the leading cases, then Justice Barak firmly stated that a community's custom and tradition do not justify marital exception, since it is those traditions and customs that the Marriage Age Law, 1950 was set to abolish.
- 358. Criminal sanctions contribute to the reduction of the phenomenon of marriages involving minors. However, it has not been eliminated altogether, as can be seen from the following tables, which contain data on marrial ages in Israel.

Marriage of minors up to age 17

Year	Jews			Muslims		
	Brides		Grooms	Brides		Grooms
	Up to 16	17	17	Up to 16	17	17
Average 1975-1979	12.3	48.4	1.2	19.6	133.1	2.2
Average 1985-1989	2.4	17.4	0.3	15.4	140.2	1.7
1991	0.9	13.9	0.1	10.1	179.1	0.7
1992	0.7	11.4		0.5	179.7	
1993*	0.6	10.6	0.2			

Statistics are not available for this year for Muslims.

Source: Central Bureau of Statistics.

Age	Jews	Muslims	Christians	Druze
	Grooms			
Total	26 680	7 857	795	703
Total to age 19	652	540	5	53
Up to 17	18	16		
18	166	186	5	16

19	1			
	468 Brides	338		37
Total	26 680	7 857	795	703
Total to age 19	3 258	3 845	149	386
Up to 16	27	15	4	2
17	397	1 558	28	157
18	1 147	1 207	45	117
19	1 687	1 045	72	110

- 359. Since questions of marriage and divorce are determined by religious law alone, the secular legislature cannot decree bigamous marriages invalid when such marriages are recognized by the relevant religious laws, but can only operate against them through criminal law. Section 176 of the Penal Law, 1977, makes bigamy a criminal offence punishable by five years' imprisonment. Sections 181-182 prohibit forcing divorce upon one's wife with no judicial decree of divorce, and makes the arrangement of such prohibited marriages or divorces a criminal offence. Sections 179-180 provide exceptions for the rule against bigamy. Section 180 applies to all individuals whose religious affiliation is other than Jewish, and indicates that incapacitation of one's spouse or seven years' absence therefrom may justify marriage to another person. Section 179 applies only to Jewish people, providing immunity to a person whose second marriage was permitted by a rabbinical court's judgement that underwent the specific Halachic procedure to make it religiously valid.
- 360. Since religious law accommodates bigamous marriage, further legislative intervention must be made in particular areas of law where the interests of the two wives may conflict. Such accommodations were developed in response to certain population groups who immigrated to Israel. For example, the Successions Law, 1965 specifically states (in section 146) that when a man who dies was married to two women, both of them shall share in the estate, where ordinarily the estate is given to the sole wife of the deceased.

Strengthening and protecting the family

- 361. The basic premise of the Israeli law is that the primary obligation to support the members of a family lies with the family itself. This principle is anchored in the Legal Capacity and Guardianship Law, 1962, which defines the duties of parents and guardians. As the "natural guardians" of their minor children, parents have both a statutory obligation and a right to attend to their child's needs, including education and upbringing, vocational training, and maintenance of the child's property. Their guardianship also includes the right to custody of the child and the right to represent the child. These rights have been interpreted by the Israeli courts as "the right to fulfil their obligations". (Full text of the law is attached in annex 2 to the present report.)
- 362. Nevertheless, the State recognizes its obligation to protect families whenever family members substantially fail to fulfil their responsibility. Various laws grant intervention powers to the authorities (at the municipal or national level), requiring judicial approval. These powers range from issuing specific instructions to the child's parent or guardian on how to care for the child to extracting the child from their custody and assuming responsibility for the child's care, whether temporarily or definitively in the form of an adoption order. Such main laws are the Youth (Care and Supervision) Law, 1960 and the Adoption of Children Law, 1981. (Full texts attached in annex 2 to the present report)
- 363. In addition, various Israeli penal laws prescribe criminal sanctions against parents or other primary care-givers for abandonment and neglect, assault and molestation (including physical, emotional or sexual molestation), and set grounds for the courts to issue protection orders against a violent family member in the home of either the child
- 364. The primary consideration in all the above cases involving children is "the best interests of the child". This concept lies at the core of a huge jurisprudence, too complex to be reviewed here. In general much weight is given by the courts to the professional opinion presented in written reports by welfare officers, who are trained social workers appointed under each law.
- 365. In addition to intervention powers to deal with acute crises, the Government attempts to facilitate and maintain the establishment of a family by means of various social programmes and economic benefits.
- 366. The main economic benefits granted by the State to aid families are part of the social security schemes provided by law on a universal basis to all families in Israel (these schemes are detailed in this report under article 9). Child allowances, designed to prevent a reduction in the standard of living of families that may result from the burden of raising additional children, provide tax relief and the payment of allowances through the social security system. Increments to benefit for dependent children are paid with old-age pensions, survivors' pensions, disability pensions, in the dearly. There are no situations in which families do not enjoy any benefit of assistance, or who do so to a significantly lesser degree than the majority of the population.
- 367. Special assistance to single-parent families are anchored in the Single Parent Law, 1992. (The full text of this law is attached in annex 2 to this report.) This law defines a "single parent" in broad terms applying to both women and men. The law entitles single parents to a special education grant, priority in vocational training programmes and in day-care facilities, and it raises the level of assistance in housing aid schemes. This is also provided for under the Maintenance of Income Law, 1980.
- 368. There exist other administrative programmes which aid families in need in various ways. For example, low-income working parents may apply to send their pre-school-aged children to government-supported day-care centres; the Health Ministry runs family health clinics in every city, which provide public counsellng, self-help groups, parenting classes, and primary health care for toddlers. Such programmes are based on need, whether implied in the qualification criteria of the programme or determined by means tests.
- 369. Israel also has an active voluntary sector, many of its organizations directed towards family and education-oriented projects.
- 370. There is a high level of interaction between the Government and the various voluntary bodies. The Government, in line with its policies, encourages volunteerism through support of existing voluntary organizations and involvement of volunteers in government agencies, and encourages residents to participate in the decision-making process on matters affecting their own neighbourhoods and communities.
- 371. The Government considers welfare services its responsibility, but in some service areas it relies on non-governmental organizations (NGOs) to provide welfare services as well as some of the money that is required.
- 372. Institutions for children in Israel are supervised by the Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs, under the provisions of the Supervision of Children's Institutions (Care Centers) Law, 1965. By-laws and regulations were drawn up by the Ministry regarding all aspects of the institutions' operations, e.g. structures, plant maintenance, supplies, personnel, professional services, etc. There is extensive supervision of all institutions for children up to the age of 12. All institutions, except for those for delinquent or mentally handicapped children, are run by NGOs. The institution determines the type of child it wants to receive.
- 373. An interministerial finance committee determines the level of financial support to be provided by the Government. At present, this support accounts for 85 per cent of the cost of the child in the institution. The NGOs must provide the additional 15 per cent. A special government building fund provides funding for the building of day-care centres in cooperation with the NGOs, turning them over to the municipal authority which in turn passes the centre on to the NGO for day-to-day operation. Negotiations take place annually regarding the Government's participation in child support in the day-care centres. Today the Government covers the cost of 75 per cent for each child and the NGO 55 per cent.

Equality of treatment

- 374. No sector of the population is excluded by law or administrative rule from receiving any of the above services. But many of the services available are restricted by budget, and the Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs has received complaints that the amount of resources allocated to the Jewish sector of the population outweighs the amount of money and resources presently directed at the non-Jewish sectors of the population.
- 375. Unfortunately, differential data regarding budget allocation to municipalities for social services relevant to the present Covenant are still not available.

Maternity protection

376. Labour law protection for working women is a combination of a long-standing system of benefits, provided largely through the social insurance system, for supporting mothers and their families during pregnancy, birth, and post-natal care. The result is an efficient system of maternity protection.

Maternity leave and protection of pregnant working women

- 377. The Women's Employment Law, 1954, establishes the right of a woman to take a paid 12-week maternity leave. Under special circumstances, including sickness, the birth of more than one child or the need for the baby's hospitalization, the leave may be extended. For four months following her regular maternity leave, a woman who works full-time may leave work for one hour each day without affecting her salary. In addition, this law provides for a woman's right oextend her absence from work without pay but also without concern that her employment may be terminated for an additional period which is determined by how long she was employed before the leave.
- 378. A recent amendment to the said law allows for men to take half of the 12-week maternity period in place of the mother, even if his spouse is not employed. This amendment recognizes the legitimate desire of many fathers to bond with their infants during this crucial period, the shifting burden of parenting upon the male, and the success of women and their legitimacy in the workplace.
- 379. Maternity leave is mandatory and may be taken at any point after the middle of the seventh month of pregnancy. Both men and women are allowed to take leaves of absence, characterized as sick leave, while undergoing fertility treatments. Likewise, pregnant women are entitled to paid absences from work for routine medical examinations. When high-risk pregnancy causes inability to work, the woman is entitled to her salary from the National Insurance Institute and her seniority rights are protected.
- 380. This same law ensures the woman's job security. An employer cannot terminate an employee during her pregnancy; if an employee is dismissed during her pregnancy, the employer has committed a crime and is subject to prosecution, while the worker is reinstated. If the worker has not informed her employer of her pregnancy (this is not compulsory until the fifth month) and is terminated, she will be reinstated, but the employer is not guilty of committing a crime.
- 381. The prohibition on terminating employment has an exception. The Minister of Labor and Social Affairs has the authority to grant permission to an employer if he/she is satisfied that there is no link between termination of work and maternity. The department at the Ministry charged with control powers under the Women's Employment Law also

conducts the necessary inquiries for the purpose of deciding on these permission applications.

382. While the employer is not responsible for paying an employee's salary while she is on maternity leave, the employer is legally bound to continue making payments into the employee's retirement fund and any other recognized employer-employee contribution-driven plans.

Coverage and benefits

- 383. The first benefit is free hospitalization for the baby's delivery. This hospitalization is covered as part of the basket of services in Israel's comprehensive National Health Insurance Law, 1995. The benefit is paid directly to the hospital. Costs are covered also in the event of a stillbirth.
- 384. After the baby has been born, the parents receive from the National Insurance Institute (NII) a maternity grant, to defray the costs of outfitting their home for the baby. This benefit is equal to 20 per cent of the average wage. In the event of multiple births, the sum rises significantly (see birth allowance below).
- 385. The maternity grant is paid to all residents or wives of residents, even if they gave birth outside of Israel, as well as to non-resident women working in Israel or wives of non-resident men working in Israel, provided they gave birth In Israel.
- 386. There is also a grant for adopting parents, equivalent to the maternity grant, based on the number of children under the age of 10 who were adopted on the same day.
- 387. If three or more children are delivered in the same birth, families receive a birth allowance for six months. The purpose is to alleviate the special costs incurred with multiple births. For the third child, the benefit is equal to 50 per cent of the average salary. For the fourth child, it equals 75 per cent and for the fifth (or more) it equals 100 per cent.
- 388. The maternity allowance (or vacation pay in the case of adopting parents) is paid to a working mother during her 12 weeks of legally mandated maternity leave. The benefit is equal to 100 per cent of the woman's average salary during the previous three months, up to a ceiling, and is paid by the NII. This benefit is taxed and social insurance payments are deducted.
- 389. The birth protection allowance is meant for women who, on doctor's orders, must take a leave from work of over 30 days in order to successfully bring their baby to term. This benefit, which is 25 per cent of the average wage, is paid by the NII.

History and development

- 390. Maternity insurance was embodied in 1954 in the National Insurance Law, and was one of the first divisions of the National Insurance Institute. Maternity insurance was considered of utmost importance to the welfare of the family in general and to the working mother in particular.
- 391. The changes pertaining to maternity allowance which took place between 1954 and 1995 share a clear common denominator: the widening of the circle of women entitled to maternity allowance, both by changing the calculation of the qualifying period and by changing the definition of the entitled population. The rates of the allowance were not changed until 1995, when it was increased from 75 per cent of the woman's (gross) previous wages to 100 per cent of her (net) wages.
- 392. The main changes which occurred in the maternity grant since 1954 can be summed up as follows:
- (a) 1955: the size of the maternity grant aimed at acquiring a layette in the case of a multiple birth was increased.
- (b) 1986:
- (i) Distinction was made within the maternity grant between the layette grant aimed at acquiring a layette and the hospitalization grant paid directly to the hospital, except in cases in which the birth took place in a hospital in which there was no payment arrangement with the NII (such as hospitals abroad). In such cases the mother submits receipts and is reimbursed, up to the amount of the grant determined by law. The layette grant is given as a cash payment directly to the mother by the hospital in which she gives birth;
- (ii) A method for adjusting the maternity grant was determined: 20 per cent of the average wage for purposes of benefit payments in January every year, with additional adjustments reflecting cost-of-living increments. Thus, the real value of the maternity grant is maintained and anchored in law; its adjustment is automatic and not subject to the discretion of the Minister of Labor and Social Affairs, as previously.
- 393. The birth allowance was added in 1986 within the framework of maternity insurance: the birth allowance is paid to a family in which three or more children were born in the same birth, of which three or more remained alive for a period of time determined by law, in order to help the family overcome the economic burden of a multiple birth. The risk pregnancy benefit was instituted in 1991. Free hospitalization for delivery prior to the enactment of the National Health Insurance Law in January 1994 was paid by the

Equality

394. All of the above-mentioned maternity protections and benefits are granted to all citizens and residents of the State of Israel, regardless of race or religion. Only those who have not paid their social insurance dues for a minimum number of months in the two years preceding the child's birth are not entitled to full financial benefits granted by the NII. There are no groups of women who do not enjoy any maternity protection whatsoever or who do so to a significantly lesser degree than the majority. (Additional information is provided in this report under article 9 of the Covenant - Social Security.)

Youth protection

- 395. The Youth Employment Law, 1953, prohibits employment of persons under the age of 15. During summer the minimum age drops to 14, but permission from the Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs is required. Moreover, youngsters over the age of 15 who are still under the purview of the Compulsory Education Law may be employed only in accordance with the Apprentice Law, 1953. (Full texts of these two laws are attached in annex 1 to this report.) A labour contract with a person under minimum age is void, even with the consent of his/her parent or guardian.
- 396. According to official government data, about 30,000 young people aged 15-18 were legally employed in 1995. This figure represents 11 per cent of Israel youth. There are no accurate data describing the distribution of working youth according to sector or type of employment, nor are there data on the extent of employment of youth within the household. Youth on kibbutzim (collective farms) often work there during school vacations, largely in agriculture, service occupations or light industry. The number of youth in this group is small since the total percentage of people of all ages who reside on kibbutzism is less than 3 per cent of the country's population.
- 397. It is believed that there are a few tens of thousands of children employed illegally in Israel. Their employment is illegal either due to the children's age or because they are working longer hours than the maximum permitted by law. Most of these children and youth are employed as physical labourers in outdoor markets and other temporary jobs. In 1994 the Israeli police established a unit for the enforcement of labour laws. This unit has made concerted efforts to enforce child labour laws.
- 398. Lately, the distribution of information on child labour laws to both youth and employers has increased. Printed materials have been prepared and distributed by voluntary organizations such as the National Center for the Child and the Union of Youth Workers, an organization created specifically to represent the rights of workers under the age of 19.
- 399. There are no accurate official data regarding the phenomenon of illegal employment. However, the common perception among government officials is that there has been a slight decrease in illegal child labour in the last two years. It is nonetheless clear that in order to reduce the instance of illegal child and youth labour, better enforcement is needed, as is better awareness of labour laws among children and employers.
- 400. Finally, legal provisions pertaining to special protection of children within the family, such as protection from neglect, child abuse of all sorts, etc., have been described in paragraphs 352-375 and are relevant in the present context also.

Article 11 _ The right to an adequate standard of living

- 401. The right of everyone to enjoy an adequate standard of living is generally considered as obvious and is recognized under the Israeli legal system. This recognition is not embodied in one single legal text. Instead, there exist various legal entitlements and administrative measures aimed at securing everyone's subsistence, which are described in this chapter. All together, these entitlements and measures embody a definite commitment on the part of the State to securing a decent standard of living for everyone.
- 402. Furthermore, one can say that the "right to basic needs", as a coherent right standing on its own, is an emerging concept in the Israeli legal culture. There are a few signs to support this statement that should be briefly surveyed before going into the details of housing and food rights.
- 403. The most evident indication of the emergence of a constitutional right to basic needs is the already mentioned Basic Law: Social Rights Bill (1993). One should also recall the interpretation given to the Basic Law: Human Dignity and Freedom (1992) in one of the Supreme Court President's books, according to which the right to basic needs is part of the constitutional right to human dignity (Barak 1994:416).
- 404. Also important in this context are various remarks made by the Israeli courts. The Supreme Court has dealt with the right to basic living conditions mainly in the context of providing minimal guarantees to those affected by the exercise of legal rights. One example of such a guarantee is the case of alimony and child support payments. The court has ruled that even when such payments can be normally withheld (e.g. for refusal of the recipient to respect the rights of the supporting party), this rule does not apply when the recipient lacks basic living needs:

"We agree that a minor that refuses to follow a court order, and in the case before us, refusal to attend meetings provided for in the divorce agreement, can be regarded as a rebel. However, even a rebellious child does not lose his (or her) entitlement for child support. The exemption the father enjoys is not definitive in all circumstances because it is not permitted to bring even a rebellious son or daughter to the verge of hunger and leave him or her with nothing." C.A. 1741/93 <u>Azoulai v. Azoulai</u>, Takdin-Supreme, vol. 94 (2) 1784.

405. A similar problem has risen in the case of traffic accidents that deprive the victim of living resources before the completion of the legal proceedings. In order to alleviate this problem the legislator amended the Compensation for Traffic Accidents Victims Law 1975 and introduced the possibility of claiming intermediate compensations, on which the Supreme Court remarked:

"The underlying idea of the institution of immediate compensation, and the goal the legislator has set in this legislative innovation, is to provide with great urgency the victim of a traffic accident the sum required to cover his/her expenses, including hospitalization expenses, and his/her and his/her family's living needs, until a final

decision is reached concerning the compensation he/she is entitled to. The general thrust is to deliver those funds to the victim as soon as possible, so to provide him/her and his/her family with these basic needs, which cannot be put on hold until his/her claim is being adjudicated in normal proceedings which may take very long ..."

C.A. 387/82 Karnit - Compensation for Traffic Accident Victims Fund v. Assido, P.D. vol. 40 (4) 213, 219.

406. In another case, the Supreme Court discussed the Judgment Execution Law, 1967, which limits the creditor's right of recovery, in light of the social conditions of the debtor:

"The legislator did not wish that the operation of the execution mechanism would cause the debtor to lose all of his possessions and become a burden on society. This is the basis for several provisions stemming from what are essentially social ideas, which were stipulated in the said law and involve taking into account the circumstances of the debtor.

"For instance, [in] Chapter B which deals with seizure of chattels ... Article 22 determines which chattels may not be seized. The enumeration reveals that these are chattels which are necessary for the nutrition needs of the debtor and his/her family, clothing and furniture vital to them, tools and machines which are the source of the debtor and his/her family's livelihood (with certain limits), etc. This is also the case with seizure of property held by a third party ... [T]he provision of Article 50 (a) to the said law lists what are assets held by a third party that may not be seized ... This section encompasses, among other things, maintal monetary sums held by a third party that constitute part of the indebted party's wage ... which is necessary for his sustenance so he will not suffer poverty and hunger-related disgrace ... The common denominator to all the above-mentioned provisions in the law is the degree of consideration given to the circumstances of the debtor, on the basis of the important and worthy social principle we have described."

C.A. 711/84 Israel Discount Bank Ltd. v. Fishman, P.D. vol. 41 (1) 369, 374-375

407. The Supreme Court addressed on several occasions the question of what are minimal standards of living in the context of imprisonment conditions, and held that:

"In Israel, an imprisoned or arrested person is entitled to be incarcerated under conditions which allow civilized human life. We do not attribute any importance to the fact that this right was not codified in an act of legislation. This right is a fundamental human right and in a law-respecting democratic state it is so obvious as if it was formally written and enacted. We have already had the opportunity to emphasize that if incarceration is intended, as an act of necessity, to deprive a person from his/her physical freedom, it does not purport to deprive from him/her his/her self-image and humanity ...

"What are the conditions that allow civilized human life? A civilized human being has spiritual needs in addition to his physical living needs: He can, for instance, survive and live by eating with his bare hands. However, a civilized human being needs a plate, spoon and fork to eat with. A civilized person is not necessarily full of civility, but he is living in a time and place characterized by that civilization ... [I]t is thus necessary to establish minimal standards to meet the 'conditions that allow civilized human life' in prison. At the same time, the more these standards are added upon and improved, the better it is - whereas he who detracts from them and does not meet them, fails to meet a minimal obligation of civilization ...

"[T]he standards should be determined according to the needs of an ordinary person. As long as we force a prisoner - even one that recently arrived as an uninvited guest or an enemy and harasser - to stay in an Israeli prison, he/she is entitled to living conditions according to the minimal standards of people in Israel, and we must secure or grant them." H.C 221/80 Darwish v. The Prison Service, P.D. vol. 35 (1) 536, 538-40 [minority opinion, rejected on other grounds]

408. The above citations are not representative of a coherent and systematic judicial approach. Examples of disregard of socio-economic factors in judicial reasoning can also be found in Israeli jurisprudence. But these are encouraging signs when evaluated in the context of a growing awareness of social rights as fundamental or constitutional rights.

The current standard of living of Israel's population

Available data on living standard and poverty

- (i) Standard of living
- 409. The following tables present the main available data up to this date on the standard of living in Israel.

														BUDGET OF URBAN HOUSEHOLDS, BY DECLES OF NET OVERALL NOOME
														PER STANDARD PERSON AND STATUS AT WORK OF HOUSEHOLD HEAD
	Sta-		1 1						1	1	ı	1		1992/93
	tus of work			De-										
	of			cile										
	house- hold	1												
	head													
				_	+				1				-	
		Self -			_				1					
	Not	em- ployed	Em- plo-	Up-	9	8	7	6	5	4	3	2	Lo-	
	wor- king	,	yee	per									wer	
		em- ployed												
	wor- king	pioy ec												
Upper limit of deciles (NIS)	King			3		2	2 198.0	1	1	1 385.0	1 182.0	976.0	760.0	
Households in	435.7	145.8	695.1	127.8	60.0 c	127.7	127.7	127.5	5 127.7	7 127.6	127.8	127.7	7 127.5	12
population (thousands)				J	J									
Average persons	2.7	4.1	3.8	2.3	3.1	3.3	3.3	3.5	5 3.4	3.7	3.9	4.2	4.1	
per household	L											<u></u>		
Average standard	2.3	3.2	3	2.1	2.6	2.7	2.8	2.8	8 2.8	3.0	3.0	3.2	3.1	
persons per household				J	J									
Average earners	0.4	1.7	1.6	1.4	1.6	1.6	1.5	1.4	4 1.2	2 1.2	0.9	0.9	0.5	
per household														
NIS per household per														
month at														
average prices of survey period														
Net overall income	3 510	6 615	5 765	9 943	7 901	6 629	5 632	4 941	1 4 143	3 798	3 262	2 2 786	1 881	ŧ
Gross money income	2 948	8 100	6 274	11 737	8 946	7 103	5 844	4 971	1 3 992	3 682	2 972	2 547	1 673	
Net money	2 819	5 618	4 979		6 703	5 589	4 767	4 205	5 3 46	3 219	2 702	2 369	1 615	4
income Money	2 818	5 023	4 738	5 650	5 611	5 243	4 638	4 196	6 3 722	3 658	3 204	2 929	2 299	4
expenditure OVERALL		9 097		13	- 1						l	2 2 964		8
GROSS INCOME -	JOIL	3 031	7 000	166	144	0 140	0 100	3 101	7 - 7 - 07 -	4 262	3 302	230	1 333	
TOTAL														
From work From capital	765 897	1 223	5 679 855	8 967 2 397	7 708 1 428	6 088	4 821	4 074	4 3 070	2 852 546 116	2 038	1 627	7 779	
From pensions	730	108	118	1 176	492	396	398	237	7 239	116	131	1 52	2 (16	
From allowances and assistance	1 248				516	489								
NON- CONSUMPTION	178	2 554	1 349	3 504	2 322	1 558	1 121	798	547	478	291	1 185	61	
EXPENDITURE -				_	_							<u> </u>	<u> </u>	
Compulsory	130	2 482	1 295	3 223	2 243	1 514	1 077	766	6 531	1 463	270	178	56	1
payments Transfers to	48	72	54	281	78	44	44	(32)	(15) 15	(21) (7	-	
other households	3.652	6300			7 170					4 380		3 427	7 2 643	
CONSUMP- TION	3 002	0 300	3 /30	401	, 1/3	0 014	J 148	5 13/	4 300	1 4 300	3 090	342	2013	•
EXPENDITURE TOTAL					+				1	1		-		
Food	590 182	977	831 228	827	908	867	851 236	733 216	3 735 6 213	764	705 196	683		
Vegetables and fruit				- 1	- 1									
Housing Dwelling and	867 355	1 266	1 018 492	1 654 724	1 448 649	1 293 585	1 087	985	5 874 7 405	789	76°	613	3 439	
household maintenance				J										
Furniture and household	185	293	338	426	352	351	333	295	5 258	250	189	203	3 149	
equipment														
Clothing and footwear	172	353		332	377	369		300	0 269	283	274	270	217	
Health Education,	309 318	406	383 810	538	491 930	464 910	398 743	372 909	2 32° 9 620	313 570	273 469	3 247	186	
culture and	316	104	010	030	930	910	143	908	o 020	3/0	400	300	1 ‴	
entertainment Transport and	450	1 047	950	1 488	1 392	1 126	901	785	5 597	7 553	480	364	217	
communication Miscellaneous	227			430	378	367								
goods and	121	557			J. J	ω,	541	"	1	1 ~~]] "	1 ~	
services		<u> </u>							1		L		1	

AVERAGE GROSS MONTHLY MONEY INCOME OF URBAN HOUSEHOLDS, BY SOURCE

Financial data - at uniform prices of each surveyed year

	1995	1994	1993	1990	198
Household head - employee					
Households (thousands)	863.5	796.1	732.6	632.8	599.
Average persons per household	3.9	3.7	3.8		
Average age of household head	40.4	40.9	41.0	41.2	41.
Average earners per household	1.7	1.7	1.7	1.6	1.
Average monthly money income (NIS)					
per household - gross	8 320	7 341		46 027	
- net	6 468	5 862	4 882		92
per standard person - gross	2 720	2 448	1 983		
net	2 115	1 954	1 600	1 073	30
Average net money income					
per standard person					
Per cent real (1) change	-1.7	8.7			
Gini coefficient	0.243	0.252	0.230		
SOURCES OF INCOME - TOTAL (per cents)	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.
Employed work - total	85.8	85.8	85.7	87.7	89.
Income of household head	61.8	61.9	62.7		
Income of household head's spouse	16.7	17.6	16.5	16.0	15.
Income of other earners	7.3	6.3	6.4	5.2	5.
Self-employed work	2.5	2.0	2.4	2.7	1.
Property and assistance	11.3	12.1	12.0	9.6	8.
Thereof assistance and allowances from	7.6	7.3	7.6	6.1	5.
institutions					
Household head not working					
Households (thousands)	372.6	368.2	367.3	338.4	271.
Average persons per household	2.2	2.3	2.4	2.3	2.
Average age of household head	62.4	61.1	60.0	60.2	
Average earners per household	0.1	0.1	0.1	0.1	0.
Average monthly money income (NIS)					
per household - gross	2 690	2 252	1 939		37
- net	2 576	2 207	1 903		
per standard person - gross	1 326	1 065	897	623	
- net	1 270	1 044	881	604	17
Net money income per standard person					
Per cent real (1) change	10.6	5.6	-1.5		
Gini coefficient	296	0.275	0.272		
SOURCES OF INCOME - TOTAL (per cents)	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.
Work	4.4	9.7	8.0	10.0	9.
Property and assistance in Israel -	88.9	83.5	86.5	83.3	80.
Capital and property	3.4	2.2	2.7	2.6	2.
Pensions	29.2	26.0	24.7	24.4	23.
Allowances and assistance from institutions	55.0	53.7	57.2	54.4	52.
Assistance from private persons	1.3	1.6	1.8	1.9	1.
Property and assistance from abroad	6.6	6.9	5.6	6.8	

URBAN HOUSEHOLDS HEADED BY EMPLOYEES, BY DECILES OF GROSS MONTHLY MONEY INCOME PER URBAN HOUSEHOLD AND BY CHARACTERISTICS OF HOUSEHOLD HEAD 1995

	Deciles of income										
	Upper	9	8	7	6	5	4	3	2	Lower	Total
Upper limit (NIS)		15 809	11 820	9 397	7 850	6 655	5 606	4 679	3 810	2 834	
Gross money	22 228	13 367	10 547	8 578	7 237	6 127	5 161	4 234	3 340	2 050	5 320
income per											
household (NIS)											
Net money	14 364	10 076	8 267	7 080	6 136	5 300	4 567	3 829	3 100	1 947	6 468
income per											
household (NIS)											
Average persons	4.2	4.1	4.4	4.1	4.0	4.1	3.9	3.9	3.4	2.6	3.9
per household											
Average standard	3.3	3.2	3.4	3.2	3.2	3.2	3.1	3.1	2.8	2.3	3.1
persons per											
household											
Average age of	45.9	44.0	42.5	40.8	40.8	39.5	38.7	37.6	37.6	36.5	40.4
household head											
TAL (per cents)	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0
Years of											
schooling											
Up to 8	(1.4)	(5.4)	8.9	9.1	10.7	13.4	16.2	17.0	19.2	23.6	12.5
9 - 12	21.5	34.5	45.7	44.6	47.9	49.5	49.9	47.7	50.9	43.2	43.5
13+	77.1	60.1	45.3	46.3	41.4	37.2	34.0	35.3	29.9	33.1	44.0
Age											
Up to 34	12.3	20.0	24.2	33.2	34.8	38.0	40.3	46.0	49.3	56.2	35.4
35 - 54	69.4	61.2	63.0	53.7	50.7	50.6	46.6	43.3	37.8	30.4	50.7
55 - 64	16.3	16.3	11.3	11.5	11.7	9.6	10.9	8.8	9.7	8.4	11.4
65 +	(2.0)	(2.6)	(1.5)	(1.5)	(2.9)	(1.8)	(2.2)	(1.9)	3.2	5.0	2.5
Jews - total	97.5	95.1	93.7	91.7	90.5	88.8	81.1	80.8	80.6	81.2	88.1
Continent of birth											
Asia - Africa	11.7	16.6	19.3	19.8	18.0	16.4	12.6	12.9	17.6	17.4	16.2
Erope -	28.2	28.9	24.4	28.4	29.4	31.2	31.5	27.8	27.0	31.0	28.8
America											
Israel	57.4	49.7	50.0	43.1	42.6	41.0	36.6	39.6	35.1	32.3	42.7
Arabs and others	(2.5)	(4.9)	(6.3)	8.3	9.5	11.2	18.9	19.2	19.4	18.8	11.9

URBAN HOUSEHOLDS HEADED BY EMPLOYEES BY DECILES OF NET MONTHLY MONEY INCOME PER STANDARD PERSON AND BY CHARACTERISTICS OF HOUSEHOLD HEAD \$1995\$

	Deciles of income										
	Upper	9	8	7	6	5	4	3	2	Lower	Total
Upper limit (NIS)		3 887	3 154	2 608	2 246	1 947	1 680	1 441	1 182	912	
Gross money income per household (NIS)	19 279	13 005	10 734	8 773	7 470	6 480	5 706	4 880	4 082	2 769	8 320
Net money income per household (NIS)		9487.0	8242.0	7018.0	6205.0	5527.0	4952.0	4330.0	3690.0	2623.0	6 468.0
Average persons per household	2.8		3.5	3.6	3.7	3.8	4.0	4.3	4.7	5.0	3.9
Average standard persons per household	2.4	2.7	2.9	2.9	3.0	3.1	3.2	3.3	3.5	3.7	3.1
Average age of household head	46.0	44.2	42.0	41.7	40.1	40.6	38.5	37.9	37.5	35.6	40.4
TOTAL (per cents)	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0
Years of schooling											
Up to 8	(1.5)	(3.7)	5.5	9.4	8.8	13.6	11.6	16.4	24.0	30.5	12.5
9 - 12	19.4	33.2	42.7	48.5	46.1	44.5	50.1	49.8	52.6	48.4	43.5
13+	79.1	63.1	51.8	42.1	45.0	42.0	38.3	33.8	23.4	21.2	44.0

Age	i				ì						
Up to	24.1	26.5	27.9	31.1	36.8	33.5	38.3	41.8	43.1	51.2	35.4
34											
35 - 54	47.4	52.0	56.0	53.0	50.0	53.8		49.0	48.9	43.6	
55 - 64	23.0	17.1	13.5	13.0	11.9	10.4	7.2	7.4	6.4	4.5	
65 +	5.5	4.4	(2.6)	(2.9)	(1.3)	(2.3)	(1.6)	(1.8)	(1.5)		2.5
Jews - total	98.4	98.7	97.3	95.0	92.6	92.8	86.4	82.1	73.5	64.2	88.1
Continent of birth											
Asia - Africa	9.8	13.8	15.1	20.2	15.6	20.2	14.4	14.6	19.2	19.2	16.2
Europe - America	31.4	33.9	26.8	28.3	28.5	35.5		31.3		17.1	28.8
Israel	57.0	51.1	54.9	46.5	48.3	36.6	39.0	36.0	30.1	27.6	42.7
Arabs and others			(2.7)	(5.0)	(7.3)	(7.2)	13.6	17.9	26.5	35.8	11.9

HOUSEHOLDS, BY HOUSING DENSITY, RELIGION, CONTINENT OF BIRTH, PERIOD OF IMMIGRATION, AND TYPE OF LOCALITY OF RESIDENCE OF HOUSEHOLD HEAD

1996

	Ave- rage	Per- sons per room								Total	
JEWS	den- sity	3.00 +	2.50- 2.99	2.01 - 2.49 0.8	2.00	1.50 - 1.99 9.4	1.01 - 1.49 16.9	1.00	-1.00	%	1 340.0
Continent of birth and period of	0.97	0.6	0.8	0.0	3.9	9.4	10.9	22.2	45.3	100.0	1 340.0
immigration Israel	1.03	1.1	1.1	0.8	4.6	10.6	19.7	23.7	38.4	100.0	564.8
Father born: Israel	0.99	(1.7)	(1.5)	(0.6)	3.9	7.5	14.8	26.3	43.8	100.0	104.2
Asia - Africa	1.15	1.3	1.4	1.1	6.8	15.5	24.0	23.2	26.8	100.0	261.0
Europe - America	0.91	(0.7)	(0.5)	(0.7)	2.0	5.5	16.5	23.1	50.9	100.0	197.2
Asia - Africa	0.99	0.9	(0.6)	1.3	4.3	11.0	17.3	18.2	46.5	100.0	281.4
Up to 1960 1961 - 1964	0.93	(0.7)	(0.2)	(1.0)	3.2 6.0	8.8 15.3	15.4 23.1	18.0	52.6 33.2	100.0	179.0 41.4
1965 +	1.11	(1.5)	(0.9)	(2.3)	6.1	14.3	19.1	18.6	37.2	100.0	57.7
Thereof: Asia	0.94	(0.4)	(0.3)	(0.9)	4.0	9.3	16.0	17.8	51.2	100.0	130.3
Up to 1960	0.91	(0.5)	0.4	(0.9)	3.5	8.3	14.5	17.8	54.2	100.0	99.2
1961 - 1964 1965 +	1.08	(0.1)	H	(1.0)	(7.8)	(15.0) 11.6	(24.4)	(13.5)	38.1 42.0	100.0	6.7 22.9
Europe - America	0.88	(0.3)	0.6	(0.4)	3.0	6.9	13.3	22.7	52.8	100.0	486.0
Up to 1960	0.65	(0.1)	(0.3)	(0.1)	(0.5)	2.5	4.7	13.5	78.4	100.0	159.6
1961 - 1964 1965 - 1974	0.83	(0.2)	(0.4)	(0.3)	(0.9)	(4.5)	11.8 15.4	20.3	61.8 55.9	100.0	23.8 56.9
1975 - 1979	0.07	(0.2)	(1.0)	(1.1)	(2.3)	(7.5)	14.6	23.2	50.0	100.0	25.8
1980 - 1989	0.93	(0.8)	(0.8)	(0.9)	(2.4)	7.2	16.9	19.2	51.9	100.0	28.9
1990 - 1991 1992 +	1.07	(0.3)	(0.7)	(0.6)	4.4 7.1	10.5 12.4	21.4 17.3	33.6	28.5	100.0	100.3 87.2
Type of locality of residence (size of		(4.7)	(,	(3.0)							
locality)											
Urban localities	0.97	0.8	0.8	0.7	4.0	9.3	16.8	22.3	45.3	100.0	1 254.7
Jerusalem Tel Aviv -	1.06	(0.4)	(0.7)	(1.3)	5.3 4.2	11.3	16.2 10.7	19.4 22.5	42.2 54.4	100.0	119.1 139.7
Yafo		, ,									
Haifa 100 000 -	0.84	(0.4)	(0.5)	(0.2)	(1.9)	5.6 10.2	11.1 18.6	22.8	57.6 42.7	100.0	82.6 368.9
199 999	0.97	(0.3)	(0.5)	(0.7)	3.0	9.6	19.5	21.2	44.4	100.0	141.9
99 999	0.96	(0.5)	(0.4)	(0.7)	3.6	8.7	16.8	24.9	44.7	100.0	255.8
49 999 10 000 -	1.00	(0.5)	(0.5)	(0.7)	4.7	11.6	18.7	23.1	40.3	100.0	85.8
19 999 2 000 -	0.99	(0.6)	(1.0)	(0.7)	4.7	10.1	19.2	22.0	41.8	100.0	60.9
9 999 Thereof:											
Deve- lopment											
localities	1.03	(0.5)	(0.6)	(0.8)	4.4	11.4	18.8	24.5	39.1	100.0	157.6
North South	1.00	(0.5)	(0.6)	(0.5)	3.9 5.1	10.1 12.9	17.9 19.7	25.1 23.8	41.4 36.4	100.0	83.3 74.4
Rural	0.98	(0.6)	(1.1)	(0.8)	3.3	9.7	18.4	20.6	45.5	100.0	85.3
Moshavim	0.93	(0.3)	(1.0)	(0.5)	(2.8)	8.1	17.2	20.9	49.1	100.0	44.1
Villages	1.02	(1.0)	(1.1)	(1.2)	(3.8)	11.3	19.7	20.3	41.6	100.0	41.2
ARAB and OTHERS	1.52	9.1	7.1	6.3	14.0	19.7	16.2	14.2	13.4	100.0	200.8
Moslems Christians	1.74	(2.9)	(4.0)	(2.2)	15.6 10.4	21.3 19.2	15.1 18.3	10.3	10.3	100.0	141.6 37.2
Druze &	1.27	(5.7)	(5.5)	(0.7)	9.9	19.2	18.3	24.7	16.9	100.0	22.1
others Type of locality of residence (size of locality)				, ,						100.0	
Urban localities	1.62	9.2	7.1	6.1	14.0	19.4	16.0	14.4	13.8	100.0	189.6
Jerusalem	2.13	27.5	14.3	6.7	14.3	11.3	(5.7)	12.2	8.1	100.0	30.5
10 000 +	1.45	4.8 6.7	4.3 7.5	4.5	12.1	21.9	17.9	17.7	16.8	100.0	84.9 74.2
2 000 - 9 999 Rural	1.68	(8.6)	(7.0)	(8.2)	16.0	25.2	18.1	(10.0)	(7.7)	100.0	11.3
Rural localities	1.68	(8.6)	(7.0)	(8.2)	14.1	25.2	19.3	(10.0)	(7.7)	100.0	11.3

HOUSEHOLDS, BY POPULATION GROUP, HOUSING DENSITY AND CONTINENT OF BIRTH OF HOUSEHOLD HEAD, AND CHILDREN IN HOUSEHOLD

1996

Population group persons per room and continent of birth	Average children per house- hold		Chil- dren in household					Thereof: house- holds with children aged up to 17 - total		All house- holds
	Households with children aged up to 17	household	6+	4-5	3	2	1			
			Per cents						Thousands	
JEWS - GRAND TOTAL (1)	2.21	1.08	2.6	10.1	19.6	33.4	34.3	100.0	658.0	1 339.7
Up to 0.99	1.54	0.30		(0.9)	10.0	30.8	58.3	100.0	119.5	606.6
1.00 - 1.99	2.16	1.55	0.9	9.5	22.4	35.8	31.6	100.0	464.1	647.7
2.00 - 2.99	3.37	2.94	13.7	28.5	18.2	25.7	13.9	100.0	64.6	74.1

1 1			ı	ı			ı	i	l I	
3.00 +	5.17	4.87	42.7	28.7	(11.6)	(8.5)	(8.4)	100.0	9.6	10.2
Israel - total	2.35	1.47	3.0	11.1	23.1	35.1	27.7	100.0	352.6	564.7
Up to 0.99	1.62	0.52		(1.1)	11.8	35.3	51.7	100.0	69.3	216.8
1.00 - 1.99	2.31	1.85	1.0	10.4	27.2	37.2	24.1	100.0	244.0	304.3
2.00 - 2.99	3.63	3.26	15.0	34.3	18.4	24.5	7.8	100.0	33.1	36.8
3.00 +	5.62	5.39	49.7	(28.1)	(12.5)	(5.7)	(3.9)	100.0	6.1	6.4
Asia - Africa - total	2.32	1.03	3.2	12.8	21.2	29.8	33.0	100.0	125.2	281.4
Up to 0.99	1.50	0.20		(0.5)	(10.3)	28.2	61.0	100.0	17.7	130.7
1.00 - 1.99	2.25	1.54	(1.3)	12.2	23.7	31.7	31.2	100.0	89.7	130.7
2.00 - 2.99	3.39	3.04	14.5	28.0	22.0	21.8	13.8	100.0	15.5	17.3
3.00 +	4.36	3.94	(26.8)	(31.4)	(5.4)	(21.1)	(15.4)	100.0	2.2	2.5
Europe - America - total	1.84	0.67	1.4	6.1	11.5	32.5	48.5	100.0	176.4	485.8
Up to 0.99	1.37	0.17		(0.8)	(5.9)	22.7	70.7	100.0	32.2	256.0
1.00 - 1.99	1.82	1.11	(0.4)	6.0	12.5	35.3	45.8	100.0	127.4	208.4
2.00 - 2.99	2.81	2.23	(10.2)	16.4	13.7	32.6	27.1	100.0	15.5	19.6
3.00 +	(4.31)	(4.02)							(1.2)	(1.3)
ARABS AND OTHERS - GRAND TOTAL	3.06	2.25	8.8	26.9	19.8	25.3	19.3	100.0	148.2	201.2
Up to 0.99	1.45	0.40		(3.3)	(5.1)	(23.6)	67.9	100.0	7.4	26.9
1.00 - 1.99	2.45	1.82	(1.0)	16.9	25.9	32.5	23.7	100.0	74.8	100.8
2.00 - 2.99	3.64	3.20	12.8	42.4	15.5	19.5	10.0	100.0	48.3	54.9
3.00 - 3.99	4.80	4.53	34.4	39.6	(10.9)	(9.3)	(5.7)	100.0	12.4	13.2
4.00 +	4.47	4.45	(32.8)	(29.9)	(13.7)	(19.1)	(4.4)	100.0	5.3	5.3

Incl. Continent of birth not known.

HOUSEHOLDS, BY HOUSING DENSITY, SIZE OF HOUSEHOLD AND POPULATION GROUP

1996

Persons										
per room	Persons in household									
	Average per house- hold	7+	6	5	4	3	2	1	Total %	000
JEWS - TOTAL	3.32	4.3	6.8	14.6	18.4	15.5	22.9	17.5	100.0	1 340.
Up to 0.49	1.16				(0.2)	(1.1)	13.1	85.5	100.0	145.7
0.5	1.51				(0.4)	3.5	42.5	53.6	100.0	114.9
0.51 - 0.99	2.70	(0.1)	1.1	5.9	14.8	23.0	49.3	5.8	100.0	346.2
1.00	3.25	(0.4)	2.5	13.5	25.9	30.1	18.5	9.1	100.0	296.
1.01 - 1.49	4.59	5.1	8.7	35.9	42.3	5.1	3.0		100.0	225.9
1.50 - 1.99	5.27	13.8	29.0	35.6	7.3	14.4			100.0	125.2
2.00	5.14	15.0	37.8	9.0	21.1	5.4	10.3	(1.4)	100.0	52.5
2.01 - 2.49	7.58	81.7	(18.4)						100.0	10.6
2.50 - 2.99	6.88	48.7		37.3	(14.0)				100.0	11.0
3.00 +	7.87	59.8	20.6	(6.9)	(1.7)	(10.1)	(0.8)		100.0	10.2
ARABS AND OTHERS - TOTAL	5.06	24.3	15.7	16.8	16.6	11.2	10.0	5.4	100.0	200.8
Up to 0.99	2.21	(0.2)	(1.4)	(2.1)	(6.9)	21.1	41.3	27.0	100.0	26.9
1.00	3.00		(0.8)	7.2	28.2	30.3	22.4	11.2	100.0	28.5
1.01 - 1.49	4.56	7.8	(6.2)	31.2	45.2	(5.8)	(3.8)		100.0	32.5
1.50 - 1.99	5.39	16.8	29.4	33.6	6.0	14.3			100.0	39.6
2.00	5.62	20.5	45.1	8.4	18.9	(1.0)	(4.6)	(1.6)	100.0	28.
2.01 - 2.49	7.39	91.2	(8.8)	_	_	_	_	_	100.0	12.5
2.50 - 2.99	7.36	65.5	_	32.3	(2.3)	_	_	_	100.0	14.3
3.00 + Average no. of	8.39	71.2	18.9	(3.8)	(4.5)	(1.6)			100.0	18.4
persons per room Jews		1.87	1.44	1.22	1.06	0.89	0.65	0.41		0.9
Arabs and others		2.41	1.77	1.55	1.28	1.02	0.76	0.53		1.6

HOUSEHOLDS, BY POPULATION GROUP, SIZE OF HOUSEHOLD AND ROOMS IN DWELLING

1996

Rooms in dwelling	Persons in house- hold							Total
	7+	6	5	4	3	2	1	
IEWS TOTAL - thousands	58.2	91	195.9	246.5	208.2	306.3	233.9	1 340.0

_			_	_	_			
- per cents	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0
1	-		(0.1)	(0.1)	(0.5)	1.8	11.8	2.6
1.5	(0.2)	(0.4)	(0.3)	(0.6)	1.4	2.2	8.6	2.4
2	(2.5)	(1.8)	2.1	4.5	8.7	18.0	26.4	11.4
2.5	2.1	(2.1)	2.4	3.7	5.5	9.5	10.6	6.1
3	17.1	21.8	22.8	32.4	43.0	41.2	31.2	33.1
3.5	5.6	5.1	7.1	6.4	6.6	5.1	2.5	5.4
4	35.3	34.7	31.5	31.2	23.0	16.0	7.3	22.7
4.5+	37.2	33.9	33.8	21.2	11.3	6.3	1.6	16.2
Average rooms per person	0.53	0.70	0.82	0.94	1.13	1.53	2.45	1.03
ARABS AND OTHERS								
TOTAL - thousands	48.9	31.5	33.7	33.4	22.4	20.0	10.9	200.8
- per cents	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0
1	(1.1)	(0.4)	(1.8)	(2.5)	(1.3)	(6.4)	33.2	3.6
2	7.8	10.6	14.0	16.9	26.5	38.0	39.3	17.6
3	45.3	43.8	46.4	47.0	46.9	39.5	23.4	43.9
3.5+	45.8	45.2	37.9	33.7	25.3	16.1	(4.0)	34.8
Average rooms per person	0.42	0.57	0.65	0.78	0.98	1.31	1.88	0.62